
Theses and Dissertations

2021

**An analysis of internalized racism in art created by Black artists;
implications for psychological intervention**

Mirjam Hatton

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.pepperdine.edu/etd>



Part of the [Psychology Commons](#)

Pepperdine University
Graduate School of Education and Psychology

AN ANALYSIS OF INTERNALIZED RACISM IN ART CREATED BY BLACK ARTISTS;
IMPLICATIONS FOR PSYCHOLOGICAL INTERVENTION

A dissertation submitted in partial satisfaction
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Psychology

by
Mirjam Hatton

April, 2021

Shelly P. Harrell, Ph.D. – Dissertation Chairperson

This clinical dissertation, written by

Mirjam Hatton

under the guidance of a Faculty Committee and approved by its members, has been submitted to and accepted by the Graduate Faculty in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PSYCHOLOGY

Doctoral Committee:

Shelly P. Harrell, Ph.D., Chairperson

Thema Bryant-Davis, Ph.D.

Jennifer Brown, Psy.D.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES	vi
LIST OF FIGURES	vii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	viii
VITA	ix
ABSTRACT	xi
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Definition of Key Terms	5
Specific Aims and Objectives	6
Chapter 2: Literature Review	8
Internalized Racism	12
Definition and Conceptualization of Internalized Racism	12
Research on Predictors, Correlates, and Effects	17
Expressions of Internalized Racism	23
Visual Art and the African Diaspora	24
Evaluation of Art Made by Black Artists	29
Themes in African American Art	33
Depiction of Racism and Stereotypes	34
Racial Power Differentials and Dynamics	36
Liberation, Freedom, Survival	36
Internalized Racism in the Art Literature	37
Strategies for Healing from Internalized Racism	38
Art Interventions with Black People	46
Synthesis and Critique of the Literature	50
Chapter 3: Methods	53
Dates of Publications and Databases	54
Types of Documents and Keywords	54
Inclusion Criteria for Artists	55
Selection of Artworks for Analysis	65
Author Reflexivity Statement	69
Chapter 4: Results	73

Results of Artwork Selection Process.....	73
Rater Congruence on Emotion.....	83
Rater Congruence on Internalized Racism Themes.....	84
Description and Analysis of Individual Artworks created by Black Artists.....	88
Approach to Critical Analysis.....	88
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 1).....	90
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 1).....	92
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 1).....	93
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 1).....	97
Result Summary of Figure 1.....	98
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 2).....	100
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 2).....	101
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 2).....	101
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 2).....	103
Result Summary of Figure 2.....	104
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 3).....	105
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 3).....	106
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 3).....	107
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 3).....	111
Result Summary of Figure 3.....	113
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 4).....	114
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 4).....	116
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 4).....	117
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 4).....	121
Result Summary of Figure 4.....	123
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 5).....	124
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 5).....	126
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 5).....	126
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 5).....	130
Result Summary of Figure 5.....	131
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 6).....	132
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 6).....	134
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 6).....	134
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 6).....	139
Result Summary of Figure 6.....	141
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 7).....	142
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 7).....	143
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 7).....	144
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 7).....	148
Result Summary of Figure 7.....	149
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 8).....	150
Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 8).....	152
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 8).....	152
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 8).....	157
Result Summary of Figure 8.....	158
Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 9).....	160

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 9).....	161
Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 9)	161
Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 9)	165
Result Summary of Figure 9	167
Summary of Results	167
Chapter 5: Discussion	172
Theoretical Implications and Emerging Hypotheses	172
Structural Oppression.....	173
The Black Figure in Art	176
Implications for Psychological Interventions Utilizing Art of Black Artists	178
Liberation Psychology	178
Expressive Arts	180
Counseling Black People	182
Racial Identity	182
Other Forms of Treatment for Black People.....	184
Recommendations for Integrating Art Created by Black Artists into Treatment with Black People	185
Recommendations for Future Research	188
Limitations and Contributions	189
REFERENCES	192
APPENDIX A: Tables	214
APPENDIX B: Figures.....	246
APPENDIX C: IRB Documentation.....	256

LIST OF TABLES

	Page
Table 1: Black Artists who Meet Inclusion Criteria	56
Table 2: Master List of Identified Themes Related to IR and Applied to Selected Artworks of 6 Selected Black Artists	66
Table 3: Artworks Rated but not Selected for the Study	230
Table 4: Overview of Selected Artworks.....	73
Table 5: 4-Stage Approach to Critical Analysis of Artworks	89
Table 6: Summary of Final Themes in Analysis of Artworks	169

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: From the Bush to the Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!.....	90
Figure 2: Supermodel.....	99
Figure 3: Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps.....	105
Figure 4: Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis.....	113
Figure 5: Ivy and the Janitor in January.....	124
Figure 6: A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self.....	132
Figure 7: Randaleeza.....	142
Figure 8: Camptown Ladies (detail)	150
Figure 9: Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original	159

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This dissertation was supported by several people who have offered encouragement, knowledge, life experience, and wisdom throughout the entire four-year process. I would like to thank the committee for making themselves available and providing their guidance all along the way. I feel particularly grateful towards Dr. Shelly Harrell, who has generously shared her wealth of knowledge in the field of multiculturalism, which has undoubtedly enriched my view of the world around me and my ability to conduct research. I would like to thank Dr. Thema Bryant-Davis and Dr. Jennifer Brown for offering their rich contributions to my dissertation. I am grateful to my husband, Carlson Hatton, who grounded me throughout the many months and years; his love and support found their way into these pages. Additionally, I would like to thank my parents-in-law and my sister Simon Dye for their unwavering support throughout this process. I am grateful to my parents, who instilled a sense of racial pride in me and taught me that courage is needed when standing up against racism. My parents' lived experiences with oppression manifested into values of connectedness, shared humanity, and a strong drive for survival, which inspired me to conduct this research. I want to thank my father for bringing jazz music into our lives. This dissertation was accompanied by the soundtrack of Miles Davis, Dizzy Gillespie, and many other Black musicians that I listened to from young onward. Finally, I would like to thank the many artists and art professors who have introduced me to a plethora of art that reaches far beyond traditional Western history and opened my eyes to how art can communicate unspeakable societal issues in ways that other media cannot.

VITA

MIRJAM HATTONI. EDUCATION**Doctor of Clinical Psychology** *in progress*

Pepperdine University, Graduate School of Education and Psychology *anticipated graduation*
Summer 2021

Los Angeles, CA

Dissertation: *An Analysis of Internalized Racism in Art created by Black Artists: Implications for Psychological Interventions*

Chair: Shelly Harrell, Ph.D.

Preliminary Oral Examination completed: December 2018

Dissertation Defense Passed: December 16, 2020

Master of Arts in Clinical Psychology with an emphasis in Marriage and Family Therapy

Pepperdine University, Graduate School of Education and Psychology 2014
 Los Angeles, CA

Laureate of Fine Arts

Jan van Eyck Academie, Graduate School of Art, Theory, and Design 2001
 Maastricht, the Netherlands

Bachelor of Fine Arts

Gerrit Rietveld Academie, University of Applied Sciences for Fine Art 1998
 Amsterdam, the Netherlands

II. CLINICAL EXPERIENCE DOCTORAL LEVEL**Psychology Intern**

2020-2021

West Los Angeles Healthcare Center, U.S. Department of Veteran Affairs & VA Greater Los Angeles Healthcare
 Los Angeles CA

- Rotation: Geropsychology/Community Living Center (CLC)
- Rotation: The Domiciliary Residential Rehabilitation and Treatment Program
- Rotation: Substance Use Disorder Outpatient Programs
- Rotation: Trauma Recovery Services / The Women's Health Clinic

Pre-Intern

2019-2020

West Los Angeles Healthcare Center, U.S. Department of Veteran Affairs & VA Greater Los Angeles Healthcare
 Los Angeles CA

- Rotation (1 year): Cognitive Behavioral Therapy for Psychosis

Doctoral Psychology Extern 2017-2020
Union Rescue Mission, Los Angeles, CA

Doctoral Neuropsychology Extern – Psychiatry Department 2018-2019
Kaiser Permanente, Los Angeles, CA

III. CLINICAL EXPERIENCE MASTER LEVEL

Clinical Therapist 2017
Enki Health & Research Systems, Inc

Intake Therapist 2016-2017
Didi Hirsch, Inglewood, CA

Clinical Therapist 2015-2016
Serenity Recovery Center, Encino, CA

Functional Family Therapist 2014-2015
Shields for Families, Long Beach, CA

Marriage and Family Therapy Trainee 2014
Southern California Hospital IOP, Culver City, CA

ABSTRACT

There is ample research on the effects of racism on Black people; however, less focus has been placed on struggles due to the psychological injury caused by internalized racism (IR). Strategies to alleviate symptoms related to IR are examined through the lens of art and the literature associated with IR. This dissertation explores (a) how IR is related to emotions and psychological processes, (b) how IR is expressed in art created by Black artists, and (c) implications for integration of art into psychological interventions targeting IR. Six artists were identified for the dissertation and nine works of art were selected. Each artist was represented with either one or two works of art. The analysis of the artwork included a 4-stage approach applied to each of the nine paintings: (a) general characteristics, description of the work and racially themed content; (b) themes that strongly reflect vital issues found in the literature of IR depicted in the work; (c) integrative analysis, and (d) implications for healing and interventions. Key findings included the observation that feelings of shame and anxiety/fear were found in six out of the nine artworks, suggesting the prominence of these emotional experiences concerning IR. Potentially healing themes for Black people with IR were identified and included increased self-esteem, resistance against oppressive systems, self-agency, access to an authentic voice, and racial pride. All artworks were found to have the potential to bring increased awareness to the experience of IR by addressing themes related to racism, colorism, exploitation, and dehumanization.

Chapter 1: Introduction

Research indicates that approximately 2.7 million Black Americans are at risk for adverse outcomes related to racism-related stressors (American Psychological Association [APA], 2016). However, this number does not take internalized racism (IR) into account and may, therefore, be an underestimate. This is further corroborated by a study examining the effects of discrimination over the past ten years, including 243 peer-reviewed articles focusing on racism related stress. Only six of these studies explicitly measured internalized racial oppression (Banks & Stephens, 2018). While racism-related stress makes up the bulk of studies regarding inequality, the internalization of racial oppression and its detrimental effects on marginalized populations has been ignored, which may be due to collective ignorance and reflects a taboo on the subject (Pyke, 2010). We live in a racialized society in which introjected and harmful values of a dominating culture on an oppressed group, such as IR, have long-lasting adverse effects on marginalized individuals (Bartky, 1990; Graham et al., 2016; Jones, 2000; Lipsky, 1977; Molina & James, 2016; Parmer et al., 2004; Speight, 2007). In this context, IR has played an integral part in Black people's lives, with literature suggesting that it can lead to feeling flawed and not fully human. Furthermore, research indicates that racially-based stress for African Americans is associated with mental health disparities like depression and physical illnesses (Graham et al., 2016; Molina & James, 2016; Utsey et al., 2002). The continuous cycle of domination best illustrates the mechanism by which these beliefs come to life, such as observed in White dominant groups asserting power over subordinate groups, which allows for a continuation of oppression through imposing a set of living conditions onto the non-dominant group (Hanna, Talley & Guindon, 2000). IR has been recognized as a mediator between racist experiences and mental health symptoms (Graham et al., 2016). The literature mentions that the internalization of

IR causes significant psychological injuries, but IR has been overlooked in previous studies that mainly focused on racism (Speight, 2007). Banks and Stephens (2018) comment on the fact that IR has not been fully recognized in the research literature and is an area that is understudied and not well defined. However, there is ample research on the negative psychological impact of racism on mental health (Bryant-Davis, 2017; Carter 2007; Freire, 2000; Hall et al., 2016; Harrell, 2000; Hatzenbuchler, 2016; Plaut, 2010; Young, 1990) and how economic exploitation, marginalization, powerlessness, and systemic violence perpetuate the power of the dominant group over the subordinate one (Speight, 2007). Eurocentric views have created a socially enforced notion of inferiority amongst African Americans (Parmer et al., 2004) for decades leading to multigenerational transmission of IR. As this phenomenon often remains hidden within African American families (Parmer et al., 2004), it is essential to note that this notion of secrecy is directly in line with the fact that IR is largely invisible and it does not have to involve one particular perpetrator or victim (Speight, 2007). Rather, marginalized groups do not have to be discriminated against in a blatant way for it to have a traumatic effect; it can be expressed in covert ways (Prillettensky & Gonick, 1996). Furthermore, racism is part of our social reality, including institutionalized racism (C.P. Jones, 2000), which operates through the normal process of everyday life (Young, 1990).

IR has found its way into the visual arts for many years. However, little attention has been placed on how art touches upon these themes of IR and what this may mean to the Black viewer regarding healing from IR. This dissertation aims to explore these visual expressions and analyze expressive arts made by Black artists that include themes of IR. Although some studies have surfaced involving IR, little has been researched regarding treatment for those individuals who struggle with mental health symptoms related to IR (Banks & Stephens, 2018; James,

2017). Additionally, attention has been given to expressive arts within mental health treatment. It has long been known that clients who engage in art therapy can experience alleviation of symptoms regarding their mental health disorder. Art therapy has been found to help develop self-awareness, decrease anxiety, help with addictive behaviors, and increase self-esteem (American Art Therapy Association, 2016). These effects of art therapy could be helpful to Black people, as studies have demonstrated that IR is closely linked to anxiety, depression, and other mental health disorders (Bartky, 1990; Graham et al., 2016; C.P. Jones, 2000; Lipsky, 1977; Molina & James, 2016; Parmer et al., 2004; Speight, 2007). Part of an artist's mission is to express themselves authentically, without coercing their point of view onto the viewer (Faber & Mendelowitz, 2012), which is essential when considering Black artists' effects on Black people who struggle with IR. The representational and immediacy of art can have an immense impact on the viewer as it utilizes the power of recognition and identification (Mosaka, 2015; Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). Moreover, art created by Black artists can be powerful and empowering in its capacity to heal and unite while touching upon historic events and current issues regarding racial inequities (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). Black art is interwoven with concepts of empowerment and speaks directly to the needs and aspirations of Black America (Neal, 1968). It can have educational value and steer communities into action, as Black artists frequently are in tune with the emotional pulse of the community they are trying to visually represent (National League of Cities, 2020). Thus, experiencing this type of art can provide hope, bring people together, and offer a path forward. Art created by Black artists can take on an activist stance, which is often an important component of healing from injustice and inequities. Artworks that deal with these issues can serve as a mirror to society as it

unapologetically reflects the racialized and oppressive reality we live in and forces the viewer to reflect on their experience and create opportunities for healing (National League of Cities, 2020).

Visualization is a tool that is frequently used in therapeutic interventions.

(American Art Therapy Association, 2016). Zabunyan (2005) states that offering marginalized individuals images directly related to their lived experience can provide them with a freedom that exceeds their direct personal experiences and may tap into a transgenerational memory.

Moreover, by utilizing representation and recognizable objects, Black artists appropriate their history's fundamental components, including African heritage, oral narratives, and autobiographical accounts (Zabunyan, 2005). Wadeson (2010) argues that an image's phenomenon plays a central role in dreams, fantasies, and experiences and that that image may be more succinct than our words. This is particularly important as people who have had dehumanizing experiences often struggle with trauma symptoms, including dreams and fantasies of a world that includes equality. The flexibility and plasticity inherent to visuals supersede language and cognitions. This research is interested in understanding how this sense of flexibility can have potential healing proponents for Black people with IR. Traumatic memories are often stored in images rather than words (Herman, 1997), and Wadeson (2010) explored ways in which visuals play a role in human development while taking multicultural issues into account. While cultural components have played a role in her research, it appears that no studies have specifically looked at the expression of IR in artworks and the impact this may have on those who live with it. The viewing of art is more than just looking at; it takes active participation, engagement, and thoughtful reflection when contemplating about the art one is confronted with, which may include reflecting on critical social issues (Spraggins-Rochford, 2017). This contemplation should preferably not be limited to the artwork itself, but rather be extended to

thoughts about self, the world, and difficult life experiences (Linesch, 2004; Peacock, 2012; Silverman, 2010). This dissertation will specifically examine emotionally evocative artworks made by Black artists that incorporate IR themes and which have the potential to encourage reflection on one's own life experiences.

Definition of Key Terms

The following definitions provide the foundation for how each of these terms is used and understood in this dissertation.

Oppression. Based on the work of Isaac Prilleltensky (2003), oppression is defined here as a state of domination where the oppressed suffer the consequences of deprivation, exclusion, discrimination, exploitation, control of culture, and sometimes even violence (p. 126).

Racism. James Jones (1997) defines racism on three different levels: individual, institutional, and cultural. He states that individual racism entails beliefs of superiority of one race over another, which results in antipathy towards a racial group, while institutionalized racism operates on a systemic level creating inequalities that can be both individual and intentional or a standard of practice and unintentional. He defines cultural racism as a dominant racial group's imposition of their cultural values over the subordinate racial group with the intent to achieve superior access.

Internalized Racism (IR). The definition offered by Bailey et al. (2011) will be adopted for this dissertation, as it is specific to Black people. They define internalized racism as "The process by which Black people internalize and accept the dominant White culture's oppressive actions and beliefs toward Black people (e.g., negative stereotypes, discrimination, hatred, falsification of historical facts, racist doctrines, White supremacist ideology), while at the same time rejecting the African worldview and cultural motifs" (Bailey et al., 2011, p. 481).

Black artists. Black artists will be defined as individuals with Black African ancestry who were scattered throughout the African Diaspora as a function of human trafficking in the slave trade or through immigration. In this dissertation, only Black artists of American nationality were selected.

Visual Art. For the purpose of this dissertation, visual art is defined as a visual object or experience consciously created through an expression of skill or imagination (Encyclopedia Britannica, 2020).

Specific Aims and Objectives

The aim of this dissertation was to explore and elucidate the relationship between IR and visual art created by Black artists and its implications for psychological interventions. The dissertation involves a comprehensive review of the literature associated with the concept of IR and an analysis of the artwork and related literature of Black artists whose works are selected based upon themes identified in the literature review. The integrative and critical analysis will inform the development of hypotheses related to the use of visual art for processing IR and contribute to identifying implications for treatment. The general purpose of the dissertation, supplemented by representative artwork, is to offer a deeper understanding of IR and how selected visual art produced by Black artists can express themes of IR and potentially have an emotionally healing impact on Black people.

The following research objectives are offered to guide the dissertation research:

1. To conduct a comprehensive review of the literature on internalized racism (IR) and identify the central themes related to IR that emerge from the psychological, cultural studies, and art literature.

2. To identify a selection of key Black artists whose body of work reflects the IR themes identified in the literature.
3. To examine the work of each selected Black artists through the lens of the IR literature to inform the selection of specific 2-dimensional pieces of art that particularly reflect themes related to IR.
4. To analyze each selected piece of art with regards to its ability to reflect selected themes of IR and how it could contribute to healing or therapeutic purposes.
5. To generate a set of hypotheses regarding the relationship between IR, visual art by Black artists, and strategies for healing from IR.
6. To offer implications for developing and implementing psychological interventions using the art of Black artists.

Chapter 2: Literature Review

To grasp the complexity of internalized racism, it is crucial to have an understanding of racism and how it is embedded in society. The manifestation of racism is widespread and, at times, invisible as it is expressed at multiple levels. The work of James M. Jones (2019) demonstrates the multilayered way in which racism manifests itself (e.g., individuals, institutions, and culture). This multidimensional and multifaceted aspect of oppression can be seen in many social life institutions (Delgado & Stefanic, 2001; King, 2000; Saloojee, 2003). Racism goes beyond the individual and reaches into economic, political, and cultural structures that lead to injustices such as an unequal distribution of power, privilege, and resources, placing the dominant group at the top of the order and the subordinated racial group at the bottom (Derman-Sparks & Phillips, 1997). When taking these complex systems into account, racism can be viewed as a form of oppression that provides the context for social exclusion and domination (Dominelli, 1997).

These thoughts are further reflected within research on critical race theory (CRT), which indicates that race is a socially constructed system that affects micro and macro systems alike and segregates and categorizes individuals based upon their race (Brown, 2003). More precisely, critical race theory holds that race is a fundamental element of social organization. Individuals who are part of these societal institutions may be actively contributing to the perpetuation of racial inequality (Bonilla-Silva, 2009; Brown, 2003). Frye (2000; Delgado & Stefanic, 2000) defined oppression as a system that shapes individuals by restricting, restraining, or immobilizing those who are not in power. Prilleltensky (2003) thinks of oppression as a denial of one's rights, feelings of insecurity, and exploitation that characterize the collective experience of oppression and that one group asserts their domination and control over the other intending to

gain political, economic, and social-psychological advantage (Prilleltensky, 2008). This is directly in line with critical race theory, as race is analyzed on societal levels and how these large systems consent to these social orders, which explains the omnipresent nature of racism in America. The theory also underlines how racism's universal presence supports the festering and growth of these socially constructed ideologies and how deleterious these beliefs are for Black people (Bryant, 2011). To find some justification for this system, people of color are often framed as inferior compared to Whites, leading to marginalization of people of color while providing power to Whites (Banks & Stephens, 2018). Even though society has observed compassionate, non-violent struggles for humanity's fundamental rights and non-discrimination by those who have been denied these foundational rights, racial disparities persist (Jones, 2006).

Pyke (2010) frames racism through the lens of, what he terms, a model resistor stereotype. Examples of this phenomenon are stories celebrating strong, resistant Black people like Rosa Parks, providing an image of a person who is impervious to pain, ever resilient, and possessing a virtually superhuman ability to endure hardship. While it is critical to identify strengths to counter the deviance and pathology orientation of psychology toward Black persons, caution should be exercised. These portrayals of strengths can also hide the wounds inflicted by racism and offers ammunition to the oppressor as the oppressed is framed as resistant to pain. Studies corroborate this and demonstrate that the Strong Black Woman stereotype (SBW) can render Black women more susceptible to mental and physical health problems (Donavan & West, 2015; West et al., 2016). Moreover, Black athletes are frequently perceived as naturally gifted for their physical strength and prowess. This stereotype leads White people to believe that Black athlete's cognitive abilities are secondary to their physical strengths (Moskowitz & Carter, 2018). The danger of elevating strength in ways that minimize pain is also seen in research showing that

some medical doctors under prescribe pain medication for Black people and believe that Black people are naturally more impervious to pain or have the ability to handle more pain (Staton et al., 2007).

All expressions of racism have a profound impact on the well-being of individuals who are oppressed and on the collective lives of marginalized groups. Institutionalized racism mainly pertains to the uneven and restrained access to goods and services, which have a negative impact on the life prospects and general health of those who fall victim to it (Molina & James, 2016; Harrell, 2006). The foundation model of racism offered by James Jones (1997) organizes racism into three primary forms: individual, institutional, and cultural. Jones defined individual racism as ideological and individual racial superiority while describing institutional racism as a force implemented by institutions to indoctrinate ideological biases and cultural racism as broad support of a selected racial group's vantage point. Harrell (2000) approaches racism from a framework of historical persistence and succession of inequity where people of color are seen as inferior. She further distinguishes between collective and interpersonal racism and how it can become apparent in racial disparities affecting large groups of people through societal institutions (e.g., health care, education, criminal justice) or through vicarious or direct experiences of discrimination, respectively.

Some forms of racism are subtler than others (Richmond, 2001) and, therefore, harder to detect or prove. One of these forms, referred to as microaggressions (Constantine, 2007; Masko, 2005; Nadal et al., 2014; Sue et al., 2007), includes brief interpersonal encounters experienced in daily life that are characterized by verbal and non-verbal expression and communicate denigrating messages to people of color. Microaggressions can be expressed through overt actions (e.g., being stopped by the police), verbal demeaning or dismissive statements, or

environmental offenses (e.g., the lack of Black executives in a workplace). This form of racism is particularly problematic because microaggressions can be harder to identify, and therefore the oppressed group cannot act upon them, leading to a sense of confusion (Bell, 1996).

Interpersonally mediated racism is another expression of racism and is manifested in how systemic racism shows up in interactions between individuals and relations between groups (Harrell, 2006). Interpersonal expressions of racism also include invalidation. People who are exposed to racism often find themselves convincing others of the validity of their experience as the majority group frequently questions whether discrimination actually occurred or not. When encountered with this type of opposition to a real felt experience, it can be re-traumatizing and invalidating and ultimately lead to feelings of self-doubt.

Racism on a cultural level presumes the superiority of Eurocentric values and finds its expression in several products, including art. Thus, a Black artist may not reach the same audience as an artist who does not belong to a minority group. These power asymmetries are reflected in opportunities not frequently granted to Black artists, as a pervasive ideology of racial superiority and inferiority reinforces this status quo (Harrell, 2006). Societal institutions, including art galleries and museums, are controlled by a majority group, which in turn has a significant effect on those who rely on those institutions. On the flip side, experiences and interpretations belonging to people of a minority group (e.g., Black artists) carry less power and receive little validation on a societal level (Hanna et al., 2000; Kambon, 1998; Schiele, 2000; Young, 1990). This leads to the idea of power differentials and how people of European ancestry have historically asserted more power relative to other racial groups, and how their experiences and interpretations have dominated the American sociocultural landscape (Ani, 1994; Asante, 1999; Hacker, 1992; Oliver, 2001; Turner et al., 1984; Wilson, 1998). It is important to note that

the expression of racism on a cultural level will leave footprints in ways that may not always seem obvious or visible to others.

Internalized Racism

Definition and Conceptualization of Internalized Racism

This author finds that many definitions of IR shift a sense of blame upon the individual afflicted with IR. It is essential to note that IR grows out of different forms of racism (i.e., institutionalized, personal and mediated) and that it is not fundamentally a conscious choice, nor a psychological defect, but rather a mechanism developed to survive in a world that rejects individuals based on the color of their skin.

Although the world has changed in many ways since 1903, the negative effects of IR have continued. In 1903 W.E.B. Du Bois first addressed the impact of White domination on Black people by using the term double consciousness and how Black Americans are born into a world that does not afford them true self-consciousness as they always see themselves through the lens of the other world. In many respects, his description could be interpreted as IR and how Black Americans did not choose to internalize negative beliefs about their racial heritage. Rather, they are born into a world where racism exists and are forced to survive within this oppressive structure. One fundamental aspect contributing to the perpetuation and maintenance of IR is that White racial privilege is very much dependent on the successful transmission of ideologies of White superiority and non-White inferiority and that this ideology reaches all members of society, including the racially subjugated (Pyke, 2010). The groundbreaking work of psychiatrist Franz Fanon (1967) on IR and the effects of colonialism are also foundational for understanding how IR operates and its psychological impact. In the book *Black Skin, White Masks*, he addresses the divided sense of self in the Black individual, who, through colonization, loses their cultural

identity and embraces the majority culture, which ultimately leads to a sense of inferiority. He further describes how Black individuals are conditioned to associate Blackness with wrongness and states, “A normal Negro child, having grown up within a normal family will become abnormal on the slightest contact with the White world” (Fanon, 1967, p.111). Sullivan and Cross (2016) describe the expression of IR as something that can halt the positive development of Black identity. They state that miseducation (i.e., belief in negative racial stereotypes), racial self-hatred (i.e., dislike and rejection of one’s Blackness), and rage and anger (i.e., against White people) all contribute to low self-esteem (Sullivan & Cross, 2016).

Internalized racism is not just a construct; it is real and often associated with a host of emotions, including shame (C.P. Jones, 2000; Watts-Jones, 2002). Trying to combat these negative feelings related to IR requires a lot of bravery, a conscious effort, not only for individuals but also for groups of people and societies affected by it. It is important to note that IR is conceptualized as a mediated process rather than an internal process (Banks & Stephens, 2018), suggesting that it is not innate to humans to adopt the dominant’s group ideology. Tappan (2006) and Campon and Carter (2015) have offered that the term appropriated oppression describes IR more accurately as it highlights the fact that negative messages are modeled by the oppressor and are taken in, or appropriated, as the truth by the oppressed group. This is important so far as it reduces the implication that the oppressed group should be blamed for any adverse outcomes or symptoms related to IR. It is also imperative to avoid placing responsibility on the oppressed to solve problems associated with IR as it suggests that any of these problems are not self-inflicted (Pyke, 2010). Padilla (2001) indicates that IR is not borne out of genetic or psychological defectiveness but rather grows out of complex intersections of multiple systems of domination. Schwalbe et al. (2000) view this as an inevitable condition of all structures of

oppression. Tanya Williams (2016) proposes that internalized oppression be understood as having two forms, internalized domination and internalized subordination, with the latter referring to the oppressed group's experience. She states that the oppressed group colludes with their own oppression while the dominant group embraces their privileged, superior identities and experiences this as normal, which results in internalized dominance.

Understanding the driving mechanisms is essential when trying to minimize the harmful effects of IR on Black individuals. Being othered and treated differently from Whites has been internalized by Black people. Witnessing the dominant group doing better in many respects (e.g., financially, academically) can lead to envy or, at best, to a sense of hope that one day one may also be afforded those opportunities. Research on the concept of attributional ambiguity (Crocker & Major, 1989) emphasizes that a person's self-concept depends on how oppressed individuals attribute their oppression and experiences of discrimination and view of themselves. For instance, if an individual attributes discrimination to her own characteristics, then she may internalize the assertion of inferiority and accept the negative self-view and discrimination as deserved. On the flip side, if the oppressed person were to attribute their oppressive treatment to biases in others or the system of oppression, a positive self-concept may be more likely to develop. This suggests that IR is learned (i.e., people are not born feeling ashamed of themselves) and that it can be unlearned.

Other IR research found that miseducation and self-hatred were highly correlated with IR and negative self-esteem (Cross, 1991; Vandiver et al., 2002). There appears to be a significant amount of variability in the way IR is manifested in different groups as some individuals may accept their inferior status, others may have some knowledge of the group they belong to and its

value, while again others may require psychological processes leading to self-affirmation (Jost & Banaji, 1992).

While there are many definitions of IR, it appears that almost all of them point to the fact that people suffering from IR adopt the dominant's group ideology while accepting a subordinate status as deserved. A recent paper that reviewed 112 empirical quantitative studies between 1990-2018 that examined the health and health-related correlates of IR among racial and ethnic groups confirms this. In this paper, Drexler James (2020) states, "IR occurs when an individual incorporates ideologies within their world views which serve to maintain or exacerbate the unequal distribution of opportunity across ethno-racial groups" (p. 786). C.P. Jones (2000) describes IR as the embracing of Whiteness while depreciating the Black self. Many approach IR from the standpoint of acceptance by a marginalized group of negative and critical beliefs about one's worth (Graham et al., 2016). Yet other researchers contended that IR is a form of turning upon ourselves, our families, and upon our own people (Lipsky, 1977). Speight (2007) describes IR and oppression in the framework of cultural imperialism, which holds that the dominant group determines what is normal, real, and correct, while ensuring the denigration and devaluation of marginalized groups. Molina and James (2016) saw IR as a form of acceptance of negative beliefs that were amplified by the White dominant group and internalized as the truth about one's racial group. IR can be seen as a social as well as a psychological process that has a negative impact on minority groups and individuals alike. Several factors can play a significant role in the development and maintenance of IR, according to Bryant (2011), including the level of acceptance of the dominant culture's practices, convictions, and the logic behind the denigration of Black people. Furthermore, C.P. Jones (2000) argues that IR is characterized by

accepting restrictions to one's own full humanity, including one's dreams, one's right to self-determination, and allowing to express oneself.

It appears that it is vital that individuals suffering from symptoms related to IR become more aware of their tendency to avoid interactions with stigmatizing experiences. This is particularly important as it may help them get in touch with how they engage in self-stigmatizing behaviors. Research corroborates this as studies have explored the importance of consciousness and racial identity regarding self-stigma (Pinel, 1999; Vandiver et al., 2002). Sullivan and Cross (2016) describe this process as a way of finding a voice made possible through a collective protest, cultural awakening, a loss of fear, and a strong desire for change. Latrofa, Veas, and Cadinu (2012) point out that stigmatized groups often use stereotypes of their own group when describing themselves and how this is a perfect example of self-stereotyping. Since self-stereotyping is more likely to occur when someone's self-concept is strongly correlated with their in-group (Rivera & Paradez, 2014), it is important to facilitate conscious awareness of the ways people accept or reject some of these stereotypes. Another compelling reason for individuals with IR to become more aware is supported by Pinel's (1999) definition of stigma consciousness; stating that the extent to which an individual expects to be stereotyped is related to their consciousness level around stigmatization. Thus, people who have a high level of stigma consciousness are more attuned to discrimination while also being more likely to reject stereotypes.

The appearance of IR always has to be understood within the context of racism and how racial/ethnic groups suffering from IR are driven by a sense of survival when rejecting their own racial heritage. This sense of survival becomes evident when the oppressed group tries to seek membership or approval from the dominant group in an attempt to ward off the traumas inflicted

by racism. It is crucial to keep in mind the dangers that lie in rejecting one's own racial heritage as it can lead to an implicit agreement with the perpetuation of racism (Harrell, 2006) and an acceptance of hegemonic, hierarchical stratification of race which places Black people at the bottom of the order (Bryant, 2011). This view of hierarchical structures is supported by C.P. Jones' (2000) discussion of racism, as she contends that Black people have been viewed as culturally inferior, cognitively inadequate, morally suspect, and impulsive. Furthermore, this view changed during the 20th century when Blacks were labeled as aggressive, hostile, and criminal, which is still how majority groups describe the Black community today. These stereotypes hold a lot of power and become the content of IR, leading to feelings of powerlessness, lack of control and self-worth, and an embracing of Whiteness while depreciating the Black self (C.P. Jones, 2000).

Research on Predictors, Correlates, and Effects

Effects of IR are mediated by the extent to which a person believes they deserve the oppression, or whether they think it is natural to be oppressed or inevitable (Banks & Stephens, 2018). This is important in so far as it indicates that the level of subordination is highly correlated with symptoms related to IR (e.g., shame, fear, low self-esteem). Low self-esteem and general psychological distress have been associated with IR in the bulk of research on internalized racial oppression. Although low self-esteem and shame have received a lot of attention in research studies about IR, other studies have understood and conceptualized IR as more encompassing than having low self-esteem. Tappan (2006), for instance, emphasizes the fact that appropriated oppression is more complex and takes into account that the oppressed is learning to use the tools of the oppressor (Tappan, 2006; Campon & Carter, 2015). This learned behavior can manifest itself in many different ways: Black individuals who have internalized the

harmful stereotypes about Black people being lazy and now feel compelled to work twice as hard to ameliorate those beliefs and prove that Black people are worthy. Appropriation of those tools can also manifest itself in Black individuals consciously choosing activities typically taken on by White people (e.g., golf, classical music, etc.). Original and earlier studies on racial identity and prejudice included the famous doll studies by Clark and Clark (1947), which focused on the concept of self-hatred in the context of racism (Cross, 1991). The study's outcome showed a small number of children preferring White to Black dolls but, more importantly, expressing dislike towards Black dolls. This study received a lot of criticism due to engaging invalid quantitative measures of racial self-esteem, identity, and preference (Baldwin, 1979; Banks, 1976), suggesting that that being Black is, by definition, to be self-hating. This study is an excellent example of how former research did not take the effect of racism into account but rather conflated the children's responses to their reference group with personal identity. Thus these early studies assumed that negative feelings towards the Black dolls expressed by Black children were due to IR. However, self-hatred remains one manifestation of IR, as seen in several discrimination works of literature.

It is crucial to keep in mind that there is nothing wrong with a person suffering from IR and that their behaviors are a by-product of navigating through an oppressive system on a daily basis. Some specific effects of IR on people can be noted in several research studies. Campon and Cater (2015) found that IR is frequently manifested in how marginalized groups accept American beauty standards. It was also found that IR is associated with depression, anxiety, self-degradation, and low self-esteem (Campon & Carter, 2015; Velez et al., 2015; Watts-Jones, 2002). More recently, research looking at the relationship between major depressive disorder (MDD) and IR found that those with high self-esteem were less likely to have had MDD in the

past year compared to those with low self-esteem (James, 2017), suggesting that high self-esteem may function as a protective factor for IR (Burkley & Blanton, 2008; Kim, et al., 2012).

Other research indicates that IR functions as a mediator between racist events and anxiety and stress symptoms as evidenced by increased racial oppression leading to increased anxiety and stress symptoms (Graham, et al., 2016). Seeing IR as a mediator has been confirmed in recent studies to help clarify how it functions as a protector to identity within a larger system of oppression (Banks & Stephens, 2018). One compelling argument supporting the idea that IR grows out of oppressive systems is that the subjugated develop a false sense of safety when aligning with the powerful in an attempt to escape their otherness, which unfortunately supports the very rules that defines them as the other (Pyke, 2010). This behavior has to be understood within the context of an oppressive system as the marginalized group is seeking for acceptance to survive in a world that is ruled by the dominant group. Internalizing these identities as real can lead to a sense of self-identification as the lesser person and it becomes very hard to present any opposition towards powerful systems as defined by the oppressor (Osajima, 1993; Pyke & Johnson, 2003).

It is only natural that oppressed individuals are striving towards justice. However, studies indicate that there is a higher risk for adverse health outcomes when Black people strongly believe in a just world while also believing in a sense that people get what they deserve (Eliezer, et al., 2011; Hagiwara et al., 2015). Thus, it is important to note that Black people would fare better when not believing in the dominant's group ideologies, including beliefs in meritocracy, which supports the notion of an individual's hard work to combat or counteract stereotypes. Concepts like meritocracy and hegemony can obscure oppression as they both suggest that advancements and opportunities for a group of people are based on achievements and skills,

supporting cultural myths that racial disparities in hiring or school admission are solely based on objective standards and applied equally to all (Pyke, 2010). These myths have been widely accepted by many people and feed into the internalization of racism in a way that may go unnoticed.

Research suggests that prolonged exposure to racism leads to multigenerational transmission of IR as Black individuals have adopted certain values associated with Ethnocentric notions of physical attractiveness for centuries. This, inevitably, leads to the rejection of their own racial heritage, including skin color and hair texture (Parmer et al., 2004). This notion of rejecting Black features while adopting features in line with Eurocentric values can be observed in behaviors like changing one's appearance, altering hair, using skin bleaching products, and receiving cosmetic surgery (Kaw, 1993; Jones, 2000; Hall, 2005). Thus, IR plays a pivotal role in the transmission process, as socially sanctioned notions of inferiority are passed on through generations, emphasizing the importance of those features mentioned above as a guideline to aspire to, which in turn may lead to becoming agents of their own oppression with a propensity to acting out violence against one another as a result of IR (Parmer et al., 2004).

Pyke (2010), however, emphasizes the importance of not blaming those who experience IR as it only serves to protect White racism. It can be argued that rejecting one's own racial heritage is driven by a survival mechanism, as it may be rewarded by society by offering those with less pronounced phenotypically African American features better positions in life. David (2013) emphasizes the detrimental effects skin bleaching products have on a large proportion of non-European women, with 77% in Nigeria, 59% in Togo, 50% in the Philippines, 45% in Hong Kong, 41% in Malaysia, 37% in Taiwan, 28% in Korea and 27% in Senegal. They state that this has not only been declared a worldwide health concern by the World Health Organization but

also involves psychological consequences such as devaluation and inferiorization of one's own racial group. Parmer et al. (2004) argue that internalized oppression has become a trans-generational problem that has led to various mental health disparities. One major driving force in IR is shame. One reason why shame is highly associated with IR is that people of color typically do not have public role models, as found on TV or in advertisements, to help normalize their own appearance (Perkins, 1996), which can result in a negative self-perception regarding physical attractiveness. Other research involving shame delineates two levels of shame to elucidate the correlation between notions of shame and being of African descent (Watts-Jones, 2002). Watts-Jones describes the first level as the shame associated with African-ness and the second level as the shame of being shamed. Her understanding of shame amongst Black individuals highlights the importance of time in this cyclical phenomenon, beginning with the simple fact of being born with Black skin and understanding the notion of difference for the first time. This is followed by a deeper level of shame that may be triggered later on in life when the individual feels shamed for being shamed, or in other words, for feeling shame due to racial oppression. James Jones (as cited in David, 2013) states that overcoming shame, self-hatred, or fear is exceptionally challenging for individuals and groups of people who struggle with IR.

Colorism based on an ideology of White supremacy is at the root of internal differentiation and inequality among people of color (Hall, 2005) and has historically led to intragroup collusion with racism (Burton et al., 2010). Feelings of self-worth are closely intertwined with the idea of identification with a person with Black skin, as comparison of skin color may play a vital part in the identification process (Hurst, 2015). As individuals with lighter skin frequently reap the benefits of being privileged, it may place values on their own racial group members.

A host of theorists have suggested that IR is a direct consequence of recurrent experiences of racism and that IR may be a mechanism that links experiences of racism to anxiety. Several studies emphasize the association between IR, low self-esteem, and higher levels of distress (Belgrave et al., 1994; Brooks, 1996; Cross, 1991; Jacobs & Bowles, 1988; Vandiver, et al., 2002). The Eurocentric monocultural ideology has aided in the attempt to forcefully assimilate African people to a European value system, which, to this day, infects the minds of people of color and causes them to question their self-worth and value of their own cultural heritage (David, 2013).

Parmer et al. (2004) view IR through the lens of family patterns and culturally sanctioned traditions that have been shaped by oppressive life experiences and ways of surviving in a world of institutional slavery in which individuals were withheld from engaging in their African family culture. These effects are immediately linked to the legacy of slavery rooted in devaluating the arrangement and shaping of a positive sense of group identity, which in turn led to the myth of inferiority. Negative self-images were the direct outcome of these events, which resulted in idealization of the majority culture (Parmer et al., 2004). Molina and James (2016) found that IR was associated with feelings of superiority by Whites and that this helped to maintain a self-perpetuating cycle of oppression that eventually led to feelings of self-doubt, decreased self-esteem, and feelings of hopelessness and helplessness and thus pointing to depressive symptoms. Other factors leading to self-devaluation and IR are discrimination and the mechanisms by which internalization of negative in-group biases operate, leading to diminished health outcomes. Williams and Williams-Morris (2000) point out how racism has a pervasive and adverse impact on the health of racial and ethnic minorities in the U.S., and it is considered a fundamental cause of negative health outcomes related to racial and ethnic minorities, including the racial and

ethnic inequities in health (Williams et al., 2019). They further contend that there are three pathways through which racism can negatively affect mental health: institutional discrimination, stress due to discrimination, and acceptance of the stigma of inferiority. Other research emphasized how frequent encounters with discrimination towards African American men were correlated with hypertension and cardiovascular disease. On the flip side, Molina and James (2016) suggest that endorsement of negative stereotypes may not always lead to internalization, but rather serve as a protective factor under particular conditions and have no negative impact on mental health.

Expressions of Internalized Racism

Internalized racism can express itself in a variety of forms. One of the most common manifestations of IR may be shame concerning one's race or ethnicity and the need to reject parts of oneself that can be associated with one's race or ethnicity (Watts-Jones, 2002). Prilleltensky and Gonick (1996) also believe that humiliation and shame play a significant role in the development and maintenance of IR. They contend that feelings of inferiority are preceded by shameful experiences, which will lead to a decrease in self-confidence. More specifically, individuals afflicted with IR may have the desire to create distance emotionally, culturally, physically, and in terms of identity. Individuals may opt to cut off family members that they perceive to represent the racial or ethnic attributes linked to shame. By identifying with the dominant, rather than the original and minority culture, an individual could seek to alter their behaviors in an attempt to be accepted by the majority culture. Although the bulk of the literature points to shame and low self-esteem as correlates of IR, less overtly negative components such as perfectionism to counter the imposter syndrome or overworking are not as visible to society but, nevertheless, detrimental to people with IR (Banks & Stephens, 2018). While some effects

of IR are more obvious, such as depression or anxiety, other effects are more subtle and not easy to detect, especially to people who do not come in contact with oppressive systems.

The wounds inflicted by IR are widespread and have been reflected upon by artists of color who touch on the topic in autobiographies, essays, films, music, poetry, and novels (Lipsky, 1987; Moraga, 1983). Important themes, such as internalized skin tone bias in communities of color, have been explored within those genres and directly reflect the pain and trauma in families of color related to IR (Pyke, 2010). On the other hand, television shows such as “The Cosby Show” and comedians like Chris Rock, however, attacked and ridiculed the Black community by distancing themselves from what they termed lower class Blacks while simultaneously grouping themselves in with the economically stable Black people, perpetuating intra-racial class tension (Dyson, 2005). This behavior serves a function as it helps class-privileged Black people distance themselves and create a positive self-identity from those they view as bad Blacks who have created their own poverty.

Visual Art and the African Diaspora

Palmer (2000) describes the African diaspora as the scattering and dissemination of Black people from Africa. The first known diaspora reaches back thousands of years and is said to have started about 100,000 years ago and named the great exodus. The following movement took place around 3,000 BCE with the motion of the Bantu-speaking people, now known as Cameroon and Nigeria, to other parts of the African continent and the Indian Ocean. The next diasporic movement took place around the 5th century BCE, including soldiers, traders, and slaves with the end destination of Europe, Asia, and the Middle East. These three diasporic streams were part of the pre-modern diaspora and characterized by mostly voluntary movement, with a few involuntary movements. However, the term African diaspora frequently refers to the

forced removal of African people during the slave trades from the 1500s to the 1800s. It affected millions of people and resulted in Africans living on different continents, including Europe, Asia, and North and South America (including the Caribbean islands). However, it is essential to note that diasporas also exist within continents. Having to leave one's homeland and arriving at multiple destinations can affect the individual in various ways (e.g., trauma or political and economic disadvantages).

The movement of African people from Africa throughout the globe is known for its racially oppressive nature that resulted in a great deal of resistance. The creation of the diaspora can be divided into three major movements, beginning with the Atlantic slave trade in the 15th century involving about 200,000 enslaved individuals to Europe and 12 million or more to the Americas before the end of the 19th century. The East African slave trade to Asia came to completion around the same time as the first Atlantic slave trade and can be seen as the second movement within the modern African diaspora. Lastly, the third movement is the contemporary movement of Africans and people of African descent to a variety of places around the world (Palmer, 2000). This movement includes both involuntary processes (e.g., sex trafficking, kidnapping children), refugees from war and political oppression, as well as voluntary immigration. Even though there are differences in how their various migration histories shaped individuals, it is important to note that one binding factor remains to be emotional aspects related to racial oppression. However, the differentiation between, for example, Haitians and African Americans are important in so far as it delineates their different ways of struggling with racism, with Haitians being able to free themselves from slavery after 13 years followed by alienation from the community around them and exposure to dictatorship (Palmer, 2000). While slavery ended in the United States after a bloody civil war, this ultimately did not resolve issues of

oppression and injustice. The importance lies in avoiding homogenizing individual's experiences based on the color of their skin. It is important to use the term African diaspora with caution, as many people who lived on the African continent defined themselves exclusively in concordance with their ethnic group and self-identified as Ibo, Yoruba, Malinke, etc. Through the appellation African, we homogenize these individuals by simply calling them Africans. Further simplifications regarding the term diaspora have resulted in people believing that it only pertains to people sharing similar ancestry while living in different parts of the world.

Willett (2002) emphasizes the significant contributions the continent of Africa has made to humankind's cultural heritage. While some African art has received considerable attention, such as the rich and varied African sculptures that had an immeasurable effect on Western art of the 20th century, art created by Black artists has more often than not been undervalued, ridiculed, and described as obscene and primitive. One example of this is Leonardo da Vinci, who stated that painting was the highest form of art and the latest to develop. He contended that societies who only possessed sculptures were primitive, referring to art deriving from the continent of Africa. Overall, the idea of African art as backward, un-evolved, and 'primitive' has continued even though stone age cave paintings were discovered in Africa in the late 19th century (Willett, 2002).

Raiford and Raphael-Hernandez (2017) explore ways in which visual forms function as a diasporic resource and how these images have moved among, between, and within transitional Black communities. Their book analyzes several art forms, including visual art and how visuals have shaped diasporic memories of individuals and the collective self. Themes including migration and a constant sense of movement, restlessness, longing for equality and safety can be found in artworks made by Black artists giving expression to the African Diaspora. Studies of the

African Diaspora have unearthed what it means to be in constant flux, migrating, not belonging, and being exiled due to racial capitalism, New World slavery, imperialism, and colonialism (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). While art history is able to shed some light on visuals regarding the African Diaspora, it is essential to note that elite spaces such as museums and galleries have consciously excluded BA who's work would contribute to a deeper understanding of the racial meaning behind the migration of Black people over centuries. Thus, traditional art history has its limitations in discussing matters concerning the African Diaspora. However, contemporary art has made efforts to bring awareness to themes involving racial issues. For instance, a large contemporary international art exhibition in 2007, called the *Documenta*, exhibited the African artist Romuald Hazoume, whose work has been highly influential. It depicted the life-threatening struggles of economic and political refugees, whose safe passage from Africa to Europe is not guaranteed. The artwork was constructed of 421 petroleum canisters shaped into a boat. Each canister represented a refugee. This work enters an aesthetic debate based on the African Diaspora and its ongoing and dangerous process. He and other contemporary artists, such as Isaac Julian, Terry Adkins, Yinka Shonibare, and Joy Gregory, are focused on destabilizing and questioning the outposts of Western art history through revealing the dehumanizing aspects of the African Diaspora.

Many artworks by artists throughout the African Diaspora touch upon unreported and underreported incidences of loss of life, risks involved with migration, lives led under the radar, and contemporary survival strategies. All the while, these works also bring awareness to the need to flee from their unsafe home country through visualizing historical causes. In many instances, these artworks elicit a variety of strong emotions in the viewers, leading to a sense of discomfort. For instance, Isaac Julien's work depicts powerful images of African migrants leaving the shores

of North Africa for Italy, showcasing people drowning. Julien states that the work is about exploring space and politics of space and leaving the viewer with questions, who has the right to be in certain spaces? Other works touch upon themes closer related to IR's roots in that it explores the complex relationship between Europe and the Caribbean. Many people in the Caribbean feel a strong connection to Europe and a desire to take over certain Eurocentric values in the hope of a better life. This strong affinity to what they term the *motherland* persists even though some are the descendants of enslaved Africans brought by Europeans against their will to work the plantations. Europe was built upon their labor by stripping Africa and the Caribbean of natural and human resources (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). The outcome was extreme poverty in many of these regions, such as Haiti or Sierra Leone. Moving to Europe has been an unobtainable dream for those who were left behind in those regions as the European Union continues to make it difficult for refugees, asylum seekers, and migrants to enter, including those from Africa. This came at an enormous human cost and has led to approximately 23,000 deaths amongst migrants since 2000. The dream of living in a safer place, such as Europe, has been further shattered by an increase in xenophobia. Black artists have tried to bring awareness to these realities and have gained more popularity within the past few years. This created a hypervisibility of the Black body in contemporary art, which opened up discussions whether Black artists themselves or their works could be seen as objects of desire (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017), with an emphasis on object. The artists mentioned above are aware of this trend and use the notion of hypervisibility by creating works that highlight the absence of the Black body, making it invisible, which speaks to the dream of belonging or acceptance of not being welcomed. There are an ever-increasing movement and flow of people in the diaspora

culture. Understanding the importance of art within this flow can help grasp the emotional impact it has left behind on those individuals impacted by the migration.

There have been misconceptions about African American art produced beginning in the 1960s, assuming that true African American art always addressed racial struggle or contained obvious visual references to African form. Other assumptions included the equation of African American art with a particular style. This belief persisted well into the 1990s and was reflected in thoughts of African American artists producing predominantly figurative works rather than abstract art (Cahan, 2016). This is a form of stereotyping and precludes those Black artists who did not neatly fall into these categories. However, it is crucial to consider the brave and lengthy process of African American artists and their departure from Western culture. Elvan Zabunyan (2005) claims that there have been three distinct points in history that delineate Black artists' position in the art world. The first was described as *mainstream* and took place in the 60s. During this time, African American artists conformed to the criteria of Western art. These artists only showed their commitment to the Black community outside of the art institutions. The second period was referred to as *Blackstream*, during which the African American artist revealed their Black identity by depicting their characters as Black through their skin color. However, these artists were not entirely opposed to the Western-style. The third phase, called the *Black Art Movement*, showed that Black artists claimed total separatism with Western art traditions and created a militant language using clear codes of recognition specific to the Black community.

Evaluation of Art Made by Black Artists

Western culture has long been viewed as the sole criterion by which to judge artworks. Words like qualification, beauty and truth were commonly used to lead the way in the decision-making process of which artist qualifies as a representative of the current art world (Cahan,

2016). Furthermore, Cahan (2016) makes reference to the museums that have included African American art into their exhibitions, which was often negatively received by the general public and art critics who saw this work as superfluous or even opposed to the museum's mission. Major Museums, such as the Whitney Museum of American Art, the Met, and the MoMA, consciously excluded African American artists and other artists of color, even though they were confronted with daily demands of activists trying to bring awareness to inequality within these institutions (Cahan, 2016). Central racial issues held by these powerful institutions withheld artists of color from entering exhibitions as museums argued that they had to uphold responsibilities to the public showcasing artworks that reflected quality. Kerry James Marshall, in one of his many artist's talks, denounced at the Tate Gallery in London that he was baffled as a child that someone like Charles White, who is a highly-skilled master draftsman and whose work has been unparalleled regarding the representation of the Black figure, was not represented in any art history books and did not make the cut into the famous art institutions as a Black artist (Tate Gallery, 2018). Benny Andrews, a Black artist who was willing to share some of his painful memories in dealing with art institutions, shared that art galleries until the 60s only showed a minimal selection of artists and that this in-group of artists was very protective of their power and actively excluded others from entering. He states, "The average artist had no way of entering unless they got literally what the slaves got: a note from the master to come in" (Cahan, 2016, p. 27). This further corroborates the considerable influence of institutions on decisions regarding who is deemed an established artist and what constitutes high art. More often than not, this selective process has left Black artists and African Americans out of the circuit as cultural producers or consumers.

One integral derivative of the art of the African diaspora would be artists creating work during the Harlem Renaissance. The migration of freed slaves from the South to the North was propelled by job prospects and the desire to flee from a Jim Crow era of oppression, searching for a new identity. This system left deep scars in the minds of those who had been deprived of their basic human needs. The struggles of previously enslaved African Americans had been reflected in their artwork's content by emphasizing the duality between the former rural, uneducated and oppressed self and the newly formed image of an urban, cultured, and freed self (Ritchie, 2013). The Harlem Renaissance was defined by its intense creative activity and the context that is provided for a wealth of artistic productivity in various forms of art. This pivotal time is characterized by exploring the religiously themed work that many White artists created while simultaneously breaking new ground by taking inspiration from African art. African American artists like Romare Bearden reclaimed aspects of African art history that had mainly been sampled by European artists like cubists (e.g., Picasso) who took great inspiration from African and Oceanic art. Black American culture became central to some African American's work, and racial themes took a prominent role (Wright, 1990). The fact that African Americans were confronted with a harsh reality of segregation allowed the Black artists to deeply explore African American culture. W. E. B. Du Bois and Alain Locke played a pivotal role in promoting art created by African Americans and emphasized the fact that their artwork would help them to lift the veil of oppression and offer them a new image of sophistication (Wright, 1990). One outcome of the Harlem Renaissance was cultural separatism that grew out of a general racially segregated foundation in America during that time that held segregated exhibitions for Black and White artists. This segregation widened the gap between art made by African Americans and by White artists and emphasized notions of high art made by White people as art critics wrote about

art produced by African Americans in a way that portrayed them as less capable and labeled it as Negro art (Wright, 1990).

Less than a dozen museum exhibitions featured Black artists' work prior to 1967, and these selected few exhibitions were typically held in segregated contexts, adding on to their invisibility. What was accepted as universal art was harshly separated from African American art and exhibitions showcasing art made by African Americans was contested, subject to debate, dissension, and protests. To democratize art institutions, African American artists had to find strategies to gain access to them. However, the art world has been resistant to racial equality, which is supported by Susan Cahan's (2016) description of this world as a nepotistic, interlocking network in which artists experience an industry-wide restraint of trade that limits their ability to enter the system. Although there have been moments in history and recently, during which there was a heightened interest in art created by Black artists, the artworks shown during these phases eventually went back into storage, awaiting its next wave of interest. It is important to note that museums' common view is that an artwork's quality is strongly associated with art critics' critical consensus. This firmly held belief further perpetuates segregation, and it is essential to understand that the lack of Black artists in art institutions is not due to a lack of quality in their work but rather a result of systemic racism. Furthermore, Susan Cahan (2016) speaks of today's two-tiered system of cultural institutions versus mainstream galleries and museums and how this approach focuses on one-person exhibitions, which avoids radical revision and limits the range of art shown. There is a high need for culturally grounded museums, with an emphasis on cultural equity and accessibility to people of color. The continuous inclusion of Black artists in established arts institutions would help support this.

Themes in African American Art

Multiple themes are present in African American art that reflect Black people's lived experience in the United States. These include, but are not limited to, enslavement, liberation, migration, a celebration of racial heritage, empowerment, IR, and anger. While themes may overlap amongst Black artists' art, it is crucial not to obfuscate differences among members of this group of people. How they express their experience as Black artists differ from one another, emphasizing the importance of understanding each artist's intersectionalities and the fact that each individual has been shaped by different social, historical, and economic contexts, which in turn led to a different artistic expression (Cahan, 2016). Nevertheless, common themes amongst art created by Black artists can be identified.

To elucidate how the Black experience is reflected in visual art, this dissertation focuses on figurative artworks. This style can touch upon and tap into a universal language, which abstract works could not achieve. Furthermore, themes involving figuration and a sense of narrative seem to be directly related to the experience of the African Diaspora. When focusing on Black artists' figurative artworks, a few areas of emphasis emerge, such as a strong sense of symbolism, notions of African or African American identity, and the history experienced by Black individuals. Stylistically, figuration, and narrative in art made by Black artists is significant in so far as it delineates the most direct form of communicating the viewer's African American experience. Often art created by African Americans address narratives that are complex and often deliberately challenges viewers by introducing de-sentimentalized images of racism or stereotypes, which leaves the viewer thinking about themselves in relation to those images. For example, Kara Walker creates artwork that falls within this category as she makes sophisticated references to antebellum history and 19th century American visual culture. Her

narrative further speaks of visual wit and a deep interest in allegorical mystification. Walker's interest in symbols and themes is closely connected to racist, sexist, and class-based American hegemony.

Many Black artists have made work that challenges and confronts a viewer by presenting imagery that touches upon themes such as racism and stereotypes, racial power differentials and dynamics, and liberation, freedom, and survival.

Depiction of Racism and Stereotypes

With respect to the theme of art depicting negative racial stereotypes, one function these works hold may be to mirror the perceptions that racist strains within society may already have. It is important to note that Black artists' intention is not to make a mockery of their race but rather to challenge societal views or ask a viewer how they can relate to the artwork presented. Today's contemporary art dealing with racist issues appears to derive largely from the 18th-century pseudo-science of Johan Casper Lavater's physiognomic theory. This theory revealed a person's natural and national character to expose someone's moral code. These simple paper cuttings, of unknown origin, were primarily for identifying slaves and often were accompanied by a bill of sale (Du Bois Shaw, 2004). Another example is Palmer Hayden's depiction of pleasant and ordinary White people who are juxtaposed to unattractive caricatures of Black figures with Black coal complexions and exaggerated White lips. The emphasis in his work was to bring to light how racism shapes an individual as Hayden's representations present a Black caricature that racist Whites felt comfortable with (Wright, 1990). Criticism about Hayden's work included the strong overlap between his depictions of Black people and those painted by White racists during this time. Hayden was not making works geared towards racist Whites but was rather challenging the viewer with normalized social perception.

Historically, the way Black people were represented in Western art was directly related to racist thinking. For instance, a strong relationship between visual and verbal systems of representation of meaning led to several artworks showcasing Black people as slaves. The word negro was conflated with the word slave. These dehumanizing and stereotypical images of Black individuals were mindlessly repeated even after abolishing slavery, and abolitionists themselves ironically participated in perpetuating these stereotypes (McDowell, 1991). Western traditional representations were and still are seen as divergent from ways in which Black Artists visually expressed themselves. This self-expression served the purpose of emphasizing cultural stereotypes. An example of this is George Cruikshank's illustration of *Uncle Tom's Cabin*. He depicts Black people with caricatures, facial features, and exaggerated gestures. Stereotypical images of slaves rejoicing in the face of their release or debasing themselves in a submissive posture in front of their master were shown many years after emancipation. One example of this is Thomas Ball's *Emancipation Memorial Monument to Abraham Lincoln*, as Lincoln towers far above a nearly naked, kneeling slave. This clear depiction of power differential also emphasizes the stereotype of a subordinating, subservient Black figure.

A critical component in Black artists visually expressing themes of racism and stereotypes is their ability to exert some level of control over stereotypical images of Black individuals while shaping them in ways that best reflect their lived experience. For instance, Kara Walker, a contemporary Black Artist, describes herself as a puppet master over imaginary Black people when she is able to visually express the social manipulations Black people have undergone (Du Bois Shaw, 2004).

Racial Power Differentials and Dynamics

Art created by Black artists frequently explores notions of hierarchy and a struggle for power. Several artists visualize the idea of privilege deriving from Eurocentric values in art history by contrasting it with images representing the Black figure in ways that evoke feelings of discomfort. These artworks can touch upon the absurdity of Black citizenship being questioned, revealing exaggerated facial features, or showcasing dehumanizing aspects of the Black experience. By doing so, the works emphasize the idea of power and dynamics between the powerful majority group and the oppressed minority group. Negotiations of power structures and racial realities are frequently depicted in art created by Black artists, as it evokes thoughts about societal structures in relation to power and pokes at societal taboos. Since these power dynamics have been well established in the world around us, several African American artists have used this public knowledge and visualized it to parallel people's narratives within their minds. Some works appear to speak to racial power differentials that may evoke thoughts around racial equality in the viewer and thus serve a sociopolitical purpose. Artworks created by Black artists have addressed notions of power in ways that comment on the demand of having a voice by turning racial power differentials upside down. Several Black artists have tackled the subject of power dynamics by giving image to the conflicted and complex relationship society has in relation to power.

Liberation, Freedom, and Survival

Social justice became one of the major influences of many African American artists' work. It invited open participation of all African Americans to view artwork that dealt with Black racial identity. It offered a form of Black empowerment that was not intellectually beholden by Whites (Bynum, 2011). A pivotal point in history was the Harlem Renaissance,

known for its infusion of pride amongst African Americans. Many artists created artwork that portrayed African Americans as sophisticated, cultured, and liberated through emphasizing facial expressions, clothing styles, or body language that conveyed a sense of freedom and pride. One of the artists was James van der Zee who photographed African Americans in a way that showed Black people in a positive light. His aim was to capture moments during which his models looked proud of themselves.

The contribution of Black artists to themes like liberation, freedom, and survival is extremely valuable, as it has the potential to heal from racial oppression and offer a sense of empowerment. By emphasizing the Black subject in paintings and depicting them in ways that show racial pride, leadership, connectivity, or heroism, it can engender a Black viewer's desire to recall Black leaders in their lives who served as role models and offered hope. The conscious and deliberate inclusion of the Black figure depicted in powerful positions can confront the viewer, as it may remind them that they are excluded from the art world, and that power and privileges are typically equated to the White figure. Thus showcasing the Black subject in paintings as embodiments of confidence or beauty can help the Black viewer imagine themselves in those positions. The underrepresentation of an entire racial group comes to the foreground when Black artists exhibit works that place the Black figure in the spotlight, which is likely to feel empowering to the viewer who belongs to this group.

Internalized Racism in the Art Literature

Art has historically played a significant role in bringing subjects to the forefront that engender feelings of discomfort in the viewer. Various forms of art have become a strong and global language to speak against human rights violations and function as a form of activism (New Tactics in Human Rights, 2017). While themes of racial identity and racism can be found

in art and art literature, themes of IR are not available. Cardwell (2015) writes on the artwork of Jean-Michel Basquiat and contends that creating art, for Black artists, can serve the function of liberating themselves from oppression, invisibility, and the way in which majority groups define Blackness. The art literature has written about paintings made by artists who struggled with IR and whose work reflected a public announcement of the artist's hidden identity as a Black artist. This can be seen in Robert Colescott's biography as he identified as White up until his mid 40s (Weseley, 2019). He had a Black mother and his father was White, Black, and Native American. These biographies frequently reveal life experiences related to racial matters and discuss how the artist's upbringing has led to the internalization of negative stereotypes, which later were depicted in their artworks. Weseley (2019) explores Colescott's boyhood fear of Black figures negatively portrayed in 1930s era cartoons. Colescott would later resurrect such imagery to deal with his own IR. This demonstrates how some Black artists linked their lived experiences to their later artwork. Colorism, as a theme of IR (Burton, et al., 2010; Hall, 2005; Hurst, 2015), is more commonly found in the art literature (Gaines, 2017; Tate Gallery, 2018) as expressed by Gaines (2017), in an interview with Kerry James Marshall, who emphasizes the importance of a full spectrum of skin tonalities as it relates to inequality. However, it is essential to note that terms like IR are infrequently found in the art literature and this author's exception were biographical descriptions of Robert Colescott's life. Racism is a territory that has been more frequently explored within the art world (Du Bois Shaw, 2004; Weseley, 2019; Zabunyan, 2005), while IR remains a less-traveled path.

Strategies for Healing from Internalized Racism

The literature, overall, does not offer a lot of resources regarding interventions specifically with IR. It mostly addresses issues of awareness on the therapist's part and how

therapists are responsible for becoming more aware of the detrimental consequences it may have on clients belonging to an oppressed or marginalized group if clinicians fail to address issues around IR (Graham et al., 2016).

Liberation Psychology provides a useful perspective for interventions with IR. Liberation psychology offers a platform for oppressed people to pursue wellness through removing oppression, domination, and exploitation (Bryant-Davis & Moore-Lobban, 2020). Martin Baro, as cited by (Tate et al., 2013), describes Liberation Psychology as a form of awakening and states that awareness is a process rather than a state. Watts et al. (2011) understand liberation as a learning process and emphasize that there are three core critical consciousness components (i.e., critical reflection, political efficacy, and critical action). They contend that “*critical reflection* refers to the social analysis and moral rejection of societal inequities” (p.46), while “*political efficacy* is the perceived capacity to effect social and political change by individual and/or collective activism” (p.46). Lastly, they state, “*critical action* refers to individual or collective action taken to change aspects of society, such as institutional policies and practices, which are perceived to be unjust” (p.46-47). Montero and Sonn (2009) refer to liberation as, “an ethical-critical-empowering and democratizing process of a collective and historical condition” (p.1). They explain how liberation entails the transformation of conditions of inequality, which includes the conscientization of the participants who become increasingly more aware of their rights as human beings within society. Prilleltensky (2008) describes liberation as a condition in which oppressive forces no longer exert their domination over a person or group. He contends that the process of liberation is comparable to Paul Freire's concept of conscientization, as people have to become aware of oppressive forces and how they manifest themselves in their lives before being able to overcome them. From a liberation psychology perspective, to free oneself of

oppressive forces that exist intrapersonally, interpersonally, and institutionally, one has to distance oneself from the strong influences of oppressive messages and structures. Freire (2000) states that conscientization, which is a form of awareness of the dynamics of oppression, will empower marginalized populations to liberate themselves from oppressive systems and find strength in overcoming domination. Critical consciousness is described as involving three processes: critical reflection, critical motivation, and critical action (Diemer, 2016). The literature on critical consciousness emphasizes people's ability to heal from IR through questioning oppression (Burton & Kagan, 2009; Freire, 2000). Freire's critical consciousness theory is directly in line with research indicating that group-confidence, self-pride, and the ability to acquire independence to promote collective interests are associated with the advancements of African Americans (Akbar, 1996; Anderson, 1994; Karenga, 2002; Kunjufu, 1991).

Gaining awareness over one's own internalized oppression and becoming more conscious of the systemic nature of oppression is the mechanism by which individuals are able to eventually find empowerment and take action to combat those dominating systems (Prilleltensky, 2008). Liberation, according to Moane (2003), is ultimately the only way to transform oppression in social structures, which has to be carried out collectively. For example, intergroup dialogues among youth of divergent ethnic and racial backgrounds about issues of race, culture, privilege, and power can lead to a greater understanding for others (Checkoway, 2009). According to Dalrymple and Burke (1995), an anti-oppressive practice involves becoming aware of power imbalances and working towards change to redress the balance of power, which can be obtained through applying practices focused on the promotion and maintenance of equality, rights, equity, wellbeing and independence. It is vital that the mental health field addresses the

negative impact IR has on the marginalized population. Corneau and Stergiopoulos (2012) propose an anti-racist framework that would include IR and make explicit what the negative effects of it are on the community.

Empowerment plays a major role in combatting IR, and it is crucial that those who seek services are fully involved in the decision making process and other components of care. The concept of empowerment examines ways through which people are able to gain higher levels of control over their lives, including their environments (Prilleltensky, 2008). A large body of research supports the idea of an equal relationship with service recipients to help minimize any power imbalance between providers and clients (Arredondo & Rosen, 2007; Gould, 1994; Hopton, 1997; Larson, 2008; Peacock & Daniels, 2006; Tew, 2002; Wheeler, 1994). Empowerment also includes validating an individual's life experience, pride, beliefs, and strengths and really trying to help mobilize the client's resources. This is particularly important as it helps them gain a sense of control and agency over their lives while simultaneously accessing their authentic voices and making them known to the public. Dalrymple and Burke (1995) contend that the notion of empowerment helps people to gain tools to challenge power and develop a strong positive identity.

In order to liberate oneself from IR, one has to acknowledge its close relationship to oppression. Freire (2000) points out that the liberation process is not smooth, but rather asks individuals for their willingness to wrestle and reflect on their process as systems of oppression wants you to act in one way (e.g., submissive), while the newly liberated person wants to act in different ways. This reflection phase will eventually give way to developing a sense of self that is not in reaction to IR but rather steeped in a humanizing self. Banks and Stephens (2018) point out that each person has their own way of working through IR. They state that IR may manifest

in symptoms of depression and anxiety, while it may be less obvious and subtle in others.

Corneau and Stergiopoulos (2012) point out the importance of anti-racism education, which includes an examination of individual and institutional racism and becoming educated about its historical roots and how racism manifests itself within institutions, the impact it has on poverty, the job market, and on how minorities are not represented in media.

Other ways to bring awareness to prejudice involve racial socialization provided by family members or other systems in the African American community, which can lead to the development of a sense of racial pride, agency, and the courage to stand up against discrimination (Stevenson, 1995). Literature pertaining to racial and ethnic socialization and identity has pointed out that there is an increased need for families with diverse ethnic and racial backgrounds to find ways of dealing with adapting to racial and ethnic stratification by transmitting positive messages and nurturing a positive racial identity. Positive racial socialization and identity are potentially powerful in protecting children from developing high levels of IR (Stevenson, 1995). French et al. (2013) explore the similarities and differences between racial identity and ethnic identity and suggest that parents transmit messages to their children about group memberships in a dynamic way, which includes verbal and nonverbal as well as conscious and unconscious messages. These messages have a significant impact on the way the child interacts in the world. More specifically, parents can educate their children in different ways in an effort to prepare them for the diverse outside world. A parent can, for example, offer cultural socialization, or prepare their child for bias, or provide messages designed to warn their children of other racial or ethnic groups, or they may provide egalitarian messages that are intended to encourage racial equality and coexistence of the races. These messages help children identify with their racial or ethnic group, but the outcome may differ

across families as every family engages in this process differently. Families incorporating stories about role models who embody positive characteristics (Hughes et al., 2006) have both yielded positive outcomes in African American youth and helped them feel closer connected to their racial identity. This positive racial identity is engendered by parents who offer their children stories about racial pride or cultural inheritance (Stevenson, 1995).

Racial identity has been found to play a pivotal role in supporting African American youth and providing them with increased self-esteem (Rowley, et al., 1998). Mutisya and Ross (2005) noted that African American college students' level of Africentrality was positively correlated with racial socialization, suggesting that parents' positive racial socialization efforts can facilitate positive racial identity. Exposure to art and literature from one's racial and cultural group are essential strategies of racial socialization (Mutisya & Ross, 2005). In order to combat IR, it is crucial that parents engage in diverse racial and ethnic socialization practices in an effort to increase positive racial identity and decrease symptoms associated with IR. It is also important to be aware that IR can be transmitted within families where messages rejecting Blackness or denigrating Black people are emphasized.

In groundbreaking work on racial identity development, Cross (1971) suggested that African Americans may move through five distinct stages. These stages are indicators of mental health for the Black community. While the first stage (i.e., pre-encounter stage) is characterized by rejection of one's own racial makeup and an idealization of Whiteness from a Euro-American frame of reference, in the second stage (i.e., encounter stage), the individual is moving towards embracing a new world view due to an encounter or confrontation in their personal world that allowed for this change. Cross further argues that the third stage (i.e., immersion-emersion) stage moves even further towards a Black identity as the person begins to idealize Blackness, but that

the person may still not be able to internalize positive attitudes about their own Blackness. The problem with this stage is that African Americans may have the tendency to denigrate Whites in an effort to accept themselves. Cross (1971) explains that the fourth stage finally allows the individual to achieve inner security regarding their Blackness, as they are able to integrate parts of the immersion-emersion process into their self-concept. Parham and Helms (1985) explored ways in which different levels of racial identity attitudes in African Americans may impact psychological functioning and their ability to self-actualize. Research by Black scholars over the course of the years suggests that a person who moves through all stages (i.e., pre encounter through internalization) will experience a transition from feelings of inferiority to self-acceptance and from non-self-actualizing to self-actualizing behaviors.

Sonn (2009) approaches oppression through the lens of decolonization and how indigenous communities can reconstruct certain disciplines, such as psychology or education. He specifically emphasizes the importance of engendering a sense of self-determination to challenge and combat voices of dominance. This could be done by helping people who belong to an oppressed group find vehicles for expressions such as within-group communal activities, artistic expression, or sport (Sonn, 2009). Sarra (2005) points to the fact that even though Whites have had a negative impact on ways in which Indigenous people view themselves, they have the power to create a space and form within groups to share their stories and express themselves amongst one another and thus break the chains of colonizing practices.

Watts-Jones (2002) suggests that healing from IR is an ongoing process and involves opportunities for Black people to gather within-group to process IR. These sanctuaries can allow for feelings of safety, belongingness, a sense of home, and support. Watts-Jones emphasizes that this sanctuary offers a place of refuge and protection from the oppressive outside world and can

be compared to a holy place. Moreover, experiences of togetherness can potentially combat feelings of self-alienation and self-degradation that often occur as part of IR. It is critical to assess for the presence of feelings of shame when working with clients who struggle with IR, as shame frequently lies at the core of racism and thus IR. Watts-Jones (2002) further describes the two levels of shame: (a) the shame associated with African-ness as a result of slavery, and (b) the shame of being shamed. She further contends that an important part of healing from IR is finding the strength to openly talk about the secondary shame as it is deeply connected to the first level of shame. Thus, liberation from secrets would be an important component of alleviating feelings of shame associated with IR and past exposure to racism.

Watts-Jones (2002) further describes how within-group sanctuaries have been taking place for centuries in different settings (e.g., late-night meetings on plantations, shared communication of spirituals, drumming, in church meetings, and within the communal care offered to one another). The liberating effects of letting go of a veiled language allowed for facades to be broken down and masks to be taken off. Collective pain can be discussed and experienced in a safe environment, with the goal of empowerment and increased awareness. Watts-Jones also emphasizes that there is also value in forming across-groups (i.e., formed by different ethnicities and races) when addressing IR as there may be a potential for reinforcing oppression when viewing racism as our shame. This way, IR can be externalized and seen as the shame of oppression rather than allowing it to become a part of oneself. Sharing this with a majority group may facilitate this process. This does not preclude the need for within-group settings but rather offers another platform for addressing IR. Watts-Jones (2002) further states that the pain and shame associated with IR require an in-depth inward look and courage to be

present with feelings engendered through this self-exploration (e.g., spirituality and religious practices).

When providing psychological services to individuals struggling with symptoms related to IR, it would be important for therapists to be educated about the complexities associated with IR and the knowledge of how it is expressed differently in different people (e.g., more or less overt). When working with African American clients suffering from IR, it is imperative to be informed about the symptoms associated with IR; the role history played that led to the formation of IR, the potential role of racial socialization and identity in protecting against IR, and the various expressions of IR such as colorism and perceptions of attractiveness (Parmer et al., 2004). Banks and Stephens (2018) contend that agencies should intervene on a communal level to help put in place some interventions that are directly related to liberation from IR. It is crucial to explore diverse intervention strategies to address IR, including the integration of expressive arts.

Art Interventions with Black People

While art interventions in mental health tend to emphasize art-making (i.e., expressive and creative strategies), there is also attention to the role of art-viewing and art perception as it relates with an individual's interpretation and emotional response due to their individual cultural experience (Arts Council England, 2004). Devaney (2016) explores the way in which art can address cultural wounds (i.e., oppression, colonialism, poverty, slavery, etc.) and how viewing art can enhance one's mood, emotions, and other psychological states and contribute to the process of healing. Moreover, he found that art is a form of expression that holds therapeutic values and offers coping mechanisms to deal with extreme suffering. Furthermore, Roberts et al. (2011) explored how art viewing can provide psychological support for carers of people with

mental health problems and found that psychological processes such as metalizing, reflexivity, and externalizing were the mechanisms by which viewing art was emotionally supportive to this group.

The impact of viewing art has largely been studied in the context of museums and hospitals; S. Claiborne Johnston (as cited in Wecker, 2019), a medical school dean, pointed out the neurological effects of looking at art by stating that viewing art activates that same region of the brain that responds to the sense of touch. Moreover, engaging with art is associated with managing pain, stress, and anxiety while simultaneously improving hospital staff's communication and understanding of patients from all social and ethnic groups (Arts Council England, 2004). Through developing a profound and deep interest in the art object, the viewer is opening up and receptive to the object and can have a direct encounter with it rather than a superficial one. Schachtel (1959) terms this deep connection with an artwork allocentric. These types of encounters with art can reach far beyond one's conscious awareness and Kandinsky (1914) states that the viewer can get in touch with their unconscious material and points out the close association between artistic creativity and spirituality.

Physiological and emotional effects of viewing art are noted by Dr. Lisa Harris, an internist. She states that a painting can alleviate feelings of pain and lower stress, which supports the idea that art is a contributor toward a model of care (Manhattan Arts, 2020). Art can play an important role in furthering consciousness, not just in the individual but also within their surroundings. Alex Gray, an American Visionary artist, speaks to this transformative quality by stating, that artists have the power to potentially advance deepen and transform the consciousness of their community (Manhattan Arts, 2020). Kesner and Horáček (2017) explore how visual art was found to elicit empathic responses in the viewer based on mirror neuron

mechanisms. More precisely, mirror-neuron systems are said to allow humans to directly understand the meaning of other people's actions and emotions by internally replicating. This is important, as they state that figurative artworks can engage the viewer in two different ways: (a) through socio-affective cognitive processing and (b) through non-social aspects of the image that are related to the viewer's esthetic preferences.

Recent studies speak of the healing components of art-making amongst African diasporic peoples and how, more specifically, their production of visual images fosters mutuality and interconnection (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). Questions have been raised if art has the ability to inspire individual viewers toward finding a sense of personal agency and empowerment (Devaney, 2016). These concepts would be highly beneficial to Black people, as centuries of racial oppression have impacted experiences of power and powerlessness. Ernst Bloch, a German Marxist philosopher, states that visuals can offer a glimpse of the not-yet-become, leading to inspiration and an ability to turn dreams into what he termed revolutionary forward dreaming, which he believed fostered self-agency. He argued that people are able to move beyond the dream and become an active agent of their social change through the inspiration of art (Finley et al., 2019).

One of Freire's primary contributions was developing the methodology of culture circles to achieve critical consciousness (CC). These culture circles were comprised of people from a marginalized community. They were designed to offer a platform for collaboration and discussion to bring awareness to the causal factors of social, cultural, and political inequality. CC interventions have evolved to include the use of popular films, books, and hip-hop music to foster exploration of race, class, and culture within minority youth (Watts, et al., 2011). Researchers have built upon the foundation of cultural circles to develop interventions to

facilitate greater critical consciousness regarding aspects of mass media and its role in societal inequities (Diemer, 2016).

Photovoice has gained increased recognition within participatory and culturally relevant methodologies as it lends a sense of empowerment to community members who belong to a historically oppressed or marginalized group. This method represents a creative way of integrating an artistic process with empowerment. The process's central component entails asking participants to take photographs of their world and reflect on them. An example is having participants take pictures of their neighborhood community and to hone in on things they may be proud of or on things they would like to change. The photographs are then typically presented in an exhibit where there is interaction with viewers (Carlson, et al., 2006). One driving force behind photovoice is to alleviate feelings of helplessness, dependency, and to combat a notion of apathy found within those communities. Freire (2000) pointed out three levels of consciousness that had an impact on how reality was perceived: (a) the *magical level* in which people were stuck within their thinking and assumptions of inferiority leading to a silent acceptance of those experiences which were adding to their own oppression, (b) the *naïve level* of consciousness in which people thought of social situations as sound but corrupt leading to blaming others for their social circumstances and (c) the *highest level of critical consciousness* during which individuals gain awareness of their assumptions and start to shape their interpretations of reality, which in turn offers them the ability to choose. Photovoice allows people to move through these different stages and typically begins with cognitive awareness, followed by emotional engagement and collective introspection, which will ultimately lead to recognizing the responsibility for change (Carlson, et al., 2006).

Washington and Moxley (2003) incorporated artistic processes in a group therapy intervention with African American women with low income who struggle with chemical dependency. Women were asked to reflect and discuss photographs of successful African American women to help them feel motivated and foster personal change, as well as to analyze and discuss visual art to promote participant reflection about changes inherent to recovery. The participants were exposed to classical paintings and had previously not been in contact with art or interpretations of art. Reactions were very positive as they noted that art helped them tap into emotions they would have normally suppressed and avoided. Munch's painting of *the scream* played an essential role as it allowed participants to tap into their own fear through the process of identification with the central figure in the painting. Thematic discussions about that particular painting brought up issues of feeling stuck or failing (Washington & Moxley, 2003).

Synthesis and Critique of the Literature

In summation, the literature review discusses IR, its etiology, and how it is expressed in art created by Black artists. Studies are highlighted that offer a deeper understanding of the negative effects of discrimination on marginalized populations and how these experiences lead to internalization of racial oppression (Padilla, 2001; Pyke, 2010; Schwalbe, et al., 2000). Other articles speak to the fact that IR has been largely ignored in research and that there has been a better understanding of the detrimental effects of experiences of racism (Banks & Stephens, 2018; Pyke, 2010). Similarly, healing from symptoms related to IR has not been received much attention in the research literature. This lack of knowledge about IR extends to psychologists and other mental health professionals as it remains understudied and under defined area within research (Banks & Stephens, 2018). IR has been strongly linked to literature exploring Eurocentric views and how they have perpetuated a false belief of inferiority, leading to

multigenerational transmission of IR (Parmer et al., 2004). The literature review examines experiences and perceptions of IR with respect to how the larger context of racism and the stratification of race may play a role in perpetuating and maintaining IR in Black people. This includes definitions, correlates, predictors, and effects of IR.

Visual art, in this dissertation, is further understood in the context of the African Diaspora with an emphasis on explaining how the migration of Africans from their homeland has led to oppression and racism. More contemporary literature brings to light how visuals have the ability to shape diasporic memories of individuals and how these visuals unearth and touch upon themes of inequality, lack of safety, and constant flux (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). Art literature elucidates how Western culture has been understood as the only criterion to judge artworks upon and that art created by Black artists is frequently seen as superfluous and primitive (Willett, 2002; Zabunyan, 2005). It is emphasized that a lack of awareness of this inequality found in art institutions and racial issues have placed Black artists at the bottom of the hierarchy and withheld them from entering into these institutions. It is further noted that democratizing art institutions in regard to racial equality would have to take precedence for the museum as an institution.

In critically evaluating the literature used for this dissertation, it is essential to note that there has been some level of awareness in the lack of attention in addressing IR and how it impacts those who are affected by it (Banks & Stephens, 2018). However, several articles described ways of healing approaches to IR in the following manners: Liberation Psychology pursues wellness through empowerment (Arredondo & Rosen, 2007; Bryant-Davis & Moore-Lobban, 2020; Freire, 2000; Gould, 1994; Hopton, 1997; Larson, 2008; Peacock & Daniels, 2006; Tew, 2002; Prilleltensky, 2008; Sonn, 2009; Watts-Jones, 2002; Wheeler, 1994). Research

found that racial socialization and identification helped develop a sense of racial pride and courage to stand up against discrimination (Corneau & Stergiopoulos, 2012; Hughes et al., 2006; Stevenson, 1995). An article by Mutisya and Ross (2005) explored that viewing art from one's own racial and cultural group has yielded positive outcomes in regard to racial socialization and identification. No articles were found that addressed art viewing and IR.

The literature review addresses mechanisms of healing through coming in contact with visual art. Art was found to be affective with coping with pain, stress and anxiety (Art Council England, 2004) and additionally contact with art can elicit empathic responses in the viewer based in mirror neuron mechanisms (Wecker, 2019). For the Black viewer, art can address cultural wounds, such as oppression, poverty and colonialism (Devaney, 2016), while raising a viewer's consciousness toward their surrounding environment (Manhattan Arts, 2020). Traumatic memories are often stored in images, rather than words (Herman, 1997). A heightened level of consciousness is also extended to active participation and engagement with the art one is confronted with, which Rochford (2017) connects to a deeper understanding of important social issues. Other literature explored how a connection to artworks can lead to exploration of self, the world and the examination of one's difficult life experiences (Linesh, 2004; Peacock, 2012; Silverman, 2010).

The literature reviewed provides a foundation for this dissertation's focus on artworks created by Black artists who emphasize IR in their work. Utilizing IR-related art created by Black artists as a way of potentially healing from symptoms related to IR has not been explored previously, and no other study has thus far considered its potential therapeutic value.

Chapter 3: Methods

The dissertation aimed to explore and elucidate the relationship between IR and visual art created by Black artists with a focus on implications for psychological interventions. The methodology is informed by the review of the literature on internalized racism with attention to issues of identity, liberation, racial power differentials and dynamics, emotional processing of racism, racial identity, meaning-making, and self-esteem. The literature also included mechanisms by which IR can be impacted with an emphasis on healing and empowerment through viewing and/or making art by Black artists. The general purpose of the exhaustive literature review, supplemented by reviewing representative artwork, was to offer a deeper understanding of IR and how selected visual art produced by Black artists can express themes of IR and potentially have an emotionally-healing impact on Black people. The literature review aimed to both explore as well as critique research on IR. One overarching goal was to identify overlapping IR themes in the psychological, cultural studies, and visual art literature. The method that emerged from this review focuses on connecting selected artworks created by Black artists to the IR literature, examining the artwork for the expression of relevant IR themes, as well as exploring implications for psychological interventions.

The dissertation methodology includes two primary processes: (a) identification of Black artists and artworks that reflect IR themes identified in the review of literature, and (b) an analysis of the artwork with an emphasis on emotions and implications for healing IR. The analysis includes identification of hypotheses on IR and psychological processes and recommendations for psychological treatment.

Dates of Publications and Databases

The literature review did not exclude any documents based on their date of publication. It is important to note that most documents used for this dissertation were published after 1970, as cultural issues in psychology emerged more prominently around this time. The visual art literature is explicitly contemporary in nature, as all visual artists selected for this research must have produced art after 1970. The end of Modern Art is marked in 1970, which announces the birth of Postmodernism and contemporary art (Widewalls, 2016). The literature review utilized sources accessible through primary research tools, including the PsychINFO electronic database, Academic Search Elite, Research Library, WorldCat, and Literature Resource Center. Sources relevant to contemporary visual art literature included scholarly journal articles, book chapters, books, and dissertations spanning 1970 to the present, as well as video interviews/documentaries about contemporary visual artists.

Types of Documents and Keywords

Sources were acquired from literature relevant to cultural and psychological theory pertaining to IR, empowerment, liberation, racial socialization, racial identity, and literature published within the realm of visual art. The literature included empirical articles of research findings relevant to the effects of IR, art-based interventions, and other topics that inform the research questions. Notwithstanding, there are limitations to the availability of empirical studies exploring contemporary visual art produced by Black artists.

Keywords that were utilized in the literature review procedure include the following: racism, racial discrimination, internalized racism, internalized racial oppression, internalized oppression, internalized subordination, racial trauma, racism-related stress, contemporary visual art by Black artists, liberation, resistance, power, empowerment, racial socialization, racial

identity, colorism, assimilation, racial self-hatred, racial power differentials, healing from racism, emotional processing of racism, meaning-making, self-esteem, expressive art, art therapy, and psychological interventions with African Americans.

Inclusion Criteria for Artists

Inclusion criteria were identified for selecting artists that were most relevant to the objectives of the dissertation. First, it was essential that the artists selected are currently exhibited, whether alive or dead, as this allowed for greater access to their body of work. All artists are well established and represented internationally in galleries and museums. By excluding artwork that predates 1970, it increased the likelihood that the art is in circulation and culturally relevant. Gallery and Museums are cultural institutions, and it is essential that selected artists have representation within institutions that allow for direct contact with the original artwork rather than a printed or web version. Two-dimensional work was another inclusion criteria, as it is easier to exhibit and more frequently encountered in galleries and museums and thus had a broader pool of artists to draw from. Limiting the selection to representational and figurative art aims to increase a viewer's connectivity to the imagery depicted in the subject. While work of an abstract nature can elicit emotions, figurative or representational work can more broadly and directly deliver messages that relate to themes in IR as our recognition and relation to figures might offer a universal interpretation that extends to various audiences.

The inclusion criteria related to themes of IR served the purpose of selecting artists whose work most strongly reflects key issues in the IR literature in order to most effectively analyze the association between themes of IR and how they might be visually expressed. To reduce researcher bias, the dissertation chair functioned as the auditor for confirming that the range of artists for potential inclusion met the criteria.

Prior to presenting the six artists selected to the dissertation chair, ten other artists were considered. These artists are Nathaniel Mary Quinn, Jordan Casteel, Faith Ringgold, Betye Saar, David Hammon, Rashid Johnson, Chris Ofili, Tschabalala Self, and Wengeshi Mutu. While these artists create engaging work about the Black experience, they were not selected for the study, as their work did not meet the criteria (e.g., too abstract, sculptural, British, about feminism not IR, between media) and did not address themes of IR in their work. Based on a review of further contemporary Black artists, six artists were identified as meeting the inclusion criteria as they are contemporary, widely exhibited, touch upon themes related to IR, thought-provoking, and are exemplary in the field of fine art. These artists are Kara Walker, Kerry James Marshall, Kehinde Wiley, Nina Chanel Abney, Robert Colescott, and Devin Troy Strother. Table 1 presents the artists and the selection criteria for their inclusion.

Table 1

Black Artists who Meet Inclusion Criteria

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
Nina Chanel Abney	<p>Born 1982 in Harvey, IL</p> <p>Lives and works in New York</p> <p>Identifies as African American</p> <p>BFA in 2004, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL</p> <p>MFA in 2007, Parsons</p>	<p>View entire Public Collection in APPENDIX A</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Nina Chanel Abney broaches subjects as race, politics, sex, religion, and art history. She is interested in the visual representation of information overload where time and space are compressed and identity is interchangeable. She features power struggles, police brutality, confusion of identity and racial inequity by depicting African Americans in a way that emphasizes stereotypes and institutionalized racism.</p>	<p>Figures in Abney's paintings often demonstrate a merging between Black and White facial features and her use of Black and White masks further emphasize the idea of IR in that the figure is masking their true racial identity.</p>	<p>Nina Chanel Abney's paintings range in emotional evocativeness depending on how explicitly she expresses themes around race, racism and IR.</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	School of Design, NY, NY	Abney is interested in visualizing everyday events and at times incorporates visual language from the internet. Abney's work is figurative and representational and uses pop art influences.	Themes related to IR include power imbalance, feeling flawed, turning against one's own racial group, idealization of the majority group, subordination, limited self-expression, intra-racial class tension, health and mental health consequences and self hate.	
Robert Colescott	<p>Born in 1925, Oakland, CA</p> <p>Died of Parkinson's Disease in 2009 in Tucson, AZ</p> <p>Was drafted into the US Army in 1942 and served in Europe during World War II</p> <p>BFA in 1949, UC Berkley, CA</p> <p>1950: year in Paris at Atelier</p>	<p>View entire Public Collection in APPENDIX A</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Colescott tackled subjects of social and racial inequality, class structure and the human condition. He was interested in representing the Black experience. He received international recognition for his satirical re-envisioning of American history in paintings like "George Washington Carver Crossing the Delaware" (1975). In later work, Colescott fused his personal issues around race and gender identification with a political life around him.</p>	As a young man Colescott wanted to belong to the White majority group due to discrimination and feelings of shame towards his Black heritage. He grew up in a household that highly valued achievement and assimilation and light skin and Caucasian features. Since he was darker skinned than his brother, it	Colescott's paintings often evoke powerful emotions related to race, gender and social inequality

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>Fernand Léger</p> <p>MFA in 1952, UC Berkley, CA</p> <p>1964: 1 year faculty Artist in Residence at the American Research Center in Cairo</p> <p>Lifelong Professor of painting at academic institutions including the Portland State University OR; UC Berkley, CA; University of Arizona, Tucson</p> <p>Identifies as heterosexual; was married 5 times and divorced 4 times</p> <p>Identifies as African American and is biracial (i.e., White and Black)</p>		<p>made him keenly aware of his racial difference. He was afraid of images displaying White people in Blackface, as they are symbolic of the denial of personhood to Black people. Colescott resurrected them in his paintings, which offered a visual language with which he was able to deal with his own internalized racism. As a biracial being, he visualized the conflicted sense of his own racial identity.</p> <p>Themes related to IR include shame, fear, self-hate, feeling flawed, inferiority, Colorism, Eurocentrism, idealization, negative racial identity,</p>	

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
			stereotypes, and health and mental health consequences of racism and IR	
Kerry James Marshall	<p>Born 1955 in Birmingham, Alabama</p> <p>Lives and works in Chicago</p> <p>Identifies as African American</p> <p>BFA in 1978, Otis Art Institute, LA</p> <p>Honorary Doctorate in 1999, Otis Art Institute, LA</p> <p>National Endowments for the Arts, 1991</p> <p>Grant from MacArthur Foundation, 1997</p> <p>One of the 7 new appointees names to President Barack Obama's</p>	<p>View entire Public Collection in APPENDIX A</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Kerry James Marshall's work reveals and questions the social constructs of beauty and power. He critically evaluates the phenomenon of invisibility ascribed to Black bodies and by placing the Black figure in the center of the painting he lends power to that figure. He is also interested in investigating the implications of skin tone in his paintings.</p>	<p>Kerry James Marshall addresses themes of IR through visualizing notions of invisibility and by bringing up the construct of self-esteem in several of his paintings. This is achieved formally (e.g., by painting a Black figure on a Black ground) and through content (e.g., a Black female wearing a blond wig).</p> <p>Themes of IR include stereotyping, self-stereotyping, colorism, feeling flawed, inferiority, anger, shame, self-doubt, and Eurocentrism.</p>	<p>His paintings are at times highly emotionally evocative as noted by art critics who stated that they are filled with love, but also with grief, anger, death, and a sense of loss. He growing up in Watts during the LA riots has impacted his view on the world around him, which has added to his belief in a non-negotiable, undeniable presence in the narrative created in his work (NPR, 2017).</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>Committee in the Arts of Humanities</p> <p>Wolfgang Hahn Prize in 2014, Gesellschaft für Moderne Kunst at Museum Ludwig at Cologne</p> <p>Rosenberg Medal in 2016, University of Chicago</p> <p>W.E.B. Du Bois medal in 2019, Harvard University (highest honor in the field of African American studies)</p>			
Devin Troy Strother	<p>Born 1986 in West Covina, CA</p> <p>Lives and works in Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>BFA in 2009, Art Center College of Design, Pasadena, CA</p> <p>Residency in</p>	<p>View entire Public Collection in APPENDIX A</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Strother's work tackles racial issues, including stereotypes and intra racial class tensions. He infuses humor into his work while simultaneously addressing highly charged topics like racism and internalized racism.</p>	<p>Themes around IR are visually expressed but are also reflected in many of his titles. For instance, one of his paintings is titled "Aye guuurl you know you got a White</p>	<p>Strother's paintings vacillate between humor and anger, which at times evoke a lot of emotionality in the viewer.</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	2010 at Skohegan School of Painting and Sculpture, Skowhegan, ME		<p>guuuuurl on yo back tho”, said Sheriece to Lattiece.”Yea guuuuurl I know I know she just chillen tho”, said Lattiece to Sheriece”.</p> <p>This artwork depicts a Black female dressed in a bikini carrying a White female also dressed in a bikini on her back, while smiling, indicating that the Black woman agrees with her subordinate position.</p> <p>Devin Troy Strother addresses themes of IR through emphasizing negative in-group biases, which create intra-group tension</p> <p>African American figures and figures that are depicted as African tribes people.</p>	

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
			Themes of IR include self-hate, feeling flawed, low self-esteem, Eurocentrism, envy, idealization, subordination, intra-racial class tension and anger/violence.	
Kara Walker	<p>Born 1969 in Stockton, CA</p> <p>Raised in Atlanta, GA from age 13 onward</p> <p>BFA 1991, Atlanta College of Art, GA</p> <p>MFA 1994, Rode Island School of Design, NY</p> <p>Lives and works in New York</p> <p>Currently teaches at Columbia University</p> <p>1997: John D. and Catharine T.</p>	<p>View entire Public Collection in APPENDIX A</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Walker is known for her silhouetted life sized figures. She addresses racial myths, slavery, gender politics, oppression/domination, and questions of personal versus historical autobiography. She appropriates the 18th and 19th century figural format of the cut-paper silhouette while visualizing Black racist stereotypes within Southern racial history and the history of Black representation upon contemporary America</p>	<p>Themes of IR can be found in many of Kara Walker's artworks. She frequently explores notions of power differentials and depicts the Black figure at times in dehumanizing ways, which brings up questions in the viewer as to whether those Black figures are representative of IR in that they desire to cut off their racial heritage due to extreme racism.</p> <p>Themes of IR</p>	<p>Walker confronts the viewer in a way that forces them to come in contact with luring effigies and ghosts from the past who are engaged in a fictitious and, unsentimental master-slave dialectic, which can be highly emotional evocative. Exposure of dehumanizing aspects of oppression and the fact that the figures are often life sized confronts the viewer and asks them to identify with</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>MacArthur Foundation Achievement Award</p> <p>2008: United States Artists, Eileen Harris Norton Fellowship</p> <p>2012: member of the American Academy of Arts and Letters</p> <p>2015: named the Tepper Chair in Visual Arts at the Mason Gross School of the Arts at Rutgers University</p>		<p>include low self-esteem, dehumanization, subordination, limited self-expression, health and mental health consequences of racism and IR, anxiety, shame, exploitation and violence.</p>	<p>the oppressor or the oppressed.</p>
Kehinde Wiley	<p>Born 1977 in Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>Lives and works in New York, NY</p> <p>Identifies as homosexual</p> <p>BFA, San Francisco Art Institute, CA</p> <p>MFA, Yale University,</p>	<p>View entire Public Collection in APPENDIX A</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Kehinde Wiley is known for his hyper realistic portraits of African American men in heroic poses. He references classical paintings as well as pop culture within his paintings. He also draws inspiration from Venetian painters, French Rococo painting, Islamic architecture, African textile design, contemporary fashion and urban hip-hop.</p>	<p>Kehinde Wiley injects his paintings with symbolic examples of power and privilege that is derived from a Eurocentric history of oil painting and thus emphasizes a longing to have what the majority, powerful</p>	<p>Some paintings are highly emotional evocative as they are symbolic reminders of the ongoing racial inequality in different parts of the world. A number of paintings emphasize passivity and vulnerability</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>New Haven</p> <p>2002: Rema Hort Mann Foundation Grant Recipient</p> <p>2008: Americans for the Arts, Young Artists Awards for Artistic Excellence</p> <p>2010: USA Network, Character Approved Award</p> <p>2011: Canteen Magazine, Artist of the Year Award; New York City Art Teachers Association/United Federation of Teachers, Artist of the year Award</p> <p>2012: Pratt Legend Award</p>		<p>group has.</p> <p>Themes of IR include resistance, liberation, power, Eurocentrism, idealization of the majority group, and awareness of racist acts</p>	<p>by painting figures in a horizontal position, reminiscent of the figure's mortality or woundedness, which likely evokes strong emotions in the viewer.</p>

Selection of Artworks for Analysis

The researcher initially identified four or five artworks from each artist for possible inclusion for the critical analysis. This selection was based on identifiable themes related to racism and the emotional intensity of the piece. Emotional intensity was considered important as it has a higher likelihood of drawing in a viewer and bringing IR into awareness. In summary, the inclusion criteria for the art are listed below.

- 1.) The artworks used need to be produced after 1970.
- 2.) The artwork is 2-dimensional.
- 3.) Artworks are figurative and/or representational.
- 4.) The artworks selected are emotionally evocative (e.g., display of violence) and have a strong potential to place the viewer outside their comfort zone.
- 5.) Artworks are emotionally evocative and potentially relate to themes of IR.
- 6.) Artwork should reflect themes from IR literature.
- 7.) Artists should identify as Black.

The selection process was developed to narrow the artworks for critical analysis down to no more than 12 pieces of art that best reflected IR themes and had an emotionally evocative quality. The researcher identified a total of 26 artworks and sent electronic copies to the chairperson. The selection process was comprised of two phases. In the first phase, a “Master Theme List” was developed based on the literature reviewed on IR. This list was agreed upon between the dissertation chair and the researcher. The list initially included 15 themes and clustered expressions and experiences of IR within these themes. This original Master Theme List was modified to include additional themes that were identified during the selection process. These additional themes were discussed, and it was determined that they should be included in

the Master Theme List, resulting in 18 clusters. These three additional clusters included “violence,” “objectification and exploitation,” and “nurturance, positive relationship, love, and relational connection.” These final themes served as criteria for the researcher and the dissertation chair in selecting artworks for Phase 1 (see Table 2).

Table 2

Master List of Identified Themes Related to IR and Applied to Selected Artworks of 6 Selected Black Artists.

1.)	Power and empowerment; Resistance, Asserting Rights, Standing up for rights/self, racial pride
2.)	Liberation, Freedom,
3.)	Invisibility, low self-worth, insignificance
4.)	Anger, Rage
5.)	Sadness / Despair / Hopelessness and Helplessness
6.)	Shame, humiliation
7.)	Anxiety/ Fear
8.)	Self-hate / Feeling flawed / Not fully human /Inferiority / Low self-esteem / Self- doubt; Self-devaluation; Self-stereotyping;
9.)	Idealization (e.g., of the majority group); colorism; Eurocentric (e.g., reflected in hair texture, skin color, body size, facial features) Envy; Negative racial identity; Turning against (e.g., “our own people)
10.	Stereotypes; Caricature; Cartoonish; Limited portrayal; Exaggeration of features;
11.)	Portrayal of racism; Observation or awareness of racist acts, stigmatization; Discrimination; Dehumanization; restrictions (e.g., to one’s humanity); Subordination; Perpetrator / Victim; Hierarchy (Inferiority-Superiority)
12.)	Limited self-expression; Emotional distancing; Numbing; Shutting off/down; Withdrawal; Isolation
13.)	Intragroup dynamics; Intra-racial class tension / Intra-racial conflict
14.)	Health and mental health consequences of racism and IR (e.g., physical illness)
15.)	Positive change, positive reconnection to racial group, racial pride (as part of healing IR)
16.)	Violence
17.)	Objectification; Exploitation
18.)	Nurturance, positive relationship, love, relational connection

The other inclusion criteria were that the artwork was emotionally evocative and had a relatively high emotional intensity level. An interval rating scale was utilized to indicate the intensity of emotions evoked when viewing each selected artwork for the study. The scale ranged

from 1-10, with 1 indicating a *very low intensity of emotions* and 10 *very high emotional intensity*. Emotional evocativeness was operationalized as the artwork's potential to generate strong emotions, including sadness, anger, disgust, fear, joy, shock, and others. The systematic selection process included discussions about each artwork in two phases of review, application of emotion scale ratings, and a Master Theme List of IR themes applied to each selected artwork for the study.

Phase 1 of the selection process involved the researcher and the dissertation chair separately rating for intensity and applying the Master Theme List to each artwork, documenting which of the listed themes related to IR were reflected in each artwork. A column for comments generated by both parties about each artwork helped facilitate discussions about the artworks and establish the Master Theme List's effectiveness. After each rater completed their intensity ratings and theme identification for each artwork, Phase 2 was implemented, which consisted of a consensus meeting to select the specific works to be utilized in the critical analysis.

The consensus process was impacted by the researcher and the chairperson's mutual influence on one another as there are commonalities and differences between them (e.g., educational level, experience with research and art, racial identification, place of birth, etc.). Through respectful discussions, the team utilized consensus to construct their interpretation of the data while being mindful of research biases in order to most accurately analyze the data. Clara Hill et al. (2005) emphasizes the importance of equal involvement and shared power during the consensus process, as different viewpoints (e.g., minority and commonly held) are valued. The researcher and dissertation chair had several discussions of their interpretation of IR in relation to their life experiences and empirical articles. Clara Hill et al. (2005) encourage team members to find a common understanding of the data while simultaneously holding different

worldviews. The chairperson's longstanding clinical and research expertise on topics involving racism and IR, her own lived experience in the United States for nearly 60 years as an African American woman, and experiences as a Black psychologist informed the discussion. The biracial researcher's encounters with racism and IR in Europe and the US, as well as her arts education, also shaped the respectful discussions and led to a deeper understanding of the data. Clara Hill et al. (2005) suggest that researchers should report potential biases such as demographics or feelings and reactions to the topic as it may impact the data analysis. These types of discussions took place prior to and throughout the research process between the dissertation chair and the researcher to diminish researcher bias.

In Phase 2, discussions about the remaining artworks served as a strategy to determine further which paintings should be selected for the study. When there was high congruence between both rater's findings, artworks were selected for the dissertation. High congruence was defined as a close agreement in scale ratings of high emotional evocativeness (ratings of 7 or above) and agreement in themes as outlined in the Master Theme List. It was determined that themes 8 and 9 were most directly related to IR and that at least one of them was required for an artwork to be selected. The remaining themes were identified as strongly associated with IR, and that a range of these should be reflected in the final artworks chosen for analysis.

A two-tiered system was designed during Phase 2, which divided the works selected into two categories. Tier 1 artworks were those where there was both high congruence between the researcher and the chairperson in the intensity scale rating as well as in the identification of at least one of the direct IR themes (codes 8 or 9). These pieces were selected for inclusion for critical analysis. Tier 2 artworks were those where there was not strong congruence either in the intensity ratings or where only one rater identified direct IR themes. The consensus discussion

focused on Tier 2 works to discuss the rationale for ratings and resolve disagreement between the independent raters. As each artwork was discussed during the consensus process, the researcher gained a better understanding of IR and the different ways that it was expressed in the art reviewed. The consensus discussion resulted in a final selection of nine artworks to be critically analyzed by the researcher.

Author Reflexivity Statement

Documentation of my own subjectivities are included in this section with the aim of being transparent and to bring to light what my positionality is as it relates to IR and art created by Black artists (Barrett, et al., 2020; Finlay, 2002; Kleinasser, 2000; Mills, Durepos & Wiebe, 2012; Ng, et al., 2019; Palaganas, et al., 2017; Patnaik, 2013). My reflexivity is supported by critical thinking through journaling and increased awareness of myself in relation to the world as a cultural being with an arts education to facilitate multifaceted analysis. My extensive training in fine art during my master's program in the Netherlands has led to a professional identity that was shaped by well-known and African descended art professors, creation of art, exhibitions, art critics, readings about art, and viewing art exhibitions that had a significant impact on choosing the subject matter of this dissertation and will likely shape my viewpoints on artists selected for this research project. Making art and looking at a lot of art throughout the years provided me with a sense of self, and I now realize that my artwork offered a voice and sense of identity that have shaped who I am today. My emotional growth and experience around art are reflected in the research topic, as I am looking at emotionally evocative artworks that are related to IR. However, my awareness around this helps me step back and look at the data objectively. My art training provided me with insight into the delicate and necessary vacillation between objectivity and

subjectivity regarding how the outside world may interpret an artwork, which helped me remain objective when selecting artists for my dissertation.

My own historical experiences as a Black woman, who grew up in South Germany in a biracial home with a mother who identifies as Dutch and Caucasian and a father who identifies as Caribbean, Dutch and Black, also played a big part in the decision-making process when thinking about incorporating IR into the research. My father's and my own colonial history and family history of slavery in the Caribbean have led to a deep interest in racism, systemic oppression, and IR's development through trans generational transmission of trauma. The fact that my own artwork involved racial and autobiographical themes led to a desire to deepen my psychological understanding of these elements through research, which may influence how I interpret the literature around IR and art produced by Black artists. I grew up in a White, South-German neighborhood where my family was the only people of color. My own encounters with racism have played a pivotal role in guiding my view on social justice issues within my research, while I simultaneously remain aware of the position of privilege and power I inhabit within the role of a researcher and as an individual with higher education. Growing up amongst White people triggered a survival instinct in my family and me, which in retrospect led to rejecting parts of my Black heritage leading to IR. Increased awareness around these processes allowed me to resolve most issues involving my own IR due to life experiences and living amongst several different cultures across Europe and America. Current feelings of self-compassion due to these life struggles have led to an interest in researching IR and finding ways to alleviate symptoms related to it. I also want to remain aware that the voice of the art chosen in the research may be visually powerful and exceed the analytical viewpoints as it holds a meaning of its own. It may, therefore, be challenging to compare visual language to written language.

Feelings like anger, shame, and fear as they relate to IR may be evoked in me when selecting or viewing art for the research project.

Another point to take into account is the fact that I was not born in the U.S. and that my art education took place in Northern Europe where my knowledge of American art was somewhat limited to theory, even though I came in contact with American art occasionally, which may have an impact on my objective and subjective view on art produced by American artists. The fact that America was portrayed as the land of opportunity while growing up in Germany feels paradoxical in how I now critically analyze America through the IR literature and incorporating art created by Black artists whose work reflects IR. This friction may unconsciously surface during my research within different aspects of the process (e.g., seeing America as a cultural leader while gaining increased insight into the sociopolitical challenges and historical inequities). I am an insider in terms of being an artist, but an outsider as a non-American-born individual, which can be both beneficial and detrimental as it relates to subjectivity. From an outsider's perspective, I may want to learn more about American culture, but as an insider, I may assume knowledge in the realm of art. I nevertheless believe that my personal involvement, passion, and values with regard to the researched subject matter, will enhance the dissertation. It will not rely on personal data but rather will follow a methodological process that will guide the research in a way that will simultaneously allow to touch upon my subjectivities while not skewing the data. Individuals live in social, historical, and economic contexts, and I am aware that I am a person who navigates through life within those contexts. My understanding of these elements in my own life has shaped me as a person and will inevitably influence my research as buried emotions may surface. These emotions will have to be

understood, and a level of self-awareness has to guide the process to avoid excessive subjective judgment that can cloud the data.

Chapter 4: Results

This chapter presents the results of the processes used to select and analyze artworks by Black artists to inform psychological interventions. First, the selection process resulting in nine pieces of art from six Black artists will be described. Next, the analysis of each selected artwork will be described. The analysis was conducted utilizing a 4-stage system involving description, theme identification, analysis, and intervention implications.

Results of Artwork Selection Process

Nine paintings from an initial group of 26 artworks were selected for critical analysis using the methods described in the previous chapter. In the ratings of emotional intensity, scores ranged from the lowest score of 3 to the highest score of 10. The artworks not selected can be found in Appendix A, Table 3. These works were excluded based on congruence between raters in low scores on emotional evocativeness or agreement on a low frequency of IR themes. An overview of the nine paintings that were selected for the study is presented in Table 4. They are presented in order of the mean emotion ratings from lowest to highest. The meaning of the numeric theme codes appears at the bottom of the table.

Table 4

Overview of Selected Artworks

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
#1 - "From the Bush to the Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!"	Devin Troy Strother	Rater 1: 5 Rater 2: 4 Mean = 4.5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 9, 10, 11 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 8,	<i>Congruence:</i> Themes of Eurocentric values, idealization, negative racial identity and discrimination found

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
			9, 10, 11, 12, 13	<p>within the painting. Rater 1 stated that the painting emphasized how the White female figures in the painting may stand for a compromise on the Black figure's part as they are navigating a racist system and want to be accepted by White people. A discussion about IR and how it manifests differently in different people eventually led to congruence on theme 9 as it pertains to wanting to be accepted by White people. Both raters agreed that negative stereotyping could be seen within the cartoonish painting style of Black figures. Both raters gave a medium level score on emotional intensity as they agreed that the artwork did not</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>evoke high emotions in the viewer.</p> <p><i>Differences:</i> Rater 2 additionally endorsed themes 8, 12, and 13 as this rater argued that the basketball players are “not fully human” and therefore have limited self-expression. Theme 13 was endorsed based on intragroup dynamics as seen between the basketball players and the Black audience.</p>
#2 - “Supermodel”	Kerry James Marshall	Rater 1: 4 Rater 2: 5 Mean = 4.5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 5, 6, 9 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 6, 8, 9	<p><i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed that the painting visually touched upon notions of shame as well as Eurocentric values. The raters also agreed on the fact that although these themes strongly overlap with IR, the overall emotional evocativeness is low as the painting is very subtle and not very</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>expressive.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 endorsed the theme of sadness, which was later on accepted by rater one as the figure's size in relation to the frame was very small, rendering it lost on the canvas. For those reasons, rater 2 endorsed theme 8 as low self-esteem was expressed through the figure being almost nude and lacking any form of expression.</p>
#3 - "Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps"	Kehinde Wiley	Rater 1: 3 Rater 2: 7 Mean = 5	<p><i>Rater 1:</i> themes 1, 2</p> <p><i>Rater 2:</i> themes 1, 2, 9, 11</p>	<p><i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed on themes related to liberation and resistance as the main Black subject of the painting appeared heroic and ready to go to battle, and thus taking action in the face of oppression.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Initially rater one did not endorse theme 9, but through</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>discussions around the expression of power through a Eurocentric lens, the raters found congruence. Rater two also saw themes related to discrimination in the painting as the motive of sperm in the background of the painting was interpreted as a reference to the Black man's hyper sexuality", which is a negative stereotype. There was a significant discrepancy in emotional ratings between raters. Rater one did not experience the painting as emotionally evocative, while rater two did.</p>
#4 - "Grandma and the Frenchmen – Identity Crisis"	Robert Colescott	Rater 1: 8 Rater 2: 3 Mean = 5.5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 4, 5, 9, 11, 14 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 5, 6, 7, 8, 9,	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed upon themes 5, 9 and 14 as they both identified a sense of hopelessness, idealization of White people and how these

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
			14	<p>constructs can impact one's health.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> rater one identified two additional themes (i.e., 4 and 11) as this rater found that anger and dehumanizing aspects had been visualized. Rater two argued that themes 6, 7, and 8 were also present as shame, anxiety/fear and a sense of self-hate were depicted. No congruence was initially found on emotional evocativeness, but rater one brought forth compelling arguments as to why this painting is emotionally evocative based on the many ways in which it describes IR and racism. Rater 2 was in agreement after this discussion.</p>
#5 - "Ivy and the Janitor in	Nina Chanel Abney	Rater 1: 6-7 Rater 2: 5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 5,	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters found that themes related

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
January”		Mean = 5.75	6, 8, 9, 11, 13 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 6, 7, 8, 9	to shame, self-doubt and negative racial identification was present in the painting. There also seems to be congruence in the way they categorized its emotional evocativeness. <i>Difference:</i> the raters had divergent opinions on themes related to sadness and anxiety as expressed in the painting, but a discussion in how this was depicted in the artwork led to an agreement that both themes were present.
#6 - “A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self”	Kerry James Marshall	Rater 1: 4 Rater 2: 10 Mean = 7	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 8, 10, 11 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed that this artwork touched upon a notion of stereotyping and self-devaluation and that it showed dehumanizing aspects related to race. Rater 2 additionally found that the work also spoke about Colorism as

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>the skin-color was exaggerated, which reduced the figure to the color Black. This rater also saw themes related to shame and limited self-expression within the way the Black figure was painted.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 endorsed a low number on emotional evocativeness, while rater 2 gave it the highest score. Rater two explained that this high score was due to the way the artist showed a reductionist portrayal of Black people, devoid of identity, which was highly emotional to this rater.</p>
#7 - "Randaleeza"	Nina Chanel Abney	Rater 1: 9 Rater 2: 7 Mean = 8	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 4, 7, 8, 11, 13 <i>Rater 2:</i>	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters indicated that figures in this painting were depicted in ways that robbed them of their

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
			themes 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14	<p>humanity and that themes of fear/anxiety were visually expressed. They also agreed that dehumanization and intra racial class tensions played a role. Both raters endorsed high scores on emotional evocativeness due to these issues raised in the painting.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 endorsed an additional theme of anger, while rater one identified a sense of hopelessness and helplessness in the work.</p>
#8 - “Camptown Ladies” (detail)	Kara Walker	Rater 1: 7 Rater 2: 10 Mean = 8.5	<p><i>Rater 1:</i> themes 7, 8, 11, 17</p> <p><i>Rater 2:</i> themes 7, 8, 11, 12, 17</p>	<p><i>Congruence:</i> both raters were in agreement that anxiety/fear as well as being treated as “subhuman” and dehumanization played a major role in this artwork. They also found that the oppressed figure in the artwork was</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>objectified. Both raters endorsed high scores for emotional evocativeness due to the impactful racist messages within the work.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> rater 2 also found that theme 12 applied due to the oppressed figure's limited capacity to self-express.</p>
#9 - "Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original"	Robert Colescott	Rater 1: 7 Rater 2: 10 Mean = 8.5	<p><i>Rater 1:</i> themes 5, 8, 11, 18</p> <p><i>Rater 2:</i> themes 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 17</p>	<p><i>Congruence:</i> both raters identified themes of hopelessness and helplessness, as well as a sense of inferiority and dehumanization. They both rated the painting high on emotional evocativeness due to the fact that the central Black figure was nursing a large and older child of a White woman, while neglecting her own infants.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				additionally endorsed a theme that reflected nurturance and relational connection, while rater 2 found that the painting also depicted a sense of shame, humiliation, fear, emotional distancing, and exploitation.

Note. Summary of codes for themes: 1 = empowerment, resistance; 2 = liberation, freedom; 3 = invisibility, insignificance; 4 = anger, rage; 5 = sadness, hopelessness; 6 = shame, humiliation; 7 = anxiety, fear; 8 = feeling flawed, self-devaluation; 9 = Eurocentric; colorism, negative racial identification; 10 = stereotypes, caricature; 11 = dehumanization, perpetrator/victim; 12 = limited self-expression, isolation; 13 = intra-racial class tension; 14 = health and mental health consequences of racism; 15 = positive reconnection to racial group, racial pride. Note that the full Master Theme List was presented in Table 2.

Rater Congruence on Emotion

Two of the selected paintings had a mean emotion score of 4.5. These artworks were created by two different artists. The first painting with this score was made by Devin Troy Strother with the title *From the Bush to the Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!* There was congruence between the two raters (i.e., scores 4 and 5). The other painting with a score of 4.5 is created by Kerry James Marshall and named *Supermodel*. Both the dissertation chair and the researcher rated this painting on the lower spectrum (i.e., 5 and 4). Only one artwork received

a 3, which was *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps* by Kehinde Wiley. However, there was a large discrepancy between raters as this same painting received a score of 7 by the other rater, which leads to a mean of 5 for this particular art piece. The next artwork made by Robert Colescott is titled *Grandma and the Frenchmen – Identity Crisis*. It received a mean score of 5.5 on the level of emotional intensity. This score was comprised of two highly divergent scores (i.e., 3 and 8). Nina Chanel Abney's painting *Ivy and the Janitor in January* received a mean score of 5.75, with a small inter-rater discrepancy of 5 and 6-7. The artwork *A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self* by Kerry James Marshall received a mean score of 7 with a large discrepancy between scores (i.e., 10 and 4). One artwork received a mean score of 8, created by Nina Chanel Abney, and is titled *Randaleeza*. There was a small discrepancy between the rater's scores (i.e., 7 and 9), indicating congruence. The following two art pieces were rated high by the raters (i.e., 10 and 7), resulting in a mean score of 8.5. Kara Walker created the first one with the title *Camptown Ladies*, and Robert Colescott created the other artwork with that high mean score called *Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original*.

Rater Congruence on Internalized Racism Themes

All nine artworks were identified with themes 8, 9, or 10 (i.e., 8 = feeling flawed, self-devaluation; 9 = eurocentrism; colorism, negative racial identification; 10 = stereotypes, caricature) related to IR as described in the Master Theme List (see Table 2). In some instances, the raters agreed on the same themes, while in others, there was no or little congruence. The selected artworks are described in order from low to high theme congruence between raters. Of the six artists identified, no consensus was initially found for including any of Kehinde Wiley's works. After a more in-depth analysis of this artist's work and his ability to express themes of IR, it was determined that one of his works would be valuable to include due to its unique

expression of IR. One of the raters saw theme number 9 in Kehinde Wiley's *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps* as it represented Eurocentric values and touched upon an idealization of the majority group. The other rater did initially not endorse any numbers listed in the Master List for this painting. A discussion around the depiction of French royalty within the painting and the expression and focus on power found in the artwork led to an agreement between the raters and an understanding that theme number 9 can be found in this particular art piece.

Within the following six works, there was agreement on a single theme of IR. These works are Kara Walker's *Camptown Ladies*, Kerry James Marshall's *Self Portrait* and his other work named *Supermodel*, Nina Chanel Abney's *Randaleeza*, Robert Colescott's *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis* and his other work named *The Original*. The raters analyzed Kara Walker's work *Camptown Races* and discussed why both endorsed number 8 as an IR theme found in this work. The dissertation chair, as well as the researcher, stated that the depiction of a Black female figure who balances a jokey figure on her shoulders engenders thoughts and feelings related to exploitation and being treated as not fully human. This was further supported by the fact that the Black figure carrying the jockey served as a horse and was thus compared to an animal.

In the next painting created by Kerry James Marshall called *A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self*, the raters found congruence in one of the three mandatory themes of IR (i.e., theme number 10). One rater saw an association between themes 8 and 9 in addition to theme number 10, but both agreed that this artwork touched upon a notion of stereotyping and self-devaluation. One of the raters additionally found that the work also spoke about colorism as the skin-color was exaggerated, which reduced the figure to the color Black. Since the painting represents the artist's view of himself, one of the raters also thought that theme number 8 was

reflected in the artwork due to themes related to feeling flawed and not fully human, as evidenced in the caricature style painting style chosen. For another artwork made by Kerry James Marshall titled *Supermodel*, the independent raters agreed that theme number 9 was represented in the painting. One of the raters saw two additional themes within the work of art (i.e., 8 and 10). An agreement was found on theme number 9 relatively fast through a discussion. Both indicated that this painting strongly spoke about Eurocentric values, as evidenced by the figure's blond wig and body size. Theme number 8 was endorsed by one of the raters, as the figure was nearly nude and small compared to the painting's size. These features were related to themes such as low self-esteem and inferiority for this rater. Furthermore, this rater suggested that the painting brought up a notion of self-devaluation due to the figure being nearly nude as well as a "turning against Black people" as evidenced by her covering up her original hair with a blond wig.

Nina Chanel Abney's painting *Randaleeza* was discussed, and both raters agreed that theme number 10 was present in the artwork. One rater also endorsed themes number 8 and 9 as themes around "not feeling human" and "feeling flawed" were represented by showcasing the Black figure as half-animal, half-human. Additionally, a notion of envy and idealization of the majority group was recognized by this rater (i.e., theme number 9) as a Black police officer is standing in the background next to a White police officer while pointing at a Black female figure who appears to have a target on her abdomen. Theme number 10 was recognized by both raters as the Black police officer seems to be turning against Black people by siding with the majority group.

The independent raters agreed that theme number 9 was present in Robert Colescott's *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis* as it strongly spoke about notions of idealization

of White people as evidenced by the many interracial couples represented in the painting and the fact that some figures appeared to have blond hair while having phenotypical Black facial features. Additionally, both raters agreed that the painting seemed to touch upon a negative racial identity. Several figures in the painting appeared to lean towards siding with White people and feeling discomfort within their own Black skin. One of the raters also saw theme number 8 reflected within this art piece as it visually expressed themes of self-hate and self-doubt as shown in the Black figure with the saw in her head and the figure representing the grandma who has a partial Black and White face. This rater also endorsed theme number ten, as many figures seemed to “turn against their own racial heritage” (i.e., the Black figure).

Another work by Robert Colescott titled *Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original* was analyzed by both raters, and a consensus was found when agreeing that theme number 10 was represented in the painting. A discussion about self-devaluation and turning against one’s own race corroborated this rating. This was explicitly reflected in how the Black nursing figure appears to side with the White woman depicted in the painting, which is further exacerbated by the Black figure’s dress code that reminds of American luxury and fashion. One of the raters additionally endorsed theme number 8 to this piece of art as themes of low self-esteem and not being “fully human” was evident in that the Black figure appears to debase herself by feeding the older child of a White woman while neglecting her own infant.

In the next work, the independent raters found congruence in two divergent themes. Devin Troy Strother’s painting titled *From the Bush to Court, alright now, Niggas say Cheese!* visually represents themes 10 and 9 as it strongly speaks to negative stereotyping as evidenced by the cartoonish and exaggerated Black facial features depicted in the background showing a large crowd of Black spectators of a basketball team. The Eurocentric values, idealization of

White people, and negative racial identity, as outlined in theme number 9, seem most apparent in how the tall basketball players are proudly standing next to White females and performing in front of a White cameraman and White owners of the basketball team. One rater additionally endorsed theme number 8 as the basketball players are performing in front of a camera while blending in entirely into a sea of Black people, which is suggestive of being not fully human.

The painting with the highest congruence rate was Nina Chanel Abney's work titled *Ivy and the Janitor in January*. Both raters endorsed all three themes to this piece of work (i.e., 8, 9, and 10). A discussion around notions of stereotyping, colorism, and self-doubt unfolded as the painting showcases different skin tones on figures as well as on masks held up, suggesting the idea of racial identity confusion. The visual introduction of masks further supports the notion of the desire to cut off one's racial heritage and the safety found in hiding behind a White façade.

Description and Analysis of Individual Artworks created by Black Artists

Approach to Critical Analysis

The author utilized a four-stage process to conduct a critical analysis of each artwork selected (see Table 5). The first stage, *Description and Evoked Emotion*, involved the identification of emotional reaction to the artwork, including racially-themed content and its impact on the Black viewer. The second stage, *Internalized Racism Themes*, identifies themes related to IR and how they are visually represented in the artwork. Stage three, *Integrative Analysis*, constructs an in-depth analysis of the piece of art and its relation to IR. Stage four, *Implications for Healing and Interventions*, presents an analysis of each artwork's potential for healing from IR and how these pieces of art may be used in a therapeutic setting. The remainder of this chapter will present the results of this four-stage process for each artwork, by intensity of emotion as outlined in table 4.

Table 5*4-Stage Approach to Critical Analysis of Artworks*

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion	Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes	Stage 3: Integrative Analysis	Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identify primary and initial characteristics of the painting that evoke a strong impression - Identify emotional reaction - Identify racially themed content and how it affects the viewer when first confronted with the painting. 	Using the Master Theme List, identify and describe internalized racism themes in relationship to the painting	Construct an analysis of the painting informed by the painting's characteristics, what they evoke emotionally, and the associated IR themes	Describe implications for use in psychological intervention; potential healing processes that could emerge from using the painting in therapeutic or community interventions.

Figure 1

From the Bush to Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!



Note. From “From the bush to court, alright now, ya’ll niggas say cheese!”, by D. T. Strother, 2013 (<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Devin%20Troy%20Strother>). Copyright 2013 by Devin Troy Strother. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 1)

This piece of art made by Devin Troy Strother evokes a variety of emotions, including anger, due to themes revolving around negative stereotyping and invisibility. The Black basketball players are depicted in a cartoonish way, which appears reductionist as Black facial features are exaggerated and seem to blend into the background audience comprised of Black basketball fans. It can feel infuriating to look at the way Black figures are objectified within this art piece, especially for the Black viewer who is aware of American history and ways in which Black people have been exploited for centuries. Nothing distinguishes the Black basketball

players from one another besides a jersey number or color, and nothing sets people in the audience apart from one another, which further fuels feelings of anger as this portrayal can be seen as an accurate reflection of the majority group's view on Black communities and people. When people are reduced to a stereotype, it limits their self-expression, which has been well documented within Strother's piece of art. The line up of athletes almost reminds of products in a supermarket and emphasizes that they are for sale. This is further supported by the two smaller White men in the bottom center who are likely the team owners, who seem to wave joyously at the camera, as to say that they are happy with the profit made. This brings up feelings of disgust and raw anger as it reminds of times when Black people did not own their own bodies and were sold as slaves to White people who would greatly profit from their labor. The fact that there are two White female figures placed between the basketball players can potentially evoke a variety of feelings such as envy, anger, or sadness, particularly because it seems as if the basketball players lend a sense of power from being seen with White women. One crucial aspect of IR is the desire to distance oneself from one's own identity as a Black individual. One way of doing so is by aligning with what is understood and internalized as powerful. In this case, these are the White figures representing systems of power such as the team owners, the media, and the White cheerleaders who are symbols of beauty in this piece of art. Furthermore, the artwork brings up the phenomena of sexism and gendered racism, as cheerleaders seem to fulfill one role, which is based upon sexuality and entertainment. Anger may be evoked, particularly in the Black female viewer as they play the least important role within the group on stage. They are objectified and rendered virtually invisible compared the male Black athletes on stage.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 1)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include self-hate, feeling flawed, inferiority, low self-esteem, self-devaluation, idealization of White people, Eurocentrism, negative racial identity, turning against own people, stereotypes, caricature, cartoonish, limited portrayal, exaggeration of features, portrayal of racism, observation of racist acts, dehumanization, subordination, hierarchy, limited self-expression, intragroup dynamic, intraracial class tension objectification, and exploitation. The idea of self-hate is portrayed through the athlete's need for being seen with powerful White figures. Eurocentrism is depicted by the way the basketball players are turning their backs towards the Black audience while aligning with White people. A caricature painting style can be observed in the many exaggerated Black facial features throughout the painting (e.g., red lips and eye White), rendering the Black figure limited in their ability to self-express. Racism is visually expressed through the imbalance between the number of White people versus Black people in the painting, as it emphasizes that oppression is maintained through privilege and power (e.g., owning the media), not through numbers of people. The theme of subordination can be seen within the Black basketball players being objectified and subordinate to the White people in power (e.g., standing in a perfect line for the camera). Limited self-expression has been depicted by emphasizing the way White figures have the ability to express themselves, while Black figures blend into the background. Intra-racial class tension is portrayed through the basketball player's wish for separation from the Black audience. The theme of objectification can be seen when looking at the cartoonish painting style and how Black athletes are lined up like trophies.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 1)

The themes identified above emphasize the dynamics of exploitation and the ways that IR operates to promote collusion with racist treatment.

Self-Hate/Feeling Flawed/Inferiority/Low Self-Esteem/Self-Devaluation. This artwork by Devin Troy Strother touches upon themes of self-hate and how this feeling may be closely related to feeling flawed and having low self-esteem. The way in which he places the Black basketball figures next to White women speaks about the desire to be seen with powerful people. The fact that this is filmed by a White camera crew, as seen in the left bottom part of the painting, may further speak about notions of low self-esteem as the athletes seem to depend on the support of White people in order to feel successful. It appears as if the basketball figures feel flawed and are only visible to others because they stand next to White women. Without them, they are literally blending into the background, which does not allow them to have any sort of individuality. Their value is contingent on what the two White men, who appear to be the owners of the basketball team, think of them. This lack of value is further expressed by placing a camera crew into the scene, which not only gives it a voyeuristic feel but also speaks about the fact that White people rule media and that they determine how Black people will be portrayed. All of these clear power differentials depicted in this piece of art bring up the theme of inferiority, which is exacerbated through the cartoonish way in which the Black body is painted.

Idealization of White People/Eurocentrism/Negative Racial Identity/Turning Against own People. It is hard to discern which head belongs to the basketball players and which belongs to the audience in the background as Strother made them blend together. However, when focusing closer, one can see that the athletes are smiling, much like the Black audience is as well. This happy facial expression and the fact that the players seem to align with

White power bring up themes of Eurocentrism and idealization of White people. The players may even turn against their own racial heritage as they are blending in with their Black audience, but yet feel distinctly different. This difference is marked by them being in contact with seemingly successful and influential White people, while the Black audience does not seem to have this level of importance. This leads to the belief that the Black basketball players may reject their own racial identity to feel successful and visible. There appear to be two Black females on stage, next to the basketball players. They are hard to find on the busy canvas and blend in even more than any other figure. It seems as if they want to align with power and vicariously live through the basketball player's achievements. However, their White counterparts are doing the same as they do; it seems that the Black women's motive is different from that of the White women on stage. They may want to separate themselves from the Black audience to gain some visibility. Ironically, they have been depicted as invisible, which may be the very thing they don't want to be.

Stereotypes/Caricature/Cartoonish/Limited Portrayal/Exaggeration of Features. Strother's painting style is overall cartoonish, but he emphasized this style when depicting Black individuals in this piece of art. The caricature style is mostly seen in the many red-lipped smiles that are accompanied by cartoonish eyes when painting Black figures. There are no facial features other than these two facial features, which reduce the Black figure to a cartoon and does not allow for any form of self-expression. The White figures do not seem to have these exaggerated facial features, which lends them more of a personality compared to the Black figures. The artwork also touches upon negative stereotypes through the reductionist depiction of Black individuals and emphasizes the fact that Black individuals are only given

attention by the media or White people as a whole if they fulfill a stereotype, such as being an athlete.

Portrayal of Racism/Observation of Racist Acts/Dehumanization. This piece of art shows how racism exists even if Black people by far outnumber White people. The work mostly emphasizes how oppressive systems are maintained through power. This notion of power was visualized through showcasing the power of media owned by White people and that the two male White figures in the center seem to own the basketball team. These figures are much smaller compared to the basketball players who tower over them, but size and number do not matter, as oppression is maintained through privilege and access to financial resources as well as through control over the media. Although these racist acts are captured on film, as seen in this artwork, it goes largely unseen by the general public as they feel comfort in seeing the Black body in familiar spaces, such as sports. The fact that the Black athletes only seem to serve as some form of entertainment and are posing in front of their White owners is highly dehumanizing and debasing.

Subordination/Hierarchy. The IR literature explores how concepts like meritocracy and hegemony can obscure oppression as they both suggest that advancements and opportunities for a group of people are based on achievements and skills, supporting cultural myths that racial disparities in hiring or school admission are solely based on objective standards and applied equally to all (Pyke, 2010). This piece of art addresses this by making a slight distinction between the Black basketball players and their Black audience. The only thing that sets them apart are their jerseys and the size of their bodies. Their faces blend into the background with the audience. This is a beautiful depiction of unequal distribution of power and how the myth of equality for all is readily accepted by those who hold power and at times internalized as the truth

by those who are holding on to a façade of success and achievement. This façade can only remain in place if the oppressed either are unaware of their IR or consciously choose to distinguish themselves from their own racial heritage to reap the benefits of aligning with power and gaining a false sense of safety. In either case, the oppressed group, in this case, the Black figures in the painting, have to be submissive and not struggle back or bring attention to this racist act.

Limited Self-Expression. The Black figures in this artwork cannot express themselves fully, as evidenced by their cartoonish exaggerated features, but also by them being stuck in their limited roles as athletes or as paying audience. This becomes even clearer when looking at the way White people are depicted in this work. They seem to have space for self-expression as evidenced by their artistic outlet (i.e., filming), financial advantage (i.e., owning the basketball team), or being able to dance on stage in a loud fashion-forward outfit. There are two Black women on stage with them, but their expression seems limited, as evidenced by them mostly blending into the background, and the viewer can only see them after close inspection of the painting.

Intragroup Dynamic/Intraracial Class Tension. Although the Black figures seem to blend into the background of a Black audience, there still seems to be a significant distinguishing factor between them, and this difference is mainly based on power. The athletes seem to gain some attention and possibly have financial advantage over their Black audience. These differences likely lead to intraracial class tension, which is often related to IR as marginalized people try to escape their oppressor by aligning with those who are in power. This notion of power, as depicted in the basketball players in this artwork, leads to privilege, even if they have

to place values on those of their own racial group and even if this means that they will have to reject this group.

Objectification/Exploitation. Although objectification and exploitation are quite different from one another within their definition, it is important to note that they seem closely connected in this piece of work. The Black figures have been reduced and degraded to the status of a mere object by depicting in a cartoonish way. This reduction and degradation is the pathway to exploitation because if a human has been deemed an object, it legitimizes exploitation. Exploitation comes up in this painting when looking at the way Strother emphasizes power differentials and ways in which Black people are taken advantage of. The White figures in the painting all seem to benefit from the way systems have been set up. In this instance, the White men in the front have financial gain as the team owners, and the White camera crew owns the rights to their footage and thus controls the media. The White dancers gain popularity and money through aligning with famous and rich Black athletes while being able to self-express.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 1)

This piece of art may have potential for healing for the Black viewer who struggles with IR, in that it clearly addresses notions of IR and racism. There is a collective pain that is shared amongst Black people, as race-based trauma has been passed on from generation to generation. Thus, looking at this painting may help recognize that coming together as Black people may be more helpful to them than keeping distance from one another or trying to compete with one another. Awareness around intraracial class tension may first be painful, but over time may help the Black viewer feel empowered when they want to align with their own racial group. The artwork elicits feelings of anger due to the cartoonish way the Black figure is portrayed but also because it seems as if the athletes are for sale. This may bring up thoughts related to slavery and

how White people have owned Black people for centuries. This anger can be healing, especially for the Black person with IR, as it may bring awareness to structural oppressive systems and how their allegiance to White people helps maintain these power structures, which ultimately keeps them oppressed. Furthermore, critical consciousness may help the Black viewer become aware, motivated, and finally able to take action against oppression as an antidote to racism. Healing may also occur through affirmation and through resonating with the experience of being exploited (i.e., no longer having to endure these feelings in isolation). The fact that the work emphasizes limitations to self-expression for the Black figures may help them get in touch with their active, rather than inactive, side, which may help them stand up to oppression and express their opinions. Thus, the subjects raised in this piece of work may engender an in-depth inward look and sense of self-exploration by the Black viewer, which can be the beginning of the healing process for Black people who struggle with IR.

Result summary of Figure 1

This piece of art utilizes a cartoonish painting style, which portrays Black individuals in a reductionist manner. Nothing distinguishes the line up of Black basketball players from one another besides the number on their jerseys, which degrades them to the status of a mere object. However, the lack of distinction between the fans and the athletes also emphasizes the shared experience of Blackness despite differences in wealth and fame. It speaks to the fact that racism affects all Black people, regardless of power and status. The Black figures don't seem to have any form of self-expression, which stands in stark contrast to how White figures are depicted in this painting. Their form of self-expression becomes evident in their artistic outlet (i.e., filming), financial advantage (i.e., owning the basketball team), or being able to dance on stage. The artwork may have potential for healing in that the Black viewer may become more aware of

intraracial class tensions (i.e., the power differential between the successful Black athletes and their Black audience). The fact that the Black athletes seem to be taken advantage of in this painting raises questions around themes of exploitation, which can be helpful for the Black viewer struggling with IR as it offers a new perspective to them.

Figure 2

Supermodel



Note. From “Supermodel”, by K. J. Marshall, 2000

(<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Kerry%20James%20Marshall>).

Copyright 2000 by Kerry James Marshall. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 2)

The painting *Supermodel* by Kerry James Marshall, addresses notions of beauty and the imperfections that go along with societal definitions of attractiveness. However, the fact that the Black female figure in the painting covers her hair with a blond wig may suggest shame about one's Blackness, as it imposes Eurocentric ideals of beauty. The fact that there is an artificiality to her, rather than authenticity, is sad and reinforces ideas around enhanced beauty that are introjected by the White majority group and adopted by society at large, particularly among those who suffer from IR. The Black figure appears to blend into the Black background, rendering her invisible, as if to say that she is not important or worth looking at. Furthermore, she lacks expression, which adds to her sense of insignificance and brings up sadness and hopelessness in the Black viewer. The only visible elements are sexualizing the figure (e.g., undergarments) or robbing the figure of her racial identity by emphasizing the blond wig. The dynamics of sexism and gendered racism are apparent in this artwork. The entire piece of art appears fragile due to the figure's size compared to the frame around her, and because the painting style is very subdued. This fragility can be particularly angering to the Black female viewer, as Black women have faced many disparities due to structural racism and have not been afforded a lifestyle that allows for fragility. While the Black female has been wrongly portrayed in White America as impervious to pain, this depiction seems to take it in the opposite direction. This is important in that the Black female does not want to be portrayed as a fragile sex object as it does not do justice to her struggles and willingness to face them day-by-day. Overall, there is a significant discrepancy between the theme of sexuality and the figure's inability to express it in an emotive manner.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 2)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include Eurocentrism, idealization, inferiority, self-devaluation, low self-esteem, shame, limited self-expression, withdrawal, and isolation. The theme of Eurocentrism is most strongly depicted in the way Kerry James Marshall placed a blond wig onto the Black figure, suggesting a desire to adopt Eurocentric beauty standards while rejecting her Black features. Low self-esteem can be observed when looking at the way the Black female figure blends into the Black background. The theme of shame has been visualized through the Black figure wearing a blond wig, attempting to hide behind a façade of White people's values. The figure is nearly transparent, small, and alone on the canvas, which brings up the theme of isolation.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 2)

The themes identified above focus on how IR relates to notions of shame and the desire to reject one's own racial heritage.

Eurocentrism/Idealization. This painting by Kerry James Marshall titled *Supermodel* addresses IR in a couple of ways, including the depiction of a Black female that covers her hair with a blond wig. Research explored how Eurocentric notions of physical attractiveness have impacted Black individuals and how it has led to a tendency to reject phenotypically Black features and adopt White ones instead (Parmer et al., 2004). This has historically been achieved through altering hair, using skin-bleaching products, and receiving cosmetic surgery (Kaw, 1993; Jones, 2000; Hall, 2005). This piece of art strongly speaks to the desire to be accepted by the White majority group and how Black females feel compelled to alter their phenotypically Black features to closely mimic those of White individuals. This is further emphasized by the way the figure seems to offer herself through her sexuality as if to say that acceptance comes at the cost

of self-dignity. Furthermore, the figure appears to be slender and tall, which reminds of non-negotiable European beauty standards that everyone has to adhere to, especially the female.

Inferiority/Self-Devaluation/Low Self-Esteem. The female figure in Kerry James Marshall's painting is rather small in comparison to the frame surrounding her. Additionally, the fact that the figure is nearly nude addresses notions of low self-esteem and a lack of value in oneself. Furthermore, Marshall pronounces the figure's clothing and her wig, which emphasizes the fact that the rest of her body seems insignificant and blurs into the background. This sense of fading away and being invisible also speaks to low self-esteem, which has been associated with IR in several studies (Belgrave et al., 1994; Brooks, 1996; Cross, 1991; Jacobs & Bowles, 1988; Vandiver, et al., 2002). Kerry James Marshall stated in one of his lectures that he is interested in rooting his paintings in the reality we live in (Museum of Contemporary Art Chicago, 2016). In this particular case, the reality addressed in this artwork is rooted in structural racism leading to IR, which is reflected in the female figure who tries to adhere to Eurocentric values of beauty due to societal pressures and introjects.

Shame. Shame seems to be mostly visualized through Marshall, letting the Black figure blend into the background and by emphasizing the blond wig over the rest of the female figure. This leads to believe that the female has a reason to hide something and that she cannot be seen in broad daylight showing off the beauty of her authentic Black self. The lack of self-expression within the figure further emphasizes the absence of confidence and her attempt to camouflage her feeling flawed by restricting herself from being human.

Limited Self-Expression/Withdrawal/Isolation. The Black figure in the painting seems to have limitations to her self-expression, as evidenced by her inhibited and controlled look. Additionally, themes of withdrawal and isolation come up when viewing the artwork as the

figure appears to cut off from the world around her, which leaves her disconnected from the things that are healthy for her and that could connect her to her authentic self. The figure is small and has a transparent feel to it, which further makes it look as if it wants to withdraw from the world around it. The fact that the figure is surrounded by nothing at all and just placed on a Black background strongly touches on feelings of isolation that are typically found in individuals who have abandoned their Black community and joined the majority group. When doing so, Black people may realize that they are not fully accepted by the White community and therefore have no social connections to either one. The figure is standing entirely still and reminds of a mannequin without any expression. The only thing expressed and even obvious is the blond wig and the undergarments she is wearing.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 2)

This painting may have potential for healing Black individuals who suffer from IR as it clearly addresses the negative impacts IR can have on Black people. It may feel liberating to the viewer to imagine how the Black female in the painting may feel if she freed herself of the blond wig and revealed her own hair in its fullness or if the figure were to be placed on a light background rather than blending into the background. The level of awareness within the Black viewer regarding his or her IR would determine their ability to see a need for the Black figure in the painting to free herself from her constraints and societal introjects. If the viewer is able to recognize ways in which they identify with the Black female figure in the artwork rejecting parts of herself, they could potentially move into understanding how this is manifested in their own life. The literature describes this process as a form of self-development and states that a person's sense of agency can aid in becoming more flexible (Freire, 2000). This flexibility can help Black people with IR reconnect with their community rather than align with White people to seek their

approval. Research indicates that there seems to be a significant amount of variability in the way IR is manifested in different groups as some individuals may accept their inferior status, others may have some knowledge of the group they belong to and its value, while again others may require psychological processes leading to self-affirmation (Jost & Banaji, 1992). Thus, the Black viewer may react to this painting in different ways, depending on how he or she has moved through the process of becoming conscious about their IR. Feeling a sense of safety and connection with other Black individuals would also counteract feelings of isolation, the tendency to withdraw from what is healthy for oneself, and having a limited capacity for self-expression, all of which are visually expressed within this painting. Thus, the Black viewer struggling with IR may recognize how much they have isolated themselves from other Black people and how this has added to them feeling numb to their emotions. The viewer would have to become aware of how they have added to the imbalance of power and how they can redress the balance of power by freeing themselves from their dependence on White people and their values.

Result Summary of Figure 2

This painting addresses notions of beauty and the societal definitions and elevation of Eurocentric attractiveness (e.g., blond hair, model-like figure). The viewer is immediately drawn toward the introjected White majority group's values and artificiality of the blond wig and a sense of fragility within the sexualized figure. The parts in line with her true self blend into the background, indicating a sense of invisibility and loss of identity, and a general lack of unimportance. This painting may have potential for healing in that it may be recognized that the figure is rejecting her own racial heritage in hopes of aligning and being accepted by the White majority group. In this process, the figure seems to have lost self-expression and seems without support, as she is isolated on a large canvas.

Figure 3*Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps*

Note. From “Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps”, by K. Wiley, 2005

(<https://www.brooklynmuseum.org/opencollection/search?keyword=Napoleon+Leading+the+Army+over+the+Alps>). Copyright 2005 by Kehinde Wiley. Reprinted with Permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 3)

Kehinde Wiley's painting *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps* is compelling and evokes emotions and thoughts around power and empowerment as well as racial pride, liberation, and freedom, which at first glance may bring about feelings of delight, especially in the Black viewer. However, upon closer inspection, it may also elicit responses of surprise and curiosity, as it is a multi-layered painting with several embedded messages and symbols. The felt

difference between the contemporary clothed Black male and the title of the work, which identifies the subject as a royal nineteenth-century European figure, draws attention to the historical inaccuracy while simultaneously fostering a sense of empowerment to the Black viewer. The figure has appropriated the power from European royalty, which appears to make him impervious to racist attacks. However, the very fact that the Black figure in the painting is taking on Eurocentric values and seems to be eager to assert power can also remind the Black viewer of IR as it appears that the figure on the horse needs to lend its power from historic European events rather than aligning with Afrocentric values. As the artist replaced the original Napoleon figure with an unknown heroic Black man, it raises questions about race and gender roles in the past and in contemporary times. The painting lends power to the Black viewer by depicting a Black individual who is a leader and active agent of his own change rather than an oppressed being. The Black viewer may also feel empowered by this painting because society frequently positions them in a way that robs them of their control, and the Black individual is often relegated to those in power. Thus seeing a portrayal of power can feel empowering and liberating. Contrary to these positive interpretations, the work may also bring up feelings of anger as the heroic Black man may also be interpreted as violent and impulsive, confirming the majority group's negative stereotype. IN the details of this very large painting, one can see the visual representation of sperm all over the canvas's background. This may evoke outrage as the Black man has been portrayed as hypersexual (Miller, 2019), which categorized them as dangerous to the rest of society, a stereotype they rightfully reject.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 3)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include power, empowerment, Eurocentrism, direct racism, freedom, and liberation. The theme of empowerment is most

strongly depicted through Kehinde Wiley's depiction of an African American warrior, recasting Napoleon, while reclaiming the power taken away from Black people of the centuries. The painting adopts several European elements (e.g., painting style, napoleon as a theme, fleur-de-lis), which emphasizes Eurocentric values, even if cast in a critical way. Direct racism has been depicted through the portrayal of a Black soldier, reminding of a racist military history when Black soldiers were excluded from being celebrated as heroes. Freedom is expressed through depicting the Black figure in camouflage gear and by emphasizing a sense of heroism and determination within his body language and facial features.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 3)

The themes identified above emphasize the construct of empowerment and how a sense of racial pride can combat symptoms related to IR.

Power and Empowerment. In this painting, Kehinde Wiley utilizes traditional and European conventions of portrait painting as a way of comparing the Black figure to Napoleon Bonaparte. By doing so, he emphasizes the neglect of the Black subjects in paintings while simultaneously reassigning value to the sitter and exploring ways in which the viewer can recall remarkable Black leaders who typically do not get the same type of recognition. This awareness can lead to a sense of racial pride. Furthermore, this disregard has a negative effect on Black people's lives, as the lack of images of Black subjects who are in a position of power and who have confidence can lead to difficulties in imagining ever seeing oneself in that role. (Mosaka, 2015). By recasting Napoleon as an African American warrior dressed in camouflage, he touches upon ideas of power and empowerment as found in familiar stories drawn from European history. The fact that Kehinde Wiley is retelling the story and offering power to the Black figure allows the viewer to think about hierarchical structures and concepts of meritocracy and

hegemony. The psychological literature of IR explains how the dominant social group bases these concepts on achievements, skills, and leadership or dominance. Society has accepted these concepts as a truth, which further perpetuates internalization of racism without ever being noticed (Pyke, 2010). This painting loudly speaks of the dominance of White power and achievement as evidenced by utilizing a powerful royal figure like Napoleon on a horse ready to go to battle and by placing the Black Napoleon against an ornate backdrop referencing the fleur-de-lis. While the Black figure's heroic stance represents power, it also reminds of cultural myths that everyone can achieve things in life and obtain equal recognition (Pyke, 2010). This is a false belief, as it assumes that everyone has access to the same resources that can lead to achievements and power. IR is partially born out of the oppressed individual's desire to be seen as powerful and well accomplished and the need to cut off parts that remind of the opposite and are internalized as weak. Wiley also visually expresses notions of power by introducing the fleur-de-lis, as it has been used to represent French royalty. Additionally, Wiley's use of this patterned backdrop not only speaks of power but also of a battle. The fleur-de-lis was a symbol of physical combat and was sewn into a knight's surcoat as a form of protection in the 14th century. Thus, the term *coat of arms*. However, the fleur-de-lis later developed into a symbol of social status (Fleur-de-lis Designs, 2020). Additionally, it was used as a mark of supremacy and a symbol of possession and ownership of a slave's body within the Southern states of the U.S. The symbol was burned into a slave's shoulder if he or she tried to escape. A Black overseer performed this inhumane punishment under the watchful eye of a White overseer (Fine Art America, 2014). Through visually emphasizing these aspects, Wiley's work speaks about the negotiations of power structures, White supremacy and racial realities, and the need for Black people to go into battle to obtain power. His use of symbolism in this painting is a complex intersect between

historical and contemporary symbols of power. He equipped his figure with clothing items that are recognized by a large number of people and emphasize material goods, such as Timberland shoes. While the figure's clothing appears to be associated with combat, the fleur-de-lis background covers both notions of wealth and status while simultaneously speaking about combat. IR is rooted in issues of self-esteem, and it seems that this painting addresses this by visually expressing how one can gain power through wealth and how material goods are associated with self-esteem.

Eurocentrism. While this painting appears to turn racial power structures upside down, it also touches upon the complexity found within a racialized society's construct of power. The very fact that the Black figure in the painting is seeking power and is borrowing it from European royalty speaks about Eurocentric values and notions of attractiveness related to European esthetics. While the painting can be understood as a form of resistance against powerful White systems, it can also be interpreted as idealizing European royal power. Wiley seems to utilize the power of contrasting the Black figure with Eurocentric symbolism that has been passed on from generation to generation within White societal circles and adopted by all people as the truth. When these Eurocentric values are celebrated and adopted by the Black community as their own, their racial identification is at risk, which may lead to becoming an agent of their own oppression. There is a possibility that this can lead to intraracial class tension as a result of IR (Parmer et al., 2004). Therefore, it is essential to understand with whom the Black rider on the horse is going to battle and what his racial identification is to determine whether he sides with Black people or oppressive systems. The viewer can fill in this narrative depending on their own position regarding their racial identification and understanding of oppressive systems.

Direct Racism. Kehinde Wiley's refreshing portrayal of a Black soldier as a hero touches upon a racist history within the armed forces that has excluded Black soldiers from being celebrated as heroes. Regarding World War II, knowledgeable individuals stated that the army or ranking officers within the chain of command had, for racist motives, prohibited certain Black soldiers from receiving Medals of Honor (Kaye, 1999). Kehinde Wiley uses a visual representation of sperm motifs in this painting, hinting at notions of masculinity and gender. Studies analyzing the phenomenon of hypersexuality stereotyping of Black men found that this negative view of Black men is associated with structural racism (Miller, 2019). Intersecting identities such as male gender, military culture, and African American heritage, as expressed in this painting, further contribute to the skewed and stereotyped view of Black men leading to presumptions about their hypersexuality and violent behaviors. Although Wiley's use of sperm motifs can also be interpreted as a hope for a better future in which strong Black men rule the world, it simultaneously touches upon stereotypes such as the impulsive, violent, hypersexual Black male. Additionally, this depiction of masculinity strongly addresses stereotypical gender roles, as evidenced by the rider's clothing, the sperm motifs in the background and the emphasis on physical power and heroism, which is more commonly attributed to the male gender. This representation of the Black virile male who exudes strength, vigor and energy might be particularly challenging to the Black female viewer who may not always experience these qualities as positive.

Freedom/Liberation. The IR literature speaks about liberation as a core necessity to combating IR and racism and how it leads to a sense of empowerment. The figure in this painting appears to transform oppressive social structures by going into battle and having a clear aim, as evidenced by his finger pointing in a direction. His readiness to fight is further supported by his

camouflage pants, bandana, and is also reflected in his determined facial expression. Freedom is closely intertwined with independence. The Black rider on the horse is redressing the balance of power by striving for equality, rights, and equity (Mosaka, 2015) by taking action and standing up for his rights and the rights of other Black individuals. Thus, the notion of liberation is expressed in this piece of art, as evidenced by taking on hierarchical and oppressive systems rather than remaining inactive.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 3)

This painting seems to have several healing components for Black people who struggle with IR. If we assume that the Black rider in the painting is siding with the Black community and is going to battle for them, it could engender a sense of racial pride through identification with the heroic Black figure. Since there is such an emphasis on the Black figure in this piece of art, it may engender thoughts around leadership and bravery, which may help the Black viewer recall other Black leaders in their lives who served as role models and were supportive, which in turn can elicit hope. It may help remind the viewer of the fact that the Black figure is typically avoided in paintings or art in general and that power and privilege are frequently equated to Whiteness. This realization may be therapeutic as it may jolt the Black viewers into action, propelled by their own desire to be seen and heard. The depiction of the Black figure in this painting is an embodiment of confidence, which can increase self-esteem in Black people with IR as they may imagine themselves in the rider's position. The very fact that Black figures are underrepresented in artworks and that Kehinde Wiley emphasizes Blackness in this painting is likely empowering to the viewer who belongs to this group. The notion of heroism is strongly depicted in this artwork, which can be healing to the Black viewer. This is particularly true because Black individuals encounter racism on a daily basis, which is depleting, but standing up

against it demonstrates bravery and resilience. Looking at a Black man, who is depicted as a hero, may help tap into long-forgotten feelings of pride and resiliencies in the Black viewer. As this art piece touches upon the idea of resistance against oppressive systems, it can be helpful to the Black viewer, as it may lend them a sense of control and agency over their lives, and it may also offer them access to an authentic voice that has been repressed for years. As evidenced by the use of color, symbolism, size, and content, the loudness of the painting speaks about demanding respect from the public, which can be very empowering to those who have been robbed of respect for centuries. The literature around IR and liberation psychology states that the liberation process is not smooth, but rather asks individuals for their willingness to wrestle and reflect on their process as systems of oppression want you to act in one way (e.g., submissive), while the newly liberated person wants to act in different ways. This painting clearly speaks to this struggle of the newly liberated person, who is tired of being submissive and is struggling back while clothed in combat gear, which indicates that he is not willing to give up easily. There is a high likelihood that this painting can increase self-esteem in the viewer who struggles with IR, and increased self-esteem was found to be a protective factor for IR and depression (Burkley & Blanton, 2008; James, 2017; Kim, et al., 2012). Furthermore, the fact that the central figure is Black can increase feelings of self-worth in Black people, as holding oneself in high regard is intertwined with the identification of skin color (Hurst, 2015). In the event that the painting is interpreted as a reflection of Eurocentrism by the Black viewer, it can still have potential healing properties as awareness of racial hierarchies and recognition of how IR manifests in other Black people can help this viewer understand in which ways he or she aligns with power in order to be accepted by the majority group.

Result Summary of Figure 3

This painting addresses notions of power and empowerment, as well as racial pride, liberation, and freedom. By inserting a Black figure within an environment that was originally inhabited by European royalty, Kehinde Wiley not only touches upon historical inaccuracy but simultaneously appropriates the power from European royalty. The image celebrates liberation and heroism by showing a Black figure that seems determined and ready for battle. History shows there have been many Black heroes in the armed forces who have not received the recognition they should have due to racist motives. This may help Black individuals with IR by engendering thoughts of leadership, strength, and bravery. On the other hand, the Black viewer may also react in anger as it could suggest that power needs to resemble the Eurocentric ideal, which has been historically presented.

Figure 4

Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis



Note. From “Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis”, by R. Colescott, 1990
(<https://www.artsy.net/artist/robert-colescott/works-for-sale>). Copyright 1990 by Robert Colescott. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 4)

The painting *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis* by Robert Colescott is highly complex with its depiction of interracial relationships and societal influences that shape these relationships. The artwork evokes strong emotions in the viewer as it explores the deep-seated frustration and confusion of the Black female in a White society. Feelings of sadness may arise as the painting touches upon ways in which confusion about how one's racial identification can lead to thoughts to what society designates as superior versus what is perceived as inferior. The central figure in this painting literally unpacks racial dynamics in her head, which seems to explode into a variety of racial identities leading the viewer to feel a sense of anger, sadness, or confusion as it appears that this figure cannot make up her mind whether she belongs to the Black or White community. The doctor depicted in this painting seems to take the Black woman's pulse to say that she is ill in some sort of way. This can stir up feelings of anger as Black individuals are often pathologized by the White majority group, even if they are largely responsible for the lack of well being of Black people. The fact that the main figure is dressed in a provocative way, nearly exposing one of her breasts to the doctor, could potentially bring up a lot of feelings in the Black viewer as the Black body has been stereotyped as hypersexual, which accuses Black individuals of having a lack of impulse control. The large White face taking over the right top part of the painting may be a metaphor for White society at large. This part feels extremely disturbing as the entire scene seems to be observed by this large White figure, which may lead the viewer to feel discomfort because they are constantly watched by White people in

discriminatory ways. The painting shows several interracial couples in romantic positions, which appears to be the outcome of the main figure's IR and confusion about her own racial identity.

The Black viewer may feel offended by this as it implies that romance and love only exist outside one's own race and that one can only feel safe and loved when coupling with another race. Additionally, the Black female in the interracial couple has blond hair, while the other interracial couple featuring a Black male and White female does not artificially alter their hair color to adhere to Eurocentric beauty standards. This is angering as it implies that Black females need to reject parts of their racial heritage in order to be found attractive to the White male, while those same rules do not apply when genders are reversed. This gender difference is further exacerbated by Colescott depicting the Black female as subservient to her White partner, as evidenced by her literally looking up to him. The other interracial couple does not show those dynamics, and both partners seem to have equal power. Another confrontational element in this painting for the viewer is the Black figure on the left top part of the painting. It appears as if a saw is inserted into this figure's head and that a White person is responsible for this violent act. The Black figure does not seem to have a chance as she is simultaneously attacked by yet another White person who wields an ax at her. Overall, the painting evokes feelings of sadness and anger as it seems as if the Black female in this painting entirely relies on the mercy of the White people around her to either find her attractive, healthy enough, or even worthy of living. Furthermore, it appears as if females need to be saved by a male, which is depicted throughout the painting and may bring up feelings of anger and hopelessness in the female viewer. While this is present with all female/male interactions, it is more exacerbated with the Black female and highlights the gendered expressions of racism.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 4)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include Eurocentrism, idealization, negative racial identity, despair, hopelessness, helplessness, shame, exploitation, anxiety, fear, self-hate, feeling flawed, inferiority, low self-esteem, self-doubt, self-devaluation, discrimination, perpetrator/victim, hierarchy, violence, and health and mental health consequences of racism and IR. Several dynamics between figures in the painting are suggestive of Eurocentrism, including the way the Black figure with blond hair is looking up to her White male partner in admiration. Helplessness has been depicted through how several Black figures seem to have no sense of control or agency over their own lives (e.g., a saw inserted into the skull, a White doctor determining one's health). The theme of exploitation seems to come up throughout the entire painting but may be most evident within the power differential between the White male doctor and the Black female patient who is at the mercy of his diagnosis and treatment. Fear has been visualized in several parts of the painting but also through the depiction of a snake, as this may be a metaphor for evil. Self-devaluation has been expressed through the fragmented way in which the main figure's face is painted, emphasizing her tendency to devalue her own racial heritage and her desire to be accepted by the White male doctor. Hierarchical systems are emphasized throughout the painting and can be seen within the way the Black figures rely on the support or mercy of the White figures. Violence is most clearly portrayed through the scene, including an ax and saw inserted into a Black figure's skull. The theme of health and mental health consequences of racism and IR can be seen within the way the Black central figure is depicted as ill as a consequence of her exposure to racism.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 4)

The themes identified above emphasize the dynamics of fear and loss of control within the context of IR.

Eurocentrism/Idealization/Negative Racial Identity. Eurocentrism, idealization of White people, and negative racial identification seem to be the main theme within this painting by Colecott. All Black figures in this piece of art are affected in some way or another by racial discrimination, which leads to narratives in the painting that reminds of IR. W. E. B. Du Bois stated in 1903 that White domination of Black people leads to, what he termed, a double consciousness, meaning that Black individuals always see themselves through the revelation of the other world. Colecott captured this double consciousness very well as a White face covering a quarter of the painting seems to watch over the scene and indoctrinates White values onto the Black figures in the painting. Or the intraracial couples who can only see and accept themselves through the eyes of their lover. And lastly, the central figure the grandmother, who appears to be dependent on the doctor's view and diagnosis of her, which leads to racial identification confusion, as she lends power to an already powerful man. The power differentials addressed in this piece of art are particularly strong as they speak of White racial privilege and how the ideology of White superiority is successfully transmitted to all of society, including the Black community. The notion of White superiority can be seen in the White hands inflicting pain onto a Black figure by entering her skull with a saw and an ax, or by the way the White male partner looks down onto his Black female partner, who is only accepted because she has blond hair, or by the way the doctor examines the central Black figure, leading to fragmentation in her identity as a Black female. The literature around IR has come to understand that the term appropriated oppression may be more accurate as it highlights the fact that negative messages are modeled by

the oppressor and are taken in, or appropriated, as the truth by the oppressed group (Campon & Carter, 2015; Tappan, 2006). Appropriation of negative messages seems to have taken place within this painting as seen within the doctor/patient dynamic, alluding to the fact that the Black woman is sick in some way. The Black female looking up to her partner has appropriated other negative beliefs, as she seems to have adopted Eurocentric standards of beauty as evidenced in her blond hair. The act of appropriation may have been visualized by the saw and ax, tools used to alter the Black mind and change it into a White worldview. This piece of art touches upon the complex intersection of multiple systems of domination, leading to a multi-layered painting that loudly speaks about IR's inevitability as it is born out of structures of oppression. The painting is characterized by a polarized world while demonstrating that there are significant value differences between Black and White individuals. C.P. Jones (2000) states that people have the tendency to strive for holism, and a sense of personal coherence and the constant push and pull between these polarized worlds can lead to decreased psychological wellbeing.

Despair/Hopelessness/Helplessness. Feelings of hopelessness and despair are strongly expressed in this painting by depicting Black individuals who appear helpless as things seem to happen to them, and they have no sense of agency over their own lives. This is evidenced in how one Black figure is being attacked with an ax and a saw, and the other is being examined by a doctor. In both cases, the scenes seem to render the figures entirely helpless as they fall victim to racism and classism.

Shame/Exploitation. Themes related to shame come up as Colecott fragmented the central Black figure into many Black and White faces, indicating not only a sense of confusion but also ways in which shame is related to being Black when struggling with IR. The fact that Colecott added a scene between a White doctor and a Black figure speaks about class

differences between the two, which can lead to feelings of shame in those who are at the receiving end of this form of oppression. The Black figure's breasts are nearly covered by her summer dress, which renders her vulnerable, as the doctor is fully dressed and clearly in control. This lack of control has an exploitative feel, which seems to come back in other scenes throughout the painting. For instance, the Black female figure looks up to her White male partner in a way that reminds of power differentials in interracial partnerships and how they can lead to exploitation.

Anxiety/Fear. Fear is mostly addressed in the Black figure with a saw and an ax in her head, but it also seems to be present in the central figure sitting on a chair with a snake curling up against her. The snake appears to be steered by a masked mysterious looking figure with a Black hand, indicating that the Black central figure is not safe and that White people are not the only ones attacking Black people. This seems to bring up a lack of safety for Black people, as this scene suggests that aligning with either race may lead to danger. IR is rooted in issues around anxiety and fear, as people suffering from IR feel the need to align with the White majority group, which leads to denial of their own racial heritage. This is very anxiety and fear-provoking as IR is strongly linked to hope for survival in a racist world, which cannot guarantee safety or comfort for Black people.

Self-Hate/Feeling Flawed/Inferiority/Low Self-Esteem/Self-Doubt/Self-Devaluation. Feeling flawed and low self-esteem has been linked to IR within the literature. Robert Colescott strongly references this by depicting the central Black figure in a way that demonstrates her struggle with her own racial background, as evidenced by the fragmentation of her facial features that vacillate between White and Black. The theme of inferiority can be found within the Black female figure that submissively looks at her White male partner as to say that he

holds power over her. In this painting, self-devaluation is best represented within the Black central figure who almost exposes herself to the doctor who examines her, which may speak about power differentials and classism and how these dynamics lead to devaluating oneself, especially when compared to people who hold power and privilege.

Discrimination/Perpetrator-Victim/Hierarchy. Figures in this painting seem to either have accepted their subordinate status or struggle with the two polarized worlds comprised of Black and White people. Hierarchical systems are clearly laid out in this piece of art as evidenced by the White doctor/Black patient dynamic or by the interracial couples surrounding the scene who seem to have clear power differentials between them or by the fact that another Black figure seems to have no control over the violent tools used towards her to keep her in check. The perpetrator/victim dynamic is played out repeatedly within this painting, which seems to be amplified through racism.

Violence. The most violent scene in this painting shows the saw and ax entering a Black person's skull. This is violent in and of itself, but violence becomes particularly powerful if the victim does not have the means to fight back. In this painting, it appears that those who are attacked by powerful others do not have the capacity to defend themselves, making it all the more violent.

Health and Mental Health Consequences of Racism and IR. The doctor in the scene metaphorically stands for class difference and may also speak to the fact that race-based stress, including IR, may lead to adverse health outcomes. The fact that he is holding a crucifix in his left hand while taking her pulse may further support the idea of adverse health consequences. Religion has historically been used to justify oppression and colonialism under the guise of saving the primitive natives while doing God's work. Furthermore, a snake is a common symbol

of evil and temptation, which may be depicted in the way the central figure is sexualized and tempted by the powerful savior as represented by the White doctor. Moreover, a snake is also a symbol of medicine. Colescott used this symbolism, suggesting that the central figure needs to be tended to by a doctor, as she is physically or mentally ill.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 4)

This painting created by Robert Colescott has potential for healing from IR and general therapeutic values in that it clearly addresses themes related to IR and because it shows a narrative that can feel familiar to those Black individuals who struggle with IR. The painting addresses how marginalized people can be exposed to violent, exploitative, and racist behaviors from the privileged White dominating group and how a sense of dependence on this privileged group can lead to confusion about one's own racial identity, inequality, and negative wellbeing. The painting showcases a fragmented figure in the center, suggesting that this Black figure is confused about their racial identity. The construct of *wholeness* within emotion-focused therapy addresses that people are greater than the sum of their parts (Goldman, 2016), which may include their negative self-concept, confusion, depression, cultural and racial heritage, and many other parts of the self. In this instance, looking at a highly fragmented image of a Black female may be healing when applying the principle of wholeness to it, as it would allow the viewer to integrate rather than separate parts of herself. Research surrounding the healing components to race-based stress, including IR, indicates that a balance of power has to be redressed and that therapists need to incorporate practices that help promote equality, equity, wellbeing, and independence (Dalrymple & Burke, 1995). This painting can help the Black viewer connect with these pieces as it lays out how not attending to power imbalances or not even being aware of them will have detrimental effects on them. Other healing strategies involve the development of an authentic

voice in order to feel heard and seen and move away from an invisible stance to a person who has something important to share. Research corroborates this as it states that their newly found voice will help marginalized people gain a sense of agency over their lives. Thus seeing this painting may help oppressed individuals and those struggling with IR to become an agent of their own change process and find the necessary tools to challenge power and develop a strong positive identity (Dalrymple & Burke, 1995). Since the painting has a strong narrative component and thus lays out how racial inequality affects those at the receiving end of it, the viewers can possibly separate themselves from the oppression, which can be very empowering and liberating. The female figure in the center, a grandmother figure, is reactive to her surroundings and struggles within the polarized and racialized world she lives in. Suppose the viewer was able to empathize with this figure and step into this figure's experience. In that case, they could start to connect to their own human side as they can turn the empathy towards themselves, which is the part of the self that also struggles with racial identification.

Tapping into one's anger can also be therapeutic, as this voice has been silenced for centuries within the Black community. Black people are frequently stereotyped as loud and angry, which can lead to a desire to silence this part of the self. Thus voicing one's opinion regarding oppression is very therapeutic for marginalized populations. Having an anti-racist stance as a therapist is crucial as it involves bringing awareness to the historical roots of racism and how it is manifested within institutions. The fact that the Black figure is represented in this painting can be powerful, and the way this representation may tap into anger can unlock long-forgotten feelings that need to be expressed.

Looking at a complex and layered piece of art, such as this one, may require extended time to access all levels of emotions as the work provides representations of interracial

partnership, idealization with White power, and falling victim to racist acts. A Black viewer, who may harbor negative views of self and their racial heritage, may first feel discomfort when seeing this confrontational painting. Continued exploration and processing of such a work could present opportunities to investigate their Black identity development more intensively. Since the painting addresses a variety of strong emotions such as fear, anxiety, hopelessness, despair, shame, self-doubt, and self-hate, it is likely that the Black viewer can find an entry point to start discussing ways in which they have felt these emotions and how they related to racism, IR and societal pressures.

Result Summary of Figure 4

This painting addresses a sense of confusion found in individuals who struggle with IR and their racial identification. The central Black female figure seems to entirely rely on the mercy of the White people around her to either find her attractive, healthy enough, or even worthy of living. Scenes surrounding the central figure that appear to be a figment of her imagination evidence this. These scenes allude to violence, sexuality, and attractiveness in interracial couples and power differentials between successful White individuals and potentially ill Black people (e.g., doctor scene). At the core of this painting lies a sense of idealization of White people and a negative racial identification. The entire painting has a haunting and fear-inducing quality as a large White face, covering a quarter of the painting, seems to watch over the scene and indoctrinates White values onto the Black figures. This painting may have healing properties for the Black viewer with IR as they may be able to access an authentic voice that moves away from an invisible and confused stance. Moreover, the painting's richness and complexity allow for several entryways into themes related to IR, such as interracial partnership, idealization of White power, or falling victim to racist acts.

Figure 5*Ivy and the Janitor in January*

Note. From “Ivy and the Janitor in January”, by N. C. Abney, 2009

(<https://www.artsy.net/search?page=2&term=Nina%20Chanel%20Abney>). Copyright 2009 by Nina Chanel Abney. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 5)

Nina Chanel Abney's painting *Ivy and the Janitor in January* is a visual depiction of racial identity confusion and shame related to Blackness, which draws the viewer into her work. This serious subject matter seems to be juxtaposed to the way she uses color as the vibrant range of colors suggests happiness or a sense of entertainment. More haunting qualities quickly follow this initially inviting effect. The artwork can be experienced as confusing, disturbing, and maybe even angering, as the Black figure is attempting to hide her Blackness behind masks. The masks seem to be held up by two independent White hands, which may be a metaphor for a lack of control. Furthermore, the two floating detached White hands could refer to the White majority

groups' power over Black individuals, telling them what they should look like or how they should behave.

Oppressive systems' misuse of power can be manifested in many ways, for instance, by telling Black people whether they welcome their Black identity or if they would prefer behaviors associated with Whiteness. This painting clearly speaks to this confusion and sense of control by using White hands that uphold a Black and White mask, which is reminiscent of a puppet theater. Overall, a lack of control seems to be a major theme in this painting as heads are multiplying, the Black figure has no agency over her own facial features, and yellow gloves appear to place a spell on the scene that renders all figures in the painting helpless. This sense of helplessness is counteracted by the Black figure holding her hands in a prayer position, as to say that she is finding solace in connecting with a higher power. Her upward gaze and prayer position can also be interpreted as the hope for a world where she is included as a Black woman. Sadness and anger may arise when the Black viewer recognizes that this scene is depicted in the close confines of the public transportation system, which brings up historical and contemporary examples of segregation and racism. Abney's use of yellow hands in this painting is strategically placed and makes reference to sanitary workers. This can stir up feelings of depression or anger as systemic racism can limit marginalized populations' job prospects, leaving sanitation work as one of the more viable options. The Black mask seems to blur into the Black background, rendering it invisible. The only thing that stands out is the White nose and blue circles on its cheeks, which the latter reminds of an African mask. This plays on notions of invisibility, which may bring up feelings of hopelessness in the Black viewer. Both masks seem to have male features, which indicates that the male gender is preferred over the female one. The fact that the Black female figure appears to be passively awaiting her fate can be highly emotionally

evocative and most likely angering, especially to the Black female viewer. Thus, the painting seems to address intersectionalities, including race, gender, class, and religion, which can have a significant emotional impact on the Black viewer.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 5)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include shame, self-hate, self-devaluation, fear, anxiety, hopelessness, helplessness, feeling flawed, not fully human, inferiority, self-doubt, colorism, hierarchy, subordination, and negative racial identity. Shame is depicted through the use of masks and altering one's identity. The theme of self-devaluation is suggested in a longing to adapt to White majority society and to be seen as normal. Fear has been addressed by hiding one's authentic racial self in public spaces. The idea that power is in the hands of others can bring up the theme of hopelessness. Feeling flawed is addressed through a praying figure's contemplation of which self to be. A mix of skin tones within the facial features of the Black figure indicates the concept of colorism. Being outnumbered, as a Black figure, and considering methods of fitting in may be representative of subordination.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 5)

The themes identified above address notions of shame as they relate to IR and how this can lead to identity confusion.

Shame. This painting by Nina Chanel Abney named *Ivy and the Janitor in January* touches upon notions of shame related to skin color. One way in which she visualizes this is through the use of masks held in front of a Black figure. This figure appears to have a White nose and lips and two different shades of brown making up the rest of her face, indicating a sense of confusion about this figure's racial identification. Additionally, this figure wears yellow gloves and a White cover for her neck, suggesting more effort in covering up her skin tone.

Shame often lies at the core of IR, although it is essential to note that this is not self-inflicted but rather born out of oppressive systems. The idea of structural racism is reflected through the placement of the two figures in a public transportation system where the White figure represents the majority group and seems to be multiplying, as evidenced by the figure having two heads. The other figure is depicted as Black, and the narrative created in this painting brings up the idea of institutionalized racism in that people of color cannot feel safe within public, as structural oppression is ingrained within radicalized social systems (Burton, et al., 2010). All of which may engender feelings of shame.

Self-Hate and Self-Devaluation. This piece of art also touches upon themes of IR through addressing notions of self-hate and self-devaluation. The fact that individuals with IR often accept the negative and critical beliefs about one's worth (Graham et al., 2016) or that the idea of normalcy and reality is predetermined by the dominant group, leading to further devaluation and denigration of marginalized groups (Speight, 2007) can be seen within the way Abney portrays the Black figure as abnormal as evidenced by the use of masks and the need to blend into a White society. The internalization of these negative beliefs and the thought that one is abnormal has been internalized as the truth, which then leads to IR. Other ways in which this painting expresses self-hate as an outcome of structural oppression is through the visual depiction of the two White hands that serve as a metaphor for White society that determines which mask the Black figure should use. The notion of introjecting values also appears to come up in this piece of art as the Black figure with the masks seems to react to pressures from the outside world. Research around IR has demonstrated that these introjected values of the dominating culture on an oppressed group have long-lasting adverse effects on marginalized individuals (Bartky, 1990; Graham et al., 2016; Jones, 2000; Lipsky, 1977; Molina & James,

2016; Parmer et al., 2004; Speight, 2007). It seems that the Black figure in this piece of art is heavily affected by the pressures inflicted by the oppressive group.

Fear/Anxiety. Fear and anxiety seem to be expressed through Abney's theme of wearing masks in society, indicating that life would be too anxiety-provoking for Black individuals if they were confronted with the majority group without any protection, just being their authentic selves. The fact that Abney placed the figures in a public transportation system brings awareness that these forms of transportation pose a threat to minoritized groups, especially when taking historical facts, like Rosa Park's act of defiance on a public bus, into account. Furthermore, the painting expresses a notion of fear through the Black figure's seemingly praying hands. The prayer may signify a lack of safety and a need for finding internal calm.

Hopelessness/Helplessness. Abney depicts helplessness by emphasizing that both the Black and the White figures in the painting show a lack of control over their lives. The White figure seems to grow multiple heads; while the Black figure passively sits back waiting for decisions to be made by the White puppet master holding a Black and a White mask that will determine her racial identification. A sense of hopelessness may be found in the fact that racial oppression has been present for centuries, which may be shown through Abney's use of a public transportation system that reminds of racial segregation in the past and how it may be manifested in contemporary times.

Feeling Flawed/not Fully Human/inferiority/Self-Doubt. Both figures in the painting appear to feel less than human. In the White figure, this is expressed through portraying it as double-headed, and in the Black figure, this can be seen in its attempt to shield her authentic humanness behind masks, gloves, and neck covers. IR has played an integral part within the lives of Black individuals for decades leading to feeling flawed and not fully human, and this desire to

be seen as a human is depicted in Abney's painting through the figure's praying hands and her contemplation between which mask would allow her to feel more human. The Black figure seems to doubt herself and does not feel complete or even flawed, as evidenced by her attempts to hide her racial identity.

Colorism. The Black figure is rejecting her own racial heritage and wants to join the in-group. Notions of colorism are expressed through the use of three divergent skin tones within the Black figure's face, indicating a sense of confusion about the figure's racial identification. Individuals with lighter skin frequently reap the benefits of being privileged, which may place values on members of the Black community. By giving the figure three different skin tones, Abney may suggest that society's value judgment is reliant on a person's skin tone and that the White figure would be afforded a more comfortable life than the Black one.

Hierarchy/Subordination. Abney addresses notions of power differentials within this piece of art by addressing the fact that the Black figure shows signs of insecurity by hiding her racial identity. The literature corroborates the fact that hierarchy plays a significant role in the maintenance and perpetuation of racism. Hierarchy and subordination are born out of oppressive systems, and racism goes beyond the individual and reaches into economic, political, and cultural structures that lead to injustices such as an unequal distribution of power, privilege, and resources, placing the dominant group at the top of the order and the racial group at the bottom (Derman-Sparks & Phillips, 1997). This painting seems to demonstrate that the Black figure is subordinate to the White one in that it is clearly outnumbered and through the figure's need to identify as White. Moreover, subordination also plays a role within male/female relations as the Black female figure seems to be presented with two racial options to mask her identity, but neither matches her gender.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 5)

Narratives that are created in this painting may be related to the history of segregation between Black and White individuals and how it is manifested in everyday living situations (i.e., Rosa Parks, who refused to surrender her seat to a White passenger on a segregated bus). This may be helpful so far as the Black viewer can tap into their emotions related to this unequal distribution of rights between Black and White people, which may lead to becoming active and standing up for their rights. Furthermore, the use of masks in this painting may support Black people as the action of taking masks off has a liberating effect and allows for authenticity and being able to connect with other Black individuals without the use of a veiled language. The Black viewer may find it therapeutic to allow for a sense of empowerment to arise when focusing on the fact that the Black figure may choose the Black mask over the White one, which will alleviate feelings of shame. Others may see the reference to Rosa Parks within this painting, which may help to tap into a collective and transgenerational transmission of pain and racial trauma, which in turn can bring about a healthy amount of anger. Research around anger indicates that anger is a normal human emotion that is neither good nor bad and that this emotion should not be entirely eliminated. This research further contents that anger can help a person organize on a cognitive, physical, emotional, and behavioral level and that it can also help with problem-solving (González-Prendes & Thomas, 2009). It can, therefore, be inferred that healthy self-esteem may be the result of a healthy expression of anger, especially when taking into account that the Black individual has a right to be angry regarding oppression and racism. Another component that may have healing powers is the Black figure's praying hands. This can be therapeutic for those Black individuals who are spiritual or religious and find solace in prayer. Feelings of helplessness may evade when the Black viewer switches out the White hands with

Black hands and the White mask with a Black one as to say that there is a Black greater power watching over them, reminding them of the beauty found in Blackness. If this were to happen, the viewer may also feel a sense of safety as they would no longer be in the minority, nor would they be plagued by introjecting values of a dominating White world, but rather connect to their own racial heritage.

Result Summary of Figure 5

This painting is a visual depiction of racial identity confusion and shame related to Blackness. One of the major themes in this painting is related to having a lack of control, which is depicted through multiplying heads, the Black figure's lack of agency over her own facial features (e.g., masks being held up from outside forces), yellow gloved hands placing a spell on the scene, all of which renders the figures in the painting helpless. The Black figure, in particular, seems to be passively awaiting her fate, as she appears stifled by anxiety and unable to self-express, as evidenced by the Black figure's need of wearing a mask out in the White world instead of being her authentic self. Healing properties for the Black viewer with IR may be found in them, recognizing a need to liberate themselves and take masks off to communicate without a veiled language. Other healing components, especially for spiritual or religious viewers, may be found in the Black figure's praying hands.

Figure 6*A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self*

Note. From “A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self”, by K. J. Marshall, 1980 (<https://collections.lacma.org/search/site/Kerry%2520James%2520Marshall>). Copyright 1980 by Kerry James Marshall. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 6)

Kerry James Marshall makes the invisible visible in this piece by placing a Black figure on a Black background. This painting evokes several emotions as it is highly racially charged and painted in a confrontational manner in its cartoonish and unequivocal approach to race. The viewer may initially feel a sense of discomfort when looking at this artwork as the figure has been reduced to a two-dimensional representation of a Black man. The figure's depiction adopts the visual language used in cartoons, fairytales, and horror movies where a threat is embodied in

the form of a shadowy silhouette with eye Whites and a smile displaying more teeth than one typically show in a smile. Such a representation presents this figure as something other than human, which may elicit feelings of anger, particularly in the Black viewer, as the painting strongly reminds of old racist stereotypes. The fact that the figure is missing a tooth may heighten feelings of outrage in the Black viewer as Black individuals have experienced significant oppression for centuries, did not have access to the same types of resources, which has led to a substantial income gap and different access to healthcare systems. Moreover, the absence of a tooth can be symbolic of the way racism robs Black people of their sense of wholeness and dignity and how this can be manifested in the physical well-being of a Black individual. Furthermore, the smile can also be interpreted as a reaction to structural oppression, which morphs the threatening smile into a facial expression that has been adopted to survive in a world that perceives the Black man as a threat. Thus, the smile suggests a harmless and apologetic expression designed to be submissive, which provokes a desire for justice in the Black viewer, especially since the figure's smile is incongruent with how society treats Black people. Sadness may arise as the figure is deprived of a full range of expression and humanness, as evidenced by the reductionistic way the figure is portrayed. Being fully human includes access to all senses, and the fact that the figure is depicted without a nose further exaggerates his subhuman qualities. The artwork has a menacing feel and brings up feelings of anxiety, as it addresses society's fear of a Black male figure seen in the dark and how these assumptions and stereotypes inform the majority group's opinions. The Black viewer may feel shame when looking at this painting as this portrayal of a Black figure does not reflect positively on the Black community as a whole. The figure appears to accept his subordinate status, which may bring shame upon the Black viewer who does not want to be categorized or reduced to a stereotype.

The figure in the painting looks back at the viewer and seems to yearn for freedom and justice, which can evoke a variety of feelings in the Black viewer.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 6)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include stereotyping, self-stereotyping, discrimination, dehumanization, colorism, invisibility, shame, and anxiety/fear. Stereotyping can be found within the reductionistic and cartoonish way in which this man is portrayed.

Dehumanization is presented by depicting a figure who has been stripped of his human identity and features. Colorism is addressed by reducing a complex and nuanced individual to the color Black. The figure's inability to differentiate himself from his surroundings renders him invisible. Ideas of shame are suggested through the figure's retreat into the shadows. Fear can be seen within the figure's apologetic smile as a method of survival.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 6)

The themes identified above address ways in which the Black figure has been reduced to a racist caricature, which is in line with the way individuals suffering from IR may adopt a reductionist view presented by majority groups.

Stereotyping and Self-Stereotyping. Kerry James Marshall's painting titled *A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self* explores notions of stereotyping and self-stereotyping through depicting himself as a Black figure, painted in a cartoon style way and with exaggerated and caricatured Black facial features. The concept of stereotyping and self-stereotyping is strongly associated with IR in that people who suffer from IR tend to actively avoid interactions with stigmatizing experiences which can take on the form of aligning with White people and rejecting one's own racial heritage or by devaluing oneself and categorizing oneself as less than others based on one's race. Research has demonstrated that the level to which

individuals are conscious of their racial identity regarding self-stigma can determine how much they engage in self-stigmatizing behaviors (Pinel, 1999; Vandiver et al., 2002). These behaviors are not only limited to themselves but are typically expanded to the entire racial or ethnic group they belong to. This painting addresses these issues by depicting a self-portrait of a Black man in a reductionistic manner, reflecting the way the majority group may categorize a Black individual. It is important to note that Kerry James Marshall stated in a lecture at the Tate Gallery in London that he did not intend this painting to be a reflection of himself, but rather a manifestation of how oppressive systems have the power to reduce a Black person to a caricature (Tate Gallery, 2018).

Discrimination/Dehumanization. Themes around discrimination and dehumanization are visually expressed through the depiction of a cartoonish Black figure who has been robbed of his human features. Seeing African Americans as a monolithic cultural group is a mistake as there are marked differences within this group of people (Freire, 2000). By reducing the Black figure to the color Black, Kerry James Marshall comments upon discrimination and racism. The word dehumanization implies that someone's humanity has been stolen, which is strongly depicted in this painting as facial features are reminiscent of a cartoon-like figure that lacks personality and identity. Even though Marshall uses the Black man in the painting as a placeholder for the Black man in society, he may still be commenting on ways in which his humanity has been stolen or denied as a Black man and as an artist because of the emphasis of identification with the figure in his title.

Colorism. Kerry James Marshall emphasizes skin tone in all of his paintings, and he is acutely aware of the way Black skin translates in a painting. He shares that he sees a distinct difference in how Whiteness versus Blackness operates and that nuance of Blackness matters while they don't in Whiteness (Gaines, 2017). Hall (2005) states that colorism is the root cause of

internal differentiation and inequality among people of color, and it has been said that it historically has led to intragroup racism (Burton et al., 2010). The fact that individuals with lighter skin have skin privilege can play a vital role in developing and maintaining IR as individuals with darker skin tone are more frequently confronted with racism. Marshall describes a full spectrum of skin tonalities in Blackness and that he is well aware of those differences. His work attempts to emphasize questions of perception and reality. He tries to address the extremes when painting Black figures, taking into account that there are diversity and range amongst Black people regarding their complexion. By painting these figures, he tries to critique the panorama and simultaneously hopes that it raises questions in the viewer (Gaines, 2017). Although the painting is Black and White, Marshall emphasizes that Black is not the absence of color and that it is actually a chromatically rich color (Tate Gallery, 2018). This is important as it has implications on the way we see and interpret Blackness. He points out that there are nuances and complexities found within the color Black. This difference allows us as the viewer to differentiate between the subject and the background it is painted on. The viewer has to make an effort to understand and appreciate the nuances and complexities of Blackness. This appreciation goes far beyond the painting and reaches into an awareness of the people we are surrounded by and a willingness to see their complexity. Marshall placing a Black figure on a Black background, only revealing a smiling mouth showing White teeth and eye White of the Black figure, further emphasizes the notion of Blackness and skin complexion. The figure appears to be limited within his self-expression and locked within the limitations of the color range used for this painting and the fact that the only capacity for self-expression lies within a forced smile and highly simplified eyes.

Invisibility. By positioning the Black figure on a Black background, Marshall addresses notions of invisibility, which is strongly associated with racism and IR in the literature. Notions of self-worth and invisibility are closely intertwined, and one's self-concept is shaped by what we attribute our self-worth to. For instance, if an individual attributes it to his or her own characteristics, this person may internalize the assertion of inferiority and accept the negative self-view, leading to IR. On the flip side, if the oppressed person were to attribute their treatment to biases in others, it is more likely to lead to a positive self-concept (Crocker & Major, 1989). This notion of self-worth is clearly outlined in the writings of A.J. Franklin (1999), who has termed the phenomenon of being invisible to others as the *invisibility syndrome*, which he describes as an inner struggle where one's ability, personality, and worth are not valued or even recognized due to prejudice. He further states that feeling invisible leads to a lack of identity, having no dignity, feeling disrespected, and having self-doubt. These different aspects of invisibility are all represented within Kerry James Marshall's self-portrait.

It is noteworthy that in one of his lectures held at the Museum of Contemporary Art Chicago, Marshall shared that his title and the painting was inspired by the book *Invisible Man* by Ralph Ellison. This further corroborates that the theme of invisibility was fundamental to him in his work. It appears that Marshall recognizes that one can feel invisible while living amongst others, as others do not recognize you as a unique human being with free will, thoughts, or feelings of your own. During a talk at the Tate Gallery in London, he stated that a person could be absent while being present (Tate Gallery, 2018). The book *Invisible Man* was an inspiration for Marshall as a young artist and explores the notion of invisibility in a way that questions whether people of color are visible to society at all. The story of the protagonist in the book seems to be interlinked with Marshall's painting in that they both address a loss of identity due to

racism. In the book, the main character finds himself amongst different groups of people, and he tries to craft his identity through interactions with others. However, since others expect him to behave a certain way, based on the Black color of his skin, he realizes that his individuality is neither complex, nuanced, or human and that he has been reduced to a Black man without further identity. This renders him invisible. This lack of complexity and nuance to the character in Marshall's painting is reminiscent of the protagonist's experience in the book *Invisible Man*. It seems as if society can only see *what* you are and not *who* you are, which leads to the disappearance of the Black person in the public eye. Marshall's interest in this book is also reflected in the title of the painting (i.e., *A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self*), as it emphasizes the difference between the past and the present by using the word former. The book's main character withdraws and lives in total seclusion from society, which allows him to move from a youthful but naïve self to an enlightened but bitter self. Marshall's title suggests that he used to see himself as a shadow, devoid of identity, reduced to a flat Black afterthought and without expression. Again, the word former may indicate that this is no longer the case for this artist and that he has persevered. In this same lecture held at the Museum of Contemporary Art, Kerry James Marshall shares his thoughts on success and that he believes that perseverance lies at the heart of success. He further shares that he has persevered through extreme poverty and racial discrimination as a Black man from society at large but also from art institutions who denied his entry into the art world for decades (Museum of Contemporary Art Chicago, 2016). The title of this painting strongly captures this notion of Kerry James Marshall's perseverance as a Black artist.

Shame. The fact that one of the central features of this painting is the Black figure's big smile while missing a tooth is suggestive of feelings of shame. Shame is a feeling that has been

associated with IR within the literature (Watts-Jones, 2002; Jones, 2000). Watts-Jones' research explores the difference between two levels of shame associated with IR: the first level is the shame associated with African-ness, and the second is the shame of being shamed. By making this distinction, she analyzes the difference between being born with Black skin and therefore having a disadvantage versus being shamed by society later on for being Black. This painting appears to explore these levels of shame. It addresses societal introjects by depicting the Black figure as a stereotype and letting the figure blend into the background as if to say that he does not want to be seen as a person who has something to contribute.

Anxiety/Fear. Kerry James Marshall expresses both fear and anxiety within this artwork. These feelings are strongly correlated with IR in the bulk of the research. The smile on the figure's face suggests a sense of anxiety and fear of the oppressor. Furthermore, smiling can be seen as an anxious reaction to a racist society and an attempt to counteract negative stereotypes of Black men who are viewed as violent and dangerous. While the content of the painting addresses notions of racism, it appears that the figure in the artwork tries to appeal to the majority group by being non-threatening and friendly, which can be interpreted as a survival mechanism.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 6)

This painting has the potential for healing from IR as it brings awareness to stigmatization. The literature confirms that avoidance of stigmatizing experiences and self-stigmatizing behaviors can help individuals with IR become more attuned to discrimination and reject stereotypes (Pinel, 1999; Vandiver et al., 2002). Furthermore, this artwork addresses notions of colorism through the exaggeration of skin tones used (i.e., shades of Black). Since colorism has historically led to intragroup racism (Burton et al., 2010), looking at this painting

may help Black people of all skin tones become aware of society's tendency to categorize Black people into structures and how negative assumptions about dark skin are perpetuating racist beliefs. Additionally, the painting may help the Black viewer think about nuances in skin tones, which may bring up thoughts about racial identification and intraracial class tensions and in which ways they contribute to the maintenance of hierarchical structures and oppression.

Marshall's paintings portray his Black figures in a way that leaves no doubt about race, which leads the viewer to be confronted with skin complexion in a way that can no longer be avoided.

Through identification with the Black figure, it may allow the viewers to position themselves in relation to the painting. Marshall speaks about the inability to escape the category of one's

Blackness as it is historically determined (Gaines, 2017). When taking this statement into

account, as a Black viewer, it may bring awareness to the struggle inherent to identification with other Black people depicted in paintings showcasing a panorama of skin complexions. Thus, the

healing lies within the awareness of how skin complexion is related to skin privilege. Once the

Black viewer understands that they identify with the Black figure in the painting on some level,

it can lead to a desire to join Black communities. Watts-Jones (2002) calls these communities

within-group sanctuaries and states that these places can function as a safe place for Black

people to gather, which will lead to a decrease in self-alienation and self-degradation. This

painting clearly addresses notions of discrimination that can help the Black viewer tap into their

own racial trauma history that may have been silenced for years. This awareness can give voice

to the desire for equality and potentially lead to taking an active stance in one's own oppression.

Kerry James Marshall comments on his use of the Black figure in his paintings by stating,

African American artists have avoided figuration because the Black figure, in particular, exists as

some kind of limitation that doesn't allow a viewer who is not Black to get past the fact of its

Blackness and therefore cannot see the work in its fullest complexity (Museum of Contemporary Art Chicago, 2016). This suggests that the Black viewer may be able to see the complexity of the Black figure used in his paintings and may help them tap into their own racial history.

Result Summary of Figure 6

Kerry James Marshall's painting is highly racially charged and confrontational in its cartoonish and unequivocal approach to race. The figure appears to be deprived of a full range of expression and humanness, which has a menacing feel and addresses society's fear of a Black male figure seen in the dark and how these assumptions and stereotypes inform the majority group's opinions. Dehumanizing aspects of this powerful painting are exacerbated by the figure's lack of personality and identity. The fact that the Black figure is placed on a Black ground adds to the notion of invisibility, which is supported by Kerry James Marshall, who states that this painting was inspired by the book *Invisible Man*. The book, as well as the painting, question whether Black people are visible to society at all. The Black viewer with IR may benefit from looking at this painting as it brings awareness to stigmatization, colorism, and racial identification that all contribute to the maintenance of hierarchical structures and oppression.

Figure 7*Randaleeza*

From “Randaleeza”, by N. C. Abney, 2008

(<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Nina%20Chanel%20Abney>). Copyright 2008 by Nina Chanel Abney. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 7)

Nina Chanel Abney's painting *Randaleeza* brings up various feelings, including fear, anger, and sadness. Her portrayal of the Black male figure as a combination of animal and human with a focus on his penis is particularly emotionally evocative, as it addresses ways in which oppressive systems view and treat Black individuals. By debasing and hyper sexualizing Black people and robbing them of their humanness, it justifies a sense of superiority and cruelty, as they no longer belong to the human race. The fact that this central figure seems to have an erection further emphasizes the figure's lack of impulse control, making him more

animal-like, leading to further expulsion of the in-group. In general, this painting loudly speaks of an in-group/out-group phenomenon, emphasizing the idea of intraracial class tensions as evidenced by the Black police officer in the background siding with his White colleague and pointing laughingly at a Black, nearly nude, a woman who appears to have a target on her body. This evokes intense feelings of anger as it addresses notions of helplessness in those who are the target of racism. The White police officer is holding binoculars while laughing with his Black colleague, which translates into a sense of voyeurism and finding pleasure in other people's misfortune. Research studies state a positive correlation between identification with a group and feelings of safety, likeability, and self-esteem (Ysseldyk, et al., 2010). Abney visualized this by making it look as if the police officers are lending self-esteem to one another through bonding within their vocation as police officers. This is further emphasized by the Black officer's White nose and the White officer's Black nose as if they swapped features. They appear to be safe as they are wearing helmets, uniforms, and are in power. This can evoke strong emotions in the Black viewer who has been subject to police violence or has been vicariously traumatized by it in the past. The fact that the entire scene is painted within nature adds to its absurdity and makes the viewer think that the target figures cannot flee to safety as no one else bears Whiteness to this crime.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 7)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include intraracial class tension, intragroup dynamic, fear, violence, not fully human, feeling flawed, dehumanization, limited self-expression, shame, observation of racist acts, discrimination, perpetrator/victim, Eurocentrism, negative racial identity, turning against one's people, hopelessness, helplessness, and sadness. The theme of intraracial class tension comes up through the depiction of the Black

police officer who views other Black individuals as the out-group. Notions of fear can be seen within the Black central figure screaming while transforming into an animal, as well as in the Black female figure that seems to have a target on her abdomen. Shame has been depicted in several ways within this artwork, including how the Black police officer hides his Black hands under White gloves and by him having a White nose, indicating shame related to his racial heritage. There appears to be a clear divide between those in power and those who are not, which suggests a perpetrator/victim dynamic. The Black police officer aligns with power and feels connected to his White colleague, which is indicative of Eurocentrism. A sense of helplessness can be seen in how the central figure seems to scream for help while being unable to remain safe under the pressures of government-issued power.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 7)

The themes identified above address hierarchical systems and how they may play out within one's own racial group leading to IR.

Intra-Racial Class Tension/Intragroup Dynamic. Intra-racial class tensions are addressed within this piece of art by emphasizing the power differential between the Black police officer and his Black targets. Research indicates that the stronger one aligns with their in-group's beliefs, the more threatening the out-group appears (Ysseldyk, et al., 2010). This notion is well portrayed in this painting by Abney as she grouped the police officers together in the background, laughing at their victims. This bonding demonstrated that they strongly align with their ideology as police officers, and they see no harm in violating the rights of others, especially when those others are seen as subhuman and as an out-group that needs to be attacked and eliminated. Another phenomenon known within the in-group/out-group dynamics is the idea of glorification, which leads to a sense of superiority over the out-group. The Black police officer

seems to glorify and wish to affiliate with White power, thus degrading and feeling superior over his own race. This becomes clear when looking at the way the Black police officer points at the Black woman who seems to have a target painted on her abdomen. Ysseldyk et al. (2010) also states that individuals who strongly align with their in-group have less capacity to see the out-group's suffering as they are desensitized to the other group's life experiences. Abney demonstrates this in this painting by depicting the police officers as callous and laughing at individuals who are in need of help. This is further exacerbated by depicting one of the Black figures as an animal, which shows how detached the police officers are from their victim's suffering.

Fear/Violence. Abney's painting *Randaleeza* clearly addresses notions of fear and anxiety. This is mostly expressed in the central Black figure that is depicted as part human and part animal. This figure appears to be screaming as one of his hands is violently attacked by a police dog. The idea of transforming into an animal in and of itself must be extremely anxiety-provoking as this transformation takes place outside of the human's control. The theme of fear also arises when looking at the nearly dressed female figure that appears highly vulnerable and holds her hands over her head to avoid an attack by the police. Her fear is further legitimized as Abney painted a target on her abdomen to say that she is likely to be attacked by the police officers. The fact that the figures are subject to violence without anyone around to help, amid nature, also adds to the emotion of fear evoked in this painting. Additionally, being attacked by one's own race feels like betrayal and adds another layer to feeling fearful. Research indicates that fear may be a driving force in maintaining high identification with the group as there is too much at stake and safety is at risk when not aligning within-group ideologies (Ysseldyk, et al., 2010), which can lead to dehumanizing those who are perceived as a threat. When taking this

research into account, it is likely that even the Black police officer may be fearful and aligns firmly with the White majority group. However, this is not visualized within this painting, but rather a hypothesis.

Not Fully Human/Feeling Flawed/Dehumanization/Limited Self-

Expression/Shame. The notion of a loss of humanness is mostly addressed in the Black central figure, who seems to morph into an animal. However, it can also be seen in the female figure with the White bikini, as her humanness is robbed through, making her a target of racism. The fact that she is wearing a hat spelling USA on it seems to make her a product of a racist society, rather than an individual with individual wants and needs. Both figures are targeted and are therefore limited in their self-expression, which is a natural outcome of oppression. The Black police officer was given a White nose in this painting, which alludes to the fact that he may feel flawed as a Black man and that he would like to reject his racial heritage. This is further supported by the fact that he is wearing White gloves, while his White colleague does not seem to attempt to hide his skin, indicating a sense of shame regarding his skin color. The central figure has been portrayed in such a compromising way, by exposing his crouch and making him appear criminal or guilty of something, that it evokes feelings of shame when looking at him. It is as if something has been revealed about this figure that is embarrassing or incriminating somehow.

Observation of Racist Acts/Discrimination/Perpetrator-Victim. Abney included the head of a bystander on the right middle part of the painting, which indicates that someone observed the racist act. This figure appears to be inactive and possibly in shock, as demonstrated by his facial expression. The fact that this figure has a White nose but is otherwise Black may suggest that he does not fully identify as Black and would therefore feel discomfort in supporting

his fellow Black people who are the target of police violence. Perpetrator/victim dynamics are clearly visualized by making a stark divide between those in power (i.e., police officers) and those who are oppressed. Research around IR suggests that this dynamic can lead to IR as rejecting one's own racial heritage is driven by a survival mechanism. This might be visually expressed in this artwork by providing the human figure with animal features with a partial White hand, as to say that he may fair better if he were to be White.

Eurocentrism/Negative Racial Identity/Turning Against own People. Eurocentric values and negative racial identity are touched upon within this painting through its emphasis on the desire for power and through depicting certain Black figures in ways that show that they reject their racial heritage. The Black police officer is clearly turning against his own people by siding with the White police officer and inflicting pain upon Black people. Eurocentric values are further visualized by offering those who either have some White features (e.g., nose) or those who turn against Black people better positions in life than those who are fully Black and/or look like an animal.

Hopelessness/Helplessness/Sadness. The targeted figures in the foreground of the painting appear hopeless and helpless, as evidenced by their facial expression (e.g., screaming) or by the female figure surrendering to police violence. The IR literature sees a strong link between the development and maintenance of IR through feelings of helplessness and hopelessness and points out that oppressive systems are self-perpetuating and therefore lead to depression. It seems as if the central figure is breaking under the pressures of oppression, as evidenced by him crying while also doubting his own humanness. Even the neutral bystander on the right of the painting appears to be helpless, as he remains entirely inactive in the face of oppression. Research on IR, depression, and self-esteem indicates that those individuals who

suffer from Major Depressive Disorder are more likely to have IR than those who have high self-esteem and decreased depressive symptoms. In this painting, depression is visualized as irritability, anger, and fear, which frequently is misconstrued and pathologized by mental health professionals who do not understand the complexity of how structural oppression can manifest itself differently in oppressed individuals.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 7)

Showing this painting to Black individuals may have the potential for healing from race-based trauma, including IR, as it clearly illustrates power differentials between White and Black people or those who hide behind government-issued power and those oppressed by this very system. Viewing this artwork may be particularly effective with individuals who identify with the Black police officer who affiliates and identifies with power and colludes directly with oppression, as it may confront them with their experience as a Black person rejecting their racial heritage. The therapeutic value may lie within the viewer, becoming aware of these systems and how they have negatively impacted him or her. Many Black people have fallen victim to police brutality or at least have been debased by government authority at one point in their lives, and being able to see this visualized in an art piece can feel validating as it draws attention to reality. This allows the Black viewer to feel that present and past-day conditions of racism have added to their feelings of helplessness, hopelessness, and apathy, which may feel validating and may actually combat these feelings and move them into action. Harrell's (2006) discussion of racism explains the complex interplay between minority and majority groups and how oppressed individuals often find themselves convincing others of the validity of their experience. This painting speaks to that in that one can imagine that the targeted figures hold no power and will not be able to convince a judge of their innocence as governmental agencies are in actuality

posing a threat and keeping them down. Harrell (2006) further contents that when victims of a hate crime are told that their experience did not take place, it will result in re-traumatization and feelings of self-doubt. The central figure appears to be re-traumatized, as evidenced by him screaming out loud with no one responding to his desperate cry for help. Black people who suffer from IR may be able to better understand the dynamics leading to intraracial class tensions, and it may help them choose differently next time when placed in a position when they are asked to decide who they want to align with. Rather than dehumanizing people of their own race and treating them like animals, they may be able to have a more human approach to seeing other Black individuals, which in turn will help them see themselves in a softer, less self-devaluing way. When a Black person views this image, it may help decrease feelings of shame felt due to IR, as feelings of compassion may take over for those figures who fall victim to racism. Feelings of compassion and empathy may serve as a protective factor to IR as it may lead to developing empathy for one's own pain endured regarding racism. Helplessness and hopelessness may be diminished when viewing this painting, as the Black viewer might understand that they can stand up against power rather than align with it.

Result Summary of Figure 7

This painting portrays a Black figure as a hybrid between human and animal. By robbing the Black figure of their humanness, it justifies a sense of superiority and cruelty as they are no longer deemed human. The artwork also speaks of an in-group / out-group phenomenon as evidenced by the Black police officer siding with his White colleague and pointing laughingly at a Black, nearly nude, woman who appears to have a target on her body. Themes of intra-racial class tension come up as Nina Chanel Abney emphasizes the power differential between the Black police officer and his Black targets. Perpetrator/victim dynamics are clearly visualized by

making a stark divide between those in power (i.e., police officers) and those who are oppressed. The therapeutic value may lie within the Black viewer, becoming aware of government-issued power systems and how they have negatively impacted them. The viewer may also tap into feelings of self-compassion, which may serve as a protective factor to IR and can potentially lead to developing empathy for one's own pain as it relates to race-based trauma.

Figure 8

Camptown Ladies (detail)



Note. From “Camptown Ladies (detail)”, by K. Walker, 1998 (<https://rubellmuseum.org/115-exhibitions/past-exhibitions/30-americans/567-30a-kara-walker>). Copyright 1998 by Kara Walker. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 8)

This detail of Kara Walker's tableau *Camptown Ladies* brings about many raw emotions, ranging from helplessness, fear to sadness, anxiety, disgust, and anger. The artwork can be particularly difficult for individuals with IR as they deny the existence of racist acts. All these emotions seem to point out that the image loudly speaks about exploitation and power

differentials. The fact that the image is Black and White exacerbates the polarized way we experience race in this image with a White man dressed as a Jockey and a Black woman who appears to wear rags. Binary oppositions like White/Black, good/evil, male/female emphasize hierarchical value systems and can lead to feelings of anger in the viewer as these systems categorize humans who do not have the ability to stand up for their fundamental human rights as subordinate and weak. These fixed identities are prescribed by society at large and can evoke feelings of helplessness in Black people who view this work. One of the first things that come up when looking at this detail of Kara Walker's work is limitations of choices and how there is no negotiation with the world for Black individuals who suffer under oppressive systems. The fact that the Black body is objectified in this artwork, and literally portrayed as a horse, brings up disgust and raw anger towards the oppressor, the jockey, who seems to be unaware of his position of power. Although the image refers to a slave/master dynamic, it translates into contemporary times as it speaks about a collective unconscious on the White person's part and how their privilege keeps the Black person at the bottom of the hierarchy. This dynamic always plays out to the benefit of the White majority group that directly benefits from the unequal distribution of power and Black people's labor. The Black viewer may ask himself or herself if this unequal distribution and illusion of power will ever shift to their advantage, which can bring about feelings of hopelessness and fear for an uncertain future. In this artwork, the Black figure's restrictions on her freedom, self-expression, and lack of ability to control her life add to feelings of helplessness. Anxiety and fear are always connected to making choices as there are consequences attached to them, however in this image, it appears that the figure is left with only two choices: one is choosing to live with is undeniably bound to be oppressed and dehumanized, while the other alternative is to die, which would end the horrific life she is living, but also

deprives her of ever making choices again. The fact that a common animal, such as the rabbit, is portrayed as having power over the Black female figure may evoke strong feelings of anger in the Black viewer, as it suggests inferiority to a small creature, not typically known for its power or intelligence. Strong emotions may be evoked in the Black female viewer, as gender inequity is depicted as powerfully as racial discrimination.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 8)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include exploitation, racism, and mental health, feeling flawed, not fully human, stereotypes, anxiety, and fear. Exploitation is clearly depicted within this artwork as Kara Walker portrays the Black female figure as an animal, emphasizing the denial of being treated as a human and taken advantage of by White individuals in power. The idea of being flawed is presented through the depiction of the Black female figure as a horse. Stereotyping has been expressed through the use of exaggerated facial features in the Black figure. Fear is depicted through portraying the Black figure as running for her life, presented through being shot and whipped.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 8)

The themes identified above strongly emphasize the dynamics of exploitation and how the false promise of a better life could potentially lead one to side with the oppressor.

Exploitation. In Kara Walker's detail of a large tableau named *Camptown Ladies*, the artist consciously provokes deep feelings of discomfort by visualizing the Black figure's dehumanization and literally depicting it as an animal that carries a White human jockey on top of her shoulders. By doing so, she touches upon ideas of exploitation and physical and mental pain that derives from it. Through depicting the Black female figure in a way that divests her of human qualities, powers, rights, and possessions, she loudly speaks about racism and how

oppressive systems are maintained by denying Black people their humanness. Other ways in which racist themes arise in this piece of art are the visual representation of a carrot dangling on a string in front of the Black running figure. Not only does this emphasize how the Black female is portrayed as a horse, it simultaneously speaks of the fact that the promise of a reward and relief of mental and physical pain will never arrive. This sense of false hope is very familiar to the Black community, as institutionalized racism hides behind a façade of false promises and leads to uneven access to goods, which, in turn, has a negative effect on life prospects and general health of those who are at the receiving end of oppression (Molina & James, 2016; Harrell, 2006).

Kara Walker also addresses the fact that Black people are historically viewed as impervious to pain and that majority groups think of them as resilient and having the ability to endure greater hardship than others and thus being resistant to pain (Pyke, 2010). Her artwork brings up thoughts about complex and multiple systems of domination and how IR is not self-inflicted or a biological characteristic of the oppressed or a psychological defect, but rather a natural reaction to structural oppression (Padilla, 2001). Although the art piece may at first glance mainly touch upon themes of direct racism, it is essential to note that IR has also been termed appropriated oppression to emphasize the fact that negative messages are modeled by the oppressor and taken over, or appropriated, as the truth by the oppressed (Campon & Carter, 2015; Tappan, 2006). When taking in the powerful message of Kara Walker's art piece and focusing on the Black female figure, it appears that this figure has three ways to respond to her oppression: either by taking power back and becoming the oppressor or by siding with the oppressor. The third option would be to give up, which would likely lead to death. The literature describes IR as compliance with the oppressor, which has similarities to the continuous fight for

survival depicted in this artwork. IR is often linked to survival in the literature, and that the person suffering from IR is trying to live in a world that allows for some form of self-expression, even if it comes at the cost of losing one's own racial identity. Kara Walker's choice to depict the Black figure as a racehorse is a powerful one, as these types of horses are known to be exploited and disposed of when they no longer meet the standards and demands of their rider. IR has also been defined as adopting the dominant's group ideology while accepting a subordinate status as deserved and depreciating the Black self.

When being treated like an animal, the oppressed individual has been robbed of their ability to choose, and this extreme form of oppression and exploitation may lead to reactions in the oppressed group that may not always be self-enhancing. It is the viewer's task to complete the narrative in their head and decide whether the figure rejects their racial heritage in order to live or whether they will stand up to power and oppression. Ample literature corroborates the relationship between race-related stress and mental health (Bryant-Davis, 2017; Carter, 2007; Freire, 2000; Hall et al., 2016; Harrell, 2000; Hatzenbuchler, 2016; Plaut, 2010; Young, 1990) and how exploitation, marginalization, powerlessness, and systemic violence perpetuate the power of the dominant group over the subordinate one (Speight, 2007). These notions of power and the negative impact of it on the oppressed group can be seen within this art piece of Kara Walker as the Black figure is clearly suffering mentally and physically under the burden of her oppressor.

Dehumanization/Subordination/not Fully Human. The fact that the emphasis in this piece of art lies on the dehumanizing aspects strongly speaks to how esteem and dignity are taken from Black individuals, leading to feeling less human. This plays into the maintenance and development of IR as shameful and humiliating experiences. This leads to a lack of self-

confidence and a desire to distance oneself emotionally in terms of racial identity. Furthermore, this artwork's dehumanizing aspects also relate to other definitions of IR that are associated with restrictions to one's own full humanity and denial of dreams, self-expression, and self-determination (Jones, 2000). This piece of art clearly leans on this definition of IR as the Black figure is in a weakened position and cannot express herself under the oppressor's weight.

Internalization of negative stereotypes leads to IR, which could be implied through the depiction of the White person as the oppressor and the Black person as the oppressed. While this dynamic of oppressor/oppressed is clearly depicted, it is not clear whether the Black female figure is internalizing negative stereotypes. However, there is a strong relationship between IR and racism, and a viewer is left to determine how the story ends (e.g., does she fight back, carry on, or give up) and how this may relate to their IR. Walker's piece addresses themes of racism, and this artwork may evoke thoughts around the Black figure's relationship to their oppression. If this were the case, the figure could have feelings of shame of being ridden while hoping for some external reward. In other words, the oppressed, depicted as an animal-like human, has a strong desire to survive by any means, even if this may be at the cost of her own integrity. Themes around feeling flawed have been visually explored in this piece of art by emphasizing the Black figure's subordinate position and the way it speaks about a sense of a normal world order that has been adopted by both the oppressor and the oppressed. The literature of IR analyzes how individuals with IR often accept the negative and critical beliefs about their own worth (Graham et al., 2016) and that the idea of normalcy and reality is predetermined by the dominant group, leading to further devaluation and denigration of marginalized groups (Speight, 2007). Both these definitions clearly explore notions of self-devaluation in that negative aspects of the self

have been internalized as truth and by seeing oneself as abnormal. Kara Walker's work expresses a sense of hopelessness within this endless cycle of exploitation.

Stereotypes. Kara Walker's visual language is seductive and draws the viewer in to examine the content of the work. Her silhouetted figures depict stereotyped African American figures that are still dressed as slaves of the South while simultaneously seducing the viewer to come closer and be entertained by this horrible spectacle. This incongruence between content and the formal aspects of the work is related to IR in that people who struggle with IR have a strong desire to cut off painful, shameful, and race associated parts of themselves that are experienced as unbearable and present themselves as perfect and non-flawed to be accepted by the majority group. Kara Walker's interest in symbols and themes is closely connected to racist and class-based American hegemony. The notion of stereotyping is further seen in the way Kara Walker takes the personhood out of the figures and how she emphasizes the exaggerated facial features of African Americans. She asks the viewer to racialize the figures and place them into binary oppositions such as White or Black. The viewer also takes these opposing powers on, as Kara Walker's silhouetted figures are life-sized, strongly relate to the human body, and lead the viewer to position themselves as the perpetrator or the victim. The interactive identity inherent to silhouettes has the capacity to confound and conflate intricate racial and narrative representations. Her use of the silhouette can be seen as a blank space that offers the opportunity to project one's own desires into, whether they be positive or negative. Kara Walker confronts the viewer and addresses stereotypes in a way that forces them to come in contact with luring effigies and ghosts from the past who are engaged in a fictitious and unsentimental master-slave dialectic (Du Bois Shaw, 2004).

Anxiety/Fear. Walker expresses strong notions of fear in this art piece by emphasizing the extreme power differential between the White man and the Black female who is reduced to an animal. It prompts the viewer to remember that a slave woman's body did not actually belong to her and that her owner-controlled it. This extreme assertion of power brings about fear for survival, as this extraneous bodily work is not sustainable for prolonged amounts of time. Additionally, the fact that the female body has physical limitations as it relates to strength compared to the male body further emphasizes the extreme exploitation of the male figure that is placed on the woman's back, bearing his weight. The Black figure is running for her life and is being shot at by what appears to be a rabbit, which depicts extreme hierarchical systems and that an actual animal has more rights and is more humanized than a Black person will ever have. Studies have demonstrated that anxiety and other mental health disorders are highly correlated with IR. Anxiety and IR go hand in hand as marginalized individuals suffering from IR are continuously trying to mask their vulnerabilities behind a façade of perfectionism and hoping to be accepted by the majority group.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 8)

Healing from symptoms related to IR when viewing this detail of Walker's tableau *Camptown Ladies* may occur through the Black viewers allowing themselves to permit previously suppressed emotions to arise. The recognition of racist content within this artwork may elicit strong feelings within the person with IR as they are confronted with a reality related to the exploitation of Black people that they may prefer to dismiss. Therapeutic values can be found within the viewer's acknowledgment that racism has existed for centuries, exists today, and affects them. Since this image reaches far back in time and is referring to master/slave dynamics, the Black viewer may be able to tap into their transgenerational transmission of

trauma. This can be powerful so far as it allows the viewers to feel connected to their own racial community, rather than cut off from it. The fact that the art piece is overtly addressing power differentials and racism may allow a Black viewer to feel a desire to free themselves from oppressive forces that are felt on a personal, intrapersonal and institutional level. When the viewer is able to become aware of the dynamics of oppression, they may be able to liberate themselves from these oppressive systems and find a sense of strength in acting upon domination rather than suffering in silence and siding with the oppressor. Healing may also occur when the Black person with IR is able to recognize that their IR is strongly related to structural oppression and how their need for survival is intertwined with their tendency to cut off their own racial heritage. This image powerfully visualizes the complexities of survival and racism in the past and contemporary times, which may have substantial therapeutic powers as it invites the Black viewer to critically examine their own racial stereotypes.

Result Summary of Figure 8

This artwork produced by Kara Walker loudly speaks about exploitation and power differentials, as well as binary oppositions like White/Black, good/evil, male/female, that emphasize hierarchical value systems and categorize humans. Although this image strongly refers to a slave/master dynamic, it also translates into contemporary times speaking about White people's collective unconscious and how their privilege keeps the Black person at the bottom of the hierarchy. Kara Walker visualizes the dehumanization of the Black figure by literally depicting it as an animal, which addresses oppressive systems at large and how maintenance of these systems continuously denies Black people of their humanness. When being treated like an animal, the oppressed individual has been robbed of their ability to choose, which often leads to a survival mode for oppressed individuals, even if this may include rejecting their own racial

identity. It is the viewer's task to complete the narrative in their head and decide whether the figure rejects their racial heritage in order to live or whether they will stand up to power. Notions of IR may come up through projection of the Black figure's need to emotionally distance herself from these dehumanizing experiences by accepting her subhuman status as deserved. The artwork may support the Black viewer with IR as it visualizes complexities of survival and racism in the past and contemporary times, which may help them realize how long these systems have been in place, and it may also help them examine their own racial stereotypes.

Figure 9

Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original



Note. From “Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original”, by R. Colescott, 1984 (<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Robert%20Colescott>). Copyright 1984 by Robert Colescott. Reprinted with permission.

Stage 1: Description and Evoked Emotion (see Figure 9)

The painting *Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original* by Robert Colescott is highly evocative and thought-provoking as it speaks to unequal distributions of power as depicted in the Black woman who is nursing the White woman's grown child while neglecting two of her own infants. This can potentially bring up feelings of anger in the Black viewer, especially when taking historical facts into account, such as the breast of a slave woman, which was owned and controlled by the owner rather than by herself. The White female holding the Black female's crying infant seems to be either unaware of her dehumanizing act or is enjoying her power, as evidenced by her smile. Feelings of disgust may come up when viewing this painting, as the grown boy, dressed in a suit and a tie, is still enjoying the breast milk of a female who is not his mother. This scene reminds of how racism plays out interpersonally but also on a systemic level leading to injustices, including unequal access to goods and services, some of which may be essential to an individual's fundamental needs. This is illustrated by the breastfeeding mother's children crying due to a lack of their mothers' milk that they desperately need for healthy brain and physical development. This painting brings up anger as it clearly shows how these structures place the White woman at the top of the hierarchy while keeping the Black nursing female on the bottom. This scene makes one think how marginalized populations have to keep giving beyond what is normal or healthy, while the dominant group keeps on receiving, regardless of whether they need more resources. The fact that there seems to be a strong family bond between the mother and her two children in the background scene could potentially provide a sense of hope in the viewer as it emphasizes the importance of independence from hierarchical systems and family coherence over material goods. The painting

demonstrates the intrusion of the White world in the Black world and how this perpetuates racism and classism.

Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes (see Figure 9)

The primary themes associated with this artwork include exploitation, dehumanization, restrictions to one's own humanity, subordination, sadness, despair, hopelessness, helplessness, shame, anxiety, fear, observation of racist acts, self-hate, not fully human, inferiority, self-devaluation, limited self-expression, and health and mental health consequences of racism and IR. Exploitation is suggested by depicting the Black woman nursing a White grown child that does not belong to her, while the White presumed mother of the child watches over her and holds a neglected-looking Black baby.

Sadness is expressed through the downward gaze of the Black nursing figure and the crying baby. Notions of shame are found within the nursing woman's exposed breasts and the way Black figure, with a seemingly intact family, looks down upon her. The nursing female's own family is neglected, which is fear-inducing. The Black female in the background seems to oversee a racist act while holding her two children close to her. Self-devaluation is reflected through how the nursing woman is dressed and exposes herself while being a continuous milk source. Health and mental health consequences of racism and IR as a theme can be seen within the unhealthy and prolonged nursing period of another woman's grown child, while her own infants are falling short of care.

Stage 3: Integrative Analysis (see Figure 9)

The themes identified above fall in line with IR as they explore turning upon one's own family and racial heritage for the perceived benefits found through material goods.

Exploitation. In the painting, the nursing scene loudly speaks of exploitation as the White woman is clearly benefitting from the Black woman nursing her child. The fact that the White woman's child is older and well dressed further exacerbates the notion of exploitation as the Black woman's services are clearly not needed and only used to exert her power over her.

Dehumanization/Restrictions to one's Humanity/Subordination. The scene appears dehumanizing when looking at how exposed the Black female is in comparison to the White woman who is wearing a bathing suit. The most natural human thing for the Black female to do would be to nurse her own two infants. This clearly speaks to how restricted her own human expressions are. She appears subservient to the White woman, and it seems that she does not have a choice if she wants to live in a world that affords luxury goods such as high heels, makeup, or air travel. All these items may be symbols of a westernized, capitalistic world. Living in this world may come at a cost, which may be visualized by Colescott through depicting the Black female in the foreground as the victim of structural oppression, which is exacerbated by capitalistic values, while the Black female in the background has an intact family, but is not living in a world that is known for its superficial values such as fashion, style and a false sense of comfort.

Sadness/Despair/Hopelessness/Helplessness. Themes of sadness and despair are addressed by depicting the central Black figure in a way that may remind of these emotions. Her gaze is pointed downward, and her infant, held by the White female, is crying. The dynamics between the two women in the forefront seem to have gone on for some years, as evidenced by the Black woman nursing the White woman's grown child. This brings up themes of hopelessness and helplessness, as these dynamics are unlikely to change, and both women seem locked into their different roles, one as the oppressor and the other as the oppressed.

Shame. Shame has been expressed in several ways within this painting. First, by depicting the Black female in a way that exposes her breasts while looking downward in a shameful way. Secondly by showcasing the Black female in two divergent ways; one seems to align with White and Western, capitalistic values, even if it comes at the expense of being exploited, while the other Black female in the background seems to live a simpler but happier life that is characterized by close family bonds. This difference appears to address notions of shame, as one lifestyle seems to be much healthier than the other.

Anxiety/Fear. The only figures that seem to live in fear are the Black female and her two neglected infants. The painting addresses this by emphasizing the neglect and depicting the White female in a way that shows her superior status as evidenced by her smile, posture, and the fact that she towers over the Black seated female who is working for her. The fact that this dynamic is not easily escapable is highly anxiety and fear-provoking. The Black female in the foreground of the painting clearly has a family of her own and has to place her own wants and needs on hold in order to survive.

Observation of Racist Acts. The entire scene seems to be overlooked by a Black woman in the mountainous background who closely holds her two children. It appears as if she overlooks the dehumanizing and exploiting scene. A narrative unfolds between these two Black families depicted on the canvas that may remind of trans generational transmission of trauma due to involuntary migration and enslavement of Black people. The painting demonstrates this by depicting the female in the background without fashion items and with short afro hair amid nature, while the other female seems to be surrounded with fashion items, makeup, and other things that remind of parts of the world that took and still takes advantage of Black people (e.g., the USA or Europe).

Self-Hate/not Fully Human/Inferiority/Self-Devaluation. The Black female in the foreground of the painting is painted in such a compromising way that does not allow her to feel fully human. She is literally giving up parts of herself to satisfy the need of the White woman next to her. This notion of "giving up" does not seem voluntary, but rather a function of structural oppression. Her inferior status leads her to devalue herself and to reject parts of her Black heritage. This idea of self-devaluation becomes even clearer when looking at the other Black female in the background of the painting who manages to align with her racial values, which results in having an intact family and the ability to live an authentic life. The nursing scene in the painting may imply that the Black female hates herself as she is not looking after her own needs and instead neglects herself, her infants and quietly serves her White female boss who exploits her.

Limited Self-Expression. The Black female in the front part of the painting clearly seems to be limited in how she can express herself, as she is much too busy looking after other people's children and fulfilling her duties. The fact that she has two children of her own further supports this as her own private life and desires are entirely neglected as a mother and subservient, oppressed figure. The only form of self-expression seems to be in her fashion and makeup. It is unclear as to whether the furniture belongs to her or her White boss, but the fact that the furniture is placed outdoors may allude to the fact that it belongs to the Black nursing female as many rights have been robbed from her and withholding housing from her would fall in line with the rest of the oppressive narrative.

Health and Mental Health Consequences of Racism and IR. Exploitation and oppressive systems have adverse effects on oppressed people's health. This has been made evident in this painting by showing how one of her children is crying. Furthermore, breastfeeding

someone else's child has detrimental effects on one's health, especially if this greatly exceeds a standard nursing period and prohibits her from giving proper nutrition to her own infant. The nursing woman's entire lifestyle appears to be non-health promoting, and there does not seem to be an end in sight.

Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions (see Figure 9)

The painting may have therapeutic value for Black people struggling with IR in that it addresses themes of IR and racism in a very overt way that it may be easy for the viewer to tap into ways in which they internalize negative racial beliefs about themselves. Often people with IR struggle with anxiety and depression due to incongruence between their conceptualized self and their experienced self (Rogers, 1957). This dissonance seems to be depicted within this painting in so many different ways and helps the Black viewer tap into this discrepancy between IR represented in a damaged self-concept and the authentic, experiencing self suppressed to meet the demands of oppression. This exploration could potentially help a client with IR become more authentic and connect with their true value, worth, and humanity. This may become even more therapeutic when focusing on how one Black female in the painting is embracing her true self and appears content, while the other is rejecting parts of herself and seems unhappy. Helping the Black viewer tap into their primary emotions by looking at this piece of art can be helpful as IR is characterized by façades and secondary emotions. Façades and superficiality are visualized in this painting through its emphasis on consumer products such as fashion, air travel, furniture, etc., and how this has become important to the central Black figure who is nursing the White woman's child. Awareness of this could potentially help the Black person with IR tap into their primary emotion, which can ultimately lead to healing from IR. The painting seems to bring up themes around choice. This could have therapeutic value in that marginalized individuals have

been robbed of many choices as they live in a world that has been chosen for them. Freedom is always situated, and options may be limited (Weixel-Dixon, 2015), especially for those people who face racism on a daily basis. Thus, looking at the artwork can engender a sense of agency and allow the Black viewer to choose and construct a world that better fits their authentic needs.

The nursing figure appears to be invisible to the White woman behind her as her pain goes unnoticed. This sense of invisibility has a negative impact on people's sense of self-worth, which can lead a person with IR to seek corroboration from others. This had been visually depicted by showcasing the Black central figure with fashionable clothing, surrounded by other material goods as to say that she has taken over White people's values, which came at the cost of her own self-worth. Oppressed groups of people often struggle with a collective feeling of hopelessness and helplessness due to structural oppression that has been endured for centuries. Looking at this painting with Black people in a therapeutic setting can be helpful because it allows for an in-depth exploration of injustice, and research indicates that a critical view on society is a step towards finding a voice and instating personal change and critical action. (Watts & Voight, 2011). Thus, understanding that there is interconnectivity between people and the context within which they live is essential to note as a therapist. Showing this painting to a Black viewer with IR may help the person see how they have separated themselves from others to avoid feelings of rejection from the majority group. This may lead to a sense of self-acceptance, self-compassion, and might even lead to an interest in experiencing new things in life that are self-enhancing rather than self-destructing. The painting may support Black people, as it might help them connect with their own values by seeing how detrimental it can be when aligning with other people's values. Humanistic theories use the term *conditions of worth* to refer to the externally imposed conditions for approval that become internalized such that the person's sense

of their own value is tied to meeting those expectations (Rogers, 1957). Research indicates that this can lead to evaluating experiences in a manner that is not self-enhancing and can ultimately create a false self and compromise self-actualization (Mosher et al., 2008). These things may naturally come up for the viewer who struggles with IR, as Colecott clearly visualizes it in this piece of art.

Result Summary of Figure 9

This painting by Rober Colecott addresses the despair that comes from unequal distributions of power. This is depicted in the Black woman who is nursing the White woman's grown child while neglecting two of her own infants. This scene reminds of how racism plays out interpersonally but also on a systemic level leading to injustices such as continuous exploitation, far beyond one's capacity. It appears as if the Black figure in the foreground is giving up parts of herself to satisfy the need of the White figure and as if the notion of giving up does not seem voluntary but rather a function of structural oppression. Her inferior status leads her to devalue herself and reject parts of her Black heritage, leading to IR. The Black figure in the background stands in stark contrast to the one in the foreground, as she seems to embrace self-enhancing values as evidenced by her seeming content and to have an intact family. The therapeutic value of this painting for Black viewers with IR may be the realization that they have abandoned their authentic self in exchange for material goods, such as seen in the painting (e.g., Black figure in foreground's fashion, etc.).

Summary of Results

Table 6 presents a summary of the frequency of the IR themes identified in the selected paintings. Indications of shame were found in six out of the nine paintings suggesting the prominence of this emotional experience in relation to internalized racism. This is highly

consistent with the IR literature. Shame was expressed as a stand-alone theme in four artworks, but it was also present and accompanied with five other themes such as feeling flawed, not fully human, dehumanization, limited self-expression, and exploitation. The following four works presented shame as a stand-alone theme: work number 2 (i.e., *Supermodel*); work number 5 (i.e., *Ivy and the Janitor in January*); work number 6 (*A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self*); work number 9 (i.e., *Knowledge of the Past is the Key to the Future – the Original*). Shame was used as a stand-alone theme when the figure seemed isolated within its environment or isolated through the interaction with others and showed a desire to hide. Shame was combined with other IR themes in two works: number 4 (i.e., *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis*) and number 7 (i.e., *Randaleeza*). This may be due to the general complexity in which shame was visually expressed and due to the strong association between shame and the other categories noted above (i.e., feeling flawed, not fully human, dehumanization, limited self-expression, exploitation). Shame was combined with other Master Theme List clusters because of its strong correlation to these themes, which justified its conjunction with other categories of the Master Theme List. Furthermore, shame is relational in nature and frequently appears as it is a core component of IR. Three works did not include an analysis of the theme of shame. These works are number 1 (i.e., *From the Bush to Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!*) and number 3 (i.e., *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps*) and number 8 (i.e., *Camptown Ladies*).

Indications of fear and anxiety held equal representation to shame. Six out of nine artworks presented with themes of anxiety and fear. These works are number 4 (i.e., *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity crisis*), number 5 (i.e., *Ivy and the Janitor in January*), number 6 (*A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self*), number 7 (i.e., *Randaleeza*), number 8

(i.e., *Camptown Ladies*), and number 9 (i.e., *Knowledge of the Past is the Key to the Future – the Original*). A lack of safety, situations that escape an individual's control and exploitation all seemed to be represented and linked to anxiety and fear.

Only one out of the nine paintings clearly aligned with themes related to healing (i.e., Kehinde Wiley's *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps*), as it was associated with themes of power and empowerment as outlined in the Master Theme List. The artwork has several healing components for Black people, and it can evoke a sense of racial pride in the viewer due to identification with the heroic Black figure.

All nine works have the potential of bringing awareness to stigmatization by addressing themes related to racism, colorism, exploitation, dehumanization, etc. The Black viewer's increased awareness of IR can lead to the desire to reconnect with their racial heritage rather than aligning with the majority group. All paintings in this study have the ability to unlock previously suppressed emotions related to IR. While all works touch upon racism, only one work (i.e., number 8, *Camptown Ladies*) seems to depict enacted racism as a central theme. However, the artwork has a high potential for healing from IR, as outlined in stage 4. The work represents the long-lasting, cyclical nature of racism, and the literature supports the association between racism and IR.

Table 6

Summary of Final Themes in Analysis of Artworks

Theme	Frequency	Artworks
Anxiety/fear	6	4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9
Shame	6	2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9
Eurocentrism	5	1, 2, 3, 4, 7

Theme	Frequency	Artworks
Felling flawed	5	1, 4, 5, 7, 8
Inferiority	5	1, 2, 4, 5, 9
Self-devaluation	5	1, 2, 4, 5, 9
Dehumanization	4	1, 6, 7, 9
Exploitation	4	1, 4, 8, 9
Helplessness	4	4, 5, 7, 9
Hopelessness	4	4, 5, 7, 9
Limited self-expression	4	1, 2, 7, 9
Negative racial identity	4	1, 4, 5, 7
Not fully human	4	5, 7, 8, 9
Self-hate	4	1, 4, 5, 9
Discrimination	3	4, 6, 7
Health and mental health consequences of racism and IR	3	4, 8, 9
Hierarchy	3	1, 4, 5
Idealization of White people	3	1, 2, 4
Low self-esteem	3	1, 2, 4
Observation of racist acts	3	1, 7, 9
Sadness/Despair	3	4, 7, 9
Stereotypes	3	1, 6, 8
Subordination	3	1, 5, 9
Colorism	2	5, 6

Theme	Frequency	Artworks
Intra-group dynamic	2	1, 7
Intra-racial class tension	2	1, 7
Perpetrator-victim	2	4, 7
Self-doubt	2	4, 5
Turning against own people	2	1, 7
Violence	2	4, 7
Caricature	1	1
Cartoonish	1	1
Direct racism	1	3
Exaggeration of features	1	1
Freedom/liberation	1	3
Invisibility	1	6
Isolation	1	2
Objectification	1	1
Limited portrayal	1	1
Portrayal of racism	1	1
Power and empowerment	1	3
Restrictions to one's humanity	1	9
Self-stereotyping	1	6
Withdrawal	1	2

Chapter 5: Discussion

This dissertation's primary purpose was to (a) complete a comprehensive review of the literature associated with the concept of IR, and (b) analyze artworks created by Black artists whose works are selected based upon themes identified in the literature review. Furthermore, this dissertation intends to offer ways in which art made by Black artists that includes themes of IR can contribute to healing for Black people. The nine selected artworks used in this dissertation were selected based on ratings of degree of evoking emotion and IR themes. The artworks were analyzed in accordance with a four-stage process that included a description of the artwork and evoked emotion, identification of themes, integrative analysis, and implications for healing and intervention.

Theoretical Implications and Emerging Hypotheses

Themes of IR, as found in the literature, functioned as a guideline for the selection-making process for each artwork in the dissertation. It is important to note that the initial Master Theme List based on the author's review of the IR literature was modified through discussions with the chairperson in order to optimize the theme cluster. For instance, themes such as exploitation, objectification, nurturance, positive relationship, love, relational connection, invisibility, low self-worth, insignificance, and violence were added as a result of these discussions. Continued conceptual and empirical work to further define and operationalize IR is recommended. This could include studies on the effects of IR on mental health (e.g., depression) and racial identity (James, 2017; Molina & James, 2016), or conceptual clarification on how IR grows out of racism and the core conditions that maintain racial disparities (e.g., education, health, income, incarceration, etc.; Sullivan & Cross, 2016). Many themes found in the Master Theme List are closely related to racism while simultaneously describing phenomena found

within IR. IR is thus better understood within the context of racism. All paintings used for the dissertation have a strong link to themes related to racism while visually making clear that structural oppression leads to IR.

Structural Oppression

Structural oppression played a significant role in all paintings selected for this dissertation, as it showed a clear link to IR and how it can be visually expressed by Black artists. Ways in which this form of oppression was visualized included portrayals of Black people as a monolithic cultural group, which emphasized how systems of power can reduce an entire race to a color, exaggerated facial features, or stereotypical behaviors. Constructs like *invisibility* were frequently touched upon in the selected paintings, which is also highly correlated to structural oppression. This is supported by research around the notion of invisibility and structural oppression. A.J. Franklin (1999) describes his term *invisibility syndrome* as an inner struggle where one's ability, personality, and worth are not valued or even recognized due to prejudice. This description reminds of Banks and Stephens' (2018) view on racist systems. They state that these types of structures can only be upheld and justified when people of color are framed as inferior compared to the group of power and that this leads to marginalization of that group and increased power for the oppressor. Some paintings expressed the notion of invisibility more than others, but in all instances, Black individuals were depicted as having a lack of identity, which robbed them of their dignity and humanity. These findings are in line with A.J. Franklin's view of invisibility syndrome.

Other ways in which structural oppression came up as a theme within the paintings were through a visual depiction of Eurocentric notions of physical attractiveness and how they were adopted by some Black figures within selected art pieces. This non-negotiable Eurocentric

standard of beauty strongly reminds of power differentials between White and Black individuals and how people of European ancestry have historically asserted more power relative to other racial groups, and how their experiences and interpretations have dominated the American sociocultural landscape (Ani, 1994; Asante, 1999; Hacker, 1992; Oliver, 2001; Turner et al., 1984; Wilson, 1998).

Institutionalized racism was also expressed within the visualization of a denial of humanness to Black people. In several artworks, it became clear that oppressed Black figures found themselves in those situations not only due to personally mediated racism but also due to systems of power that strategically kept them from gaining control over their lives. One piece of art (i.e., number 8, *Camptown Ladies*) addressed structural oppression through visualizing exploitation along with a false sense of hope. Both constructs strongly relate to institutionalized racism in that it hides behind a façade of false promises and leads to uneven access to goods, which has a negative effect on life prospects and general health of those who are at the receiving end of oppression (Harrell, 2006; Molina & James, 2016). In some instances, the artworks showed the Black figure in ways that demonstrated that they endured a significant amount of pain (e.g., number 4 *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity crisis*; number 7 *Randaleeza*; number 8 *Camptown Ladies*), which also relates to institutionalized racism. These paintings reflect the literature that covers how Black people are historically viewed as impervious to pain and that majority groups think of them as resilient and having the ability to endure greater hardship than others and thus being resistant to pain (Pyke, 2010).

The concept of meritocracy surfaced in artwork number 1 (i.e., *From the Bush to Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!*) and artwork number 3 (i.e., *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps*) in that the Black figure is portrayed in a way that suggests that everyone is able to

achieve things in life and that all people, regardless of race, can achieve great accomplishments. Pyke (2010) described meritocracy as the obscuring of oppression as it suggests that advancements and opportunities for a group of people are based on achievements and skills, supporting cultural myths that racial disparities are solely based on objective standards and applied equally to all.

Colorism is a natural outcome of structural racism and is at the root of internal differentiation and inequality among people of color (Hall, 2005). The concept of colorism was apparent in many of the paintings within this dissertation. For racism, systems of power determine which group of people deserves better treatment than others based on White supremacist ideas regarding the superiority of White skin. Thus, Black individuals with lighter skin have frequently reaped the benefits of this and been valued more highly.

The phenomena of in-group out-group dynamics were explored in some of the paintings (e.g., number 1 *From the Bush to Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!*; number 4 *Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity crisis*; number 7 *Randaleeza*) within this dissertation. These dynamics are a function of institutionalized racism as structures of power categorize people into groups. The literature on this phenomenon indicates that individuals who strongly align with their in-group have less capacity of seeing the out-group's suffering as they are desensitized to the other group's life experiences (Ysseldyk et al., 2010). The lack of ability to step into another person's life experiences has been depicted in most all of the artworks as evidenced by either a lack of empathy for the out-group or a lack of awareness of their suffering. Several pieces of art also addressed the importance of one's strength of alignment with the beliefs of one's in-group and how people who strongly align with their in-group experience their

out-group as more threatening. This dichotomous and polarizing view was present in many art pieces and is a direct outcome of structural oppression.

The Black Figure in Art

It is a fact that art created by Black artists has historically been undervalued, ridiculed, and even called obscene and primitive (Wright, 1990). This has led the art consumer to believe that Western culture is the sole criterion by which to judge artworks (Raiford & Raphael-Hernandez, 2017). The result of this type of thinking and exclusion rendered art made by Black artists as superfluous. This did not only have a negative impact on Black artists but also left Black people out of the circuit as consumers, which further added to their invisibility. In the 1960s, during the second Black Renaissance, the Black artist claimed the right to exist and to be recognized in a Eurocentric culture that had always rejected them (Zabunyan, 2005). Society and the art world alike have been resistant to racial equality, which is manifested in harsh separatism between White and Black people as well as between the art produced by them. This divide is not due to a lack of quality in work made by Black artists, but rather a result of institutionalized racism (Gibson, 2005). Thus, the Black figure holds a powerful function within artworks, and the mere conscious and deliberate inclusion of the Black figure can have a large impact on the Black viewer, as this is not the norm. Kerry James Marshall points out that there are fewer representations of Black figures in the historical record and he expresses the importance of including this type of work into museums so they can be seen alongside everything else that people go into museums to look at (Tate Gallery, 2018). The Black figure has historically been banned from the art world, and this may be due to the fact that consuming and making art was and still is equated to power and privilege, which in turn is associated with the White figure, not the Black (Tate Gallery, 2018). Showing art that includes the Black body to the Black viewer is

impactful as it may counteract the underrepresentation of an entire racial group and allows them to come to the foreground. Looking at figurative art created by Black artists may elicit feelings of inclusion, empowerment, or acknowledgment in the Black viewer, as representation of the Black figure in art is still a novelty rather than the norm.

This dissertation introduces six different artists that all approach the Black figure in a different way. This difference is not only found within the style of painting but also the artist's own social, historical, and cultural context. Thus, it is essential to note that there is great diversity within the way Black artists approach the Black body in their work. This becomes even more important when thinking about the fact that the artworks selected for the dissertation have been created in different time periods. Elvan Zabunyan (2005) corroborates the importance of historical points when Black artists created work as he states that there are three distinct moments in history of the Black artists and that these moments impact the way the work was made. Zabunyan called the first phase *mainstream*, taking place in the 60s, during which African American artists conformed to the criteria of Western art. This was followed by what he termed *Blackstream* when African American artists revealed their Black identity by depicting their characters as Black through their skin color. However, these artists were not entirely opposed to the Western-style. The *Black Art Movement* is the third phase, characterized by total separatism with Western art traditions. It was built upon a militant language using clear codes of recognition specific to the Black community. All six artists used for this dissertation fall between stylistic ideas presented in *Blackstream* and the *Black Art Movement*. For instance, artwork number 3, *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps*, clearly borrows from Western art traditions while simultaneously critiquing the genre. The idea of introducing the Black body in paintings made by

Black artists may help the Black viewer tap into emotions they would normally suppress, avoid, or they might be unaware of.

Implications for Psychological Interventions Utilizing Art of Black Artists

Liberation Psychology

Liberation from oppression and IR can be facilitated by raising awareness that society has socialized them to play certain roles, such as the subordinate role, which perpetuates existing systems. The nine artworks in this dissertation aim to explore ways in which the Black viewer may become aware of their IR as they may encounter expressions of it within the paintings. From a liberation psychology perspective, this can be seen as related to Freire's concept of *problematization*, in that the artworks depict particular issues faced by oppressed populations from their own perspectives. Martin-Baro conceptualized problematization as focusing the content of recovered historical memory, which he called a de-ideologized understanding of current circumstances (Tate et al., 2013). This idea is very present in all nine paintings as recovering one's historical memory can occur when viewing imagery from a Black perspective. Artwork number 3, *Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps*, takes on altering the ideology of White European history and how a hero is presented. Martin Baro categorizes Liberation Psychology as the awakening of critical conscientization in the person and emphasizes that awareness is a process rather than a state (Tate et al., 2013). Critical consciousness is a process and continuous cycle of reflection and action consisting of three core components. More specifically, Watts and Voight (2011) define these steps as critical reflection, political efficacy, and critical action. Paul Freire's (2000) conscientization finds that people must become aware of oppressive forces and how they surface in their lives in order to take action against these inequities. The artworks may have the potential to bring about awareness in the Black viewer

through analyzing what they see and how this might relate to them. Therapy can be a space to explore the observed inequities in the artworks and initiate change and action within the individual. The process of becoming aware is inherent to viewing art, particularly within the nine selected artworks as they present confrontational subject matter related to IR. Maritza Montero and Sonn (2009) describe the conscientization process as allowing consciousness to be liberated from the dominant group and further states that it mobilizes emotions, as it is not restricted to cognitive processes.

Focusing on felt emotions, rather than on cognition, was key to relating to the nine artworks presented, as they capture ideas of shame, anxiety, self-doubt, negative racial identity, exploitation, etc. Furthermore, the artworks were measured on their emotional evocativeness and not on the way they are cognitively understood. The liberation process, as outlined by Montero (2011), is comparable to stage four in the analysis, which addresses the healing components of IR through viewing art made by Black artists. More specifically, Montero's liberation process may be comparable to this particular stage in the analysis, as healing might emerge from introducing the artworks in a therapeutic setting or Black community, which in turn may allow the viewer to develop an emotional connection to their experiences of racism and become more conscious of the racist dynamics that maintain their IR. Sonn and Quayle (2014) explore ways in which communities use their artistic and organizational skills to serve the emancipation and development of a community. While their focus is on making art, this dissertation is also interested in mobilizing the Black viewer with IR to become an active agent of their own change process within their community, which may engender a sense of belongingness.

Bryant-Davis and Moore-Lobban (2020) explore ways in which Black people can reclaim their identity through empowerment and building awareness. Liberation psychology

interventions are designed to address “the soul wounds of oppression” and to “resist internalized oppression” (Bryant-Davis & Moore-Lobban, 2020, p.198). Therapeutic interventions, as outlined by Bryant-Davis and Moore-Lobban (2020) include an in-depth exploration of shame as it relates to internalized racism, which in turn will bring up anger. In this dissertation research, the therapeutic value in looking at the nine paintings suggests the acknowledgment of past and current racial traumas, how they have led to IR, and offering a platform to explore those through images within a safe therapeutic environment. Furthermore, the artworks were in part selected due to their emotional evocativeness, including anger and how this is a natural response to being confronted with one’s own internalized racism.

Expressive Arts

Therapeutic interventions using expressive arts help explore feelings and experiences that cannot easily be verbalized. It has historically been used to help develop self-awareness, decrease anxiety, addictive behavior, and trauma symptoms, and increase self-esteem (American Arts Association, 2016). Expressing oneself artistically can potentially be helpful for Black people who suffer from IR, as it may provide them the freedom to express. Artworks used in this dissertation have the ability to bring up issues such as police violence or invisibility of the Black body in a White society. Literature about art-making suggests that an image can be more succinct than words and that this may be due to the fact that images play a central role in dreams, fantasies, and experiences. Additionally, art-making offers the opportunity to combat traumatic experiences, which are often stored in images (Herman, 1997).

Similarly, the act of looking and interpreting challenging artistic visuals, as presented in this dissertation, may offer access to suppressed memories of oppression. For instance, according to Devaney (2016), art can address cultural wounds and promote the healing process from

extreme suffering. From a neurological point of view, viewing art engages mirror neurons that elicit empathic responses, according to Kesner and Horáček (2017). The flexibility and plasticity inherent to visuals are unique, and Wedding and Corsini (2013) state that losses occur when an image is translated into thought and, eventually, language. This is important information, as the therapist showing the nine artworks to the Black viewer has to proceed with caution when shifting from the visual arena to spoken language. Internalized racism can be understood as the internalization of negative beliefs about one's race. Expressive art therapy would allow the person with IR to externalize symptoms related to IR and to start seeing them as apart of them and as a function of institutionalized racism. The creation of an art object outside of oneself can be a cathartic experience and allow for hidden feelings like rage or loss to arise. The process of externalization is a way of solidifying something intangible, which may occur when viewing the nine artworks as the viewer may have had no words to describe their feelings related to their IR. Expressive arts have the potential to foster an empowered self-image, and the art-making process can have a soothing quality and combat feelings of depression associated with racial trauma (Wadeson, 2010). Expressive art making allows for a shift from thinking to exploring feelings and can help gain insight into one's internal process. Art viewing is associated with managing pain and stress, which was proven effective amongst all social and ethnic groups (Arts Council England, 2004). Raiford and Raphael-Hernandez (2017) state that art's exposure can encourage healing among African diasporic peoples leading to interconnectedness. The hypothesis is that looking at the selected nine artworks will help the Black viewer with IR access a realm of interpretation related to their own negative race-based experiences while tapping into their emotions. Viewing figurative art allows the viewer to associate with the figure depicted in an artwork and can elicit an affective response (Kesner & Horáček, 2017).

Counseling Black People

It is important to consider alternative treatment methods for African Americans, as traditional counseling practices have historically demonstrated higher treatment dropouts and a shorter time spent in therapy when compared to other minority groups. Furthermore, when Black people are engaged in treatment, their outcomes are less successful (Aponte et al., 1995; Murphy, et al., 2014). These negative findings reflect the effects of racism in the treatment process including how oppression has led to distrust of counseling services (Harris, 1998; McNeil et al., 2002; Smith & Wermeling, 2007), as well as the potential lack of cultural fit of psychotherapy for Black people. This warrants for other forms of treatment that might be preferred by Black people, as a Eurocentric mentality in psychology has neglected the needs of ethno racial minorities and lessened the quality of services they receive (McNeil et al., 2002). Furthermore, some evidence suggests that treating clients in a more culturally sensitive manner can reduce premature dropout, which includes culturally congruent interventions and culturally competent therapists (Hwang, 2006). This dissertation has implications for treatment possibilities that include the cultural contributions and artistic output of Black people, in an effort to communicate directly to the Black experience, which includes knowledge of the existence of IR and how it is related to racism.

Racial Identity

One major goal for treatment when working with Black populations with IR should be to strengthen and affirm their racial-cultural identity. The nine artworks used feature themes related to invisibility, shame, fear, self-devaluation, exploitation, etc., and offer an entry to explore one's racial identity and pride. Mutisya and Ross (2005) discuss the positive benefits of being exposed to art and literature from one's racial and cultural group. The use of the nine artworks holds the

function of exposing an individual to Black cultural contributions while simultaneously addressing the thought-provoking messaging that speaks to a shared experience of racism encountered in America. Racial socialization aids to prepare children to live in a diverse outside world while providing a sense of strength and community through a context of a larger racial community (French et al., 2013). Black clients in psychotherapy may react strongly to the nine paintings as these images reflect the challenges of a diverse world filled with inequities. While they are not per se educational, as racial socialization is, they offer an entry point to unknown territories related to one's race-based trauma. Anti-racism education, including an exploration of institutionalized racism and providing a historical context of oppression, is another critical component of racial socialization (Corneau & Stergiopoulos, 2012). The nine artworks directly speak to historical oppression and institutionalized racism, and the perception of Black figures by the media and society.

In regard to intersectionality, the nine artworks bring up themes of gendered racism that might particularly affect the Black female viewer. This is essential, as gendered racism is a unique form of oppression experienced by Black women who are targeted for their Blackness and their femaleness at the same time and this accumulative experience can lead to heightened distress (Thomas et al., 2008). Stereotypical gender roles are evident in multiple works, emphasizing power differentials and establishing the female figure as subservient. Themes of gendered racism need to be further explored, specifically in regard to the responsibility a therapist holds when presenting these artworks to Black female clients with IR. It is crucial to also address the fact that Black men's issues play an important role within some of the selected artworks in this dissertation. Gendered racism is demonstrated through societal stereotypic images of both men and women of color. For instance Black men are frequently stereotyped as

criminal, hypersexual (Miller, 2019) and absent fathers (Thomas et al., 2008; Schwing et al., 2013). Closer analysis regarding gendered racism is recommended for future research.

Other Forms of Treatment for Black People

While research about racism and the positive benefits of viewing visual art is unavailable, a study spoke to the importance of identity formation through Black racial representation in media and how this is a valuable mechanism in the identity formation process for Black adolescents (Ellithorpe & Bleakley, 2017). This speaks to the power of representation and ways in which a Black public can feel included and engaged. The thought of inclusion and identity formation may also extend to visual art made by Black artists that represent Black figurative works. The importance of expressive arts is suggested by Harrell (2018) in her soulfulness approach, as it explicitly suggests that art functions in the service of liberation. The hope is that the creative aspect of viewing art may allow the Black viewer to have an authentic reaction and experience to the work that can lead to feeling liberated and will enable the viewer to resist oppressive forces. Harrell (2018) points out the importance of themes reflected in an African cultural ethos such as orality (storytelling, drumming, song, etc.) and expressive creativity and inventive improvisation. As outlined in Harrell's conceptualization, these themes are highly related to the expression of art, which indicates that forms of emotional expression can have healing capacities.

The viewing of art is more than just looking at. It takes an active participation, engagement, and thoughtful reflection when contemplating the art one is confronted with. This contemplation should preferably not be limited to the artwork itself, but rather be extended to thoughts about self, the world, and difficult life experiences (Linesh, 2004; Peacock, 2012; Silverman, 2010). Bill Traylor, a Black, highly prolific artist born into slavery and an eyewitness

to history, makes political statements in his artworks that depict powerful distillations of tales and memories. Traylor produced 1500 works between the age of 85 and 96 while being homeless. This implies that he felt compelled to share his life story through art and that it supported him during a very challenging time in life (Smithsonian American Art Museum, 2019). The memories of oppressive systems are reflected in his artworks that are forms of visual storytelling (Smithsonian American Art Museum, 2019). Bill Traylor's works embody a sense of determination and perseverance that is palpable to a viewer. The nine artworks selected for the dissertation carry messages from the artist but also broadly speak to the Black experience. The psychological function of art is not just in making art but also in viewing art. If Bill Traylor used art-making as a non-verbal method of processing a complex and traumatic history he lived through, the hypothesis of the dissertation is that others would be able to tap into aspects of the artist's experience. Art-making and art viewing may be used as a way of gathering visual themes to make sense of a world that is none inclusive and oppressive.

Recommendations for Integrating Art Created by Black Artists into Treatment with Black People

It is important to note that the nine paintings selected for this dissertation have never been implemented into treatment, and further research is needed to evaluate how to best deliver treatment in a way that demonstrates high validity. It is strongly recommended that a therapist utilizing emotionally evocative art should carefully consider the timing and readiness of the client to view imagery that may bring up issues of racial identity, injustice and where they find themselves within these challenging issues. In this case, it would be desirable to further evaluate whether showing the paintings to Black clients who suffer from IR would actually bring up issues related to IR for those clients. As interventions are developed utilizing art, it is suggested

that the artworks be introduced through a standardized process so that the reactions from a client can be compared over time to monitor if treatment is effective. It is important to note that the subjective nature of art and the high variability within the way clients demonstrate symptoms related to IR would be expected to yield a range of results. It is particularly important to recognize that viewing emotionally evocative artworks could be re-traumatizing to clients and that therapists should be trained on trauma-informed practices such as grounding and physiological regulation. For instance, mindfulness and increased awareness have been associated with reduced posttraumatic stress disorder symptoms (Smithsonian American Art Museum, 2019; Stephenson et al., 2017). Sufficient preparation of clients prior to utilizing the artworks and assessment of client readiness and ability to face their traumatic memories would be imperative and a critical process.

With this in mind, it is imperative that the therapist introducing the paintings to Black clients is well informed about the lived experience of Black people, their sociocultural and sociopolitical factors, ways in which Black people like to express themselves (e.g., music, dance, spoken word, art, etc.), as well as the many ways in which they have been oppressed and continue to be oppressed. It is crucial that the therapist has a deep understanding and awareness of individual, cultural, and racial differences and an ability to demonstrate sensibility to their Black clients. The therapist has to be aware of their own beliefs, assumptions, values, and sociocultural identity and an understanding of how these intersect in the therapeutic relationship. Furthermore, therapists using the nine paintings in treatment would have to gain a deep understanding of IR and how it is maintained within a social structure that is designed to reinforce the status quo related to racial superiority and inferiority (Harrell, 2006). Additionally, it is essential that the client will not be pathologized and that the therapist understands that IR

can be conceptualized as appropriated oppression, which emphasizes the fact that negative messages are modeled by the oppressor and are appropriated as the truth by the oppressed group (Campon & Carter, 2015; Tappan, 2006). This would in the service of delivering the intervention in such a ways that would likely yield more positive outcomes. With respect to general orientation, therapeutic approaches such as client-centered and those informed by liberation psychology would allow the client to hold power in the session, which is extremely important when providing therapy to individuals whose power has been robbed from them (Buhin & Vera, 2009).

For this reason, it may be essential to let the clients not only look at the nine paintings but to provide an atmosphere that offers a space for them to choose the specific works that resonates with them most strongly. It should be the therapist's task to decrease any anxieties felt on the Black client's part for looking at artworks. An in-depth discussion around identification with certain figures or themes found within the paintings could facilitate healing over time, and the therapist would do well in allowing for free association and slowing down the talking process when the client is looking at the paintings as words may come slower than the emotions evoked from looking at the artworks. It could be useful to encourage some clients to journal in or outside of session. It is recommended that the therapist engage the process of exploring artworks with clients with a beginner's mind (Graham, 2014) and show genuine curiosity in the way the client sees and interprets the artworks, as they are the holder of their memories and experiences around IR and racism, not the therapist. This mindset is said to promote empathy, compassion, and awareness of other people's suffering and a wish to help them. Having no preconceived ideas or opinions may allow for the artworks to speak for themselves, rather than being impacted by the therapist's views on them. Finally, at some points in treatment, it may be helpful to provide some

form of psychoeducation about IR and how it is related to racism as it can lower feelings of guilt and shame for rejecting parts of their racial heritage.

Recommendations for Future Research

Future research using this methodology should involve more than two independent raters and examine how their characteristics and backgrounds influence how they rate the artworks. In this study, it is important to note that there was a significant discrepancy between the two raters' research experiences, particularly around race-based stress. Additionally, the raters were born and raised in different parts of the world (i.e., U.S. versus Germany), which undoubtedly had an impact on discussions about the dissertation (e.g., exposure to racism in Europe versus in the U.S.). A more extensive qualitative research study could involve clients/participants with IR who would go through the process of viewing the nine artworks and answering a series of questions designed after the Master Theme List to categorize their responses. This would offer a deeper understanding of how others, outside of the two raters, experience the paintings as it relates to IR. This could potentially yield important information, as the nine artworks selected for this dissertation would be implemented in treatment, thus revealing valuable feedback regarding the extent to which an artwork actually reflects themes of IR. The construct of emotional evocativeness has been vague, and future research would benefit from operationalizing this term in order to better analyze the data. Additionally, the current Master Theme List is rather elaborate. A more concise one would narrow down the themes related to IR and therefore have a higher likelihood of targeting themes within the artworks that are associated with IR and avoid redundancies.

Limitations and Contributions

Limitations to take into account are that visual art communicates differently to different people, as it is highly subjective in nature. This dissertation used artworks that touched upon IR but simultaneously addressed other themes, including racism, classism, and other ism-related issues. This may have an impact on the validity of the results as non-IR related themes might impact the viewer.

Additionally, it is important to note that the analysis was conducted through the lens of the researcher, who had subjective and emotional reactions to the paintings. It is likely that other people would react differently to the selected works. The researcher's identity as an artist with an arts education from the Netherlands, who's personal artwork involved racial and autobiographical themes, has likely shaped the decision-making process for selecting the artists and the way they were analyzed through the lens of IR. The researcher's training may have mitigated this in vacillating between objectivity and subjectivity in regard to viewing a work. However, aspects of the researcher's own historical experience as a Black woman growing up in South Germany in a biracial home has had an impact on the way IR literature was understood and analyzed, which in turn may have affected the inclusion of themes in the Master Theme List. Moreover, the researcher was born and raised in Germany, and exposure to American art was limited to theory until later on in life. The researcher's view of America while living in Europe (e.g., America as a cultural leader and land of opportunities) has changed due to increased insight into the sociopolitical challenges and historical inequities in the U.S. This realization has impacted the way artworks were selected and analyzed (e.g., feeling strongly about the inclusion of artwork number 8, *Camptown Ladies*, due to its strong association to racism in America).

It is also essential to think about the popularity of the artists used in this dissertation. Many people are familiar with Kehinde Wiley's work, while other artists are not as well known. This may skew the outcome data when utilizing these paintings in session. There is a high likelihood that clients gravitate towards what feels familiar rather than which artwork actually evokes emotions related to IR. Furthermore, when selecting the paintings for therapy, the therapist would benefit from expanding on the nine artworks used, as these were chosen for research purposes. Further research is needed to guide therapists in selecting paintings to use with clients. Additionally, only one artwork clearly addressed themes related to liberation and empowerment, which are invaluable components to healing from IR. Future selection of artwork should include works that have the potential of engendering feelings of empowerment in the Black viewer. However, works that emphasize liberation and empowerment are less likely to encapsulate themes of IR.

A significant strength of this dissertation is its novel and unique approach to IR, as viewing art has the ability to open a path to addressing symptoms related to IR that other forms of communication would not be able to accomplish. Furthermore, looking at these artworks may alleviate feelings of shame associated with IR as the client could discuss the artworks rather than themselves. Exploring and processing the effects of artworks in therapy may offer a unique entry point to difficult emotions, such as shame, anger, self-hate, numbing, exploitation, etc. Moreover, race-based traumatic experiences may be easier accessed through visuals than words. However, more research is needed to confirm the association between an image and traumatic memory. Unearthing race-based trauma is highly confrontational, and the approach of non-verbal cues in therapy has the potential to reach into conscious and unconscious levels of trauma.

Other strengths of this research are the fact that viewing figurative and representational artworks incorporates a sense of storytelling, which is a critical component when working with African American clients (Harrell, 2018). Lastly, using artworks in therapy that reflect the lived experience of Black clients expands upon the expectations of what they might typically encounter in a therapy practice, which may be more inviting. A therapist may be able to utilize the confrontational nature of the selected artworks to help clients with IR become more conscious about the biases they hold regarding racial matters. A therapist who is well trained in trauma-focused treatments has the ability to recognize the readiness of the client and their ability to delve into their trauma history. There is a natural tendency for traumatized individuals to avoid memories, emotions and thoughts related to the trauma. One effective trauma treatment is gradual exposure to the feared memory with the aim of reclaiming one's life from the traumatic experience (Rothbaum et al., 2019). The images used in this dissertation are not representations of a client's life, but may offer similarities. This is essential as the client can approach the subject without entirely reliving it, which is different from trauma treatments including prolonged exposure or Cognitive Processing Therapy (Chard et al., 2012; Hendriks et al., 2017; Rothbaum et al., 2019).

In conclusion, this dissertation explores internalized racism by analyzing emotionally evocative artworks made by significant Black artists who challenge race relations in a White dominant world. This unique approach brings acknowledgment to the valued cultural input of art created by Black artists and offers a platform to analyze these charged works and their potential impact on the Black viewer.

REFERENCES

- Abney, N. C. (2008). *Randaleeza* [Acrylic on canvas].
<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Nina%20Chanel%20Abney>
- Abney, N. C. (2009). *Ivy and the janitor in January* [Acrylic on canvas].
<https://www.artsy.net/search?page=2&term=Nina%20Chanel%20Abney>
- Akbar, N. (1996). *Breaking the chains of psychological slavery*. Mind Productions.
- American Art Therapy Association. (2016). *What is art therapy?*
<http://www.arttherapy.org/upload/whatisarttherapy.pdf>.
- American Psychology Association (2016). Stress in America: The impact of discrimination. Stress in American Survey.
- Anderson, C. (1994). *Black labor, White wealth: The search for power and economic justice*. Duncan & Dunkan.
- Ani, M. (1994). *Yurugu: An African-centered critique of European cultural thought and behavior*. African World Press.
- Aponte, J. F., Rivers, R.Y., & Whohl, J. (1995). *Psychological interventions and cultural diversity*. Allyn & Bacon.
- Arredondo, P., & Rosen, D. C. (2007). Applying principles of multicultural competencies, social justice, and leadership in training and supervision. In E. Aldorado (Ed.), *Advancing social justice through clinical practice* (pp.443-458). Lawrence Erlbaum.
- Arts Council England, 2004. *Arts in health: A review of the medical literature*.
<https://www.americansforthearts.org/sites/default/files/ArtsHealthReviewMedicalLiterature.pdf>

- Asante, M. K. (1999). *The painful demise of Eurocentrism: An Afrocentric response to critics*. African World Press.
- Bailey, T. K. M., Chung, B., Williams, W. S., Singh, A. A., Terrell, H. K. (2011). Development and validation of the internalized racial oppression scale for Black individuals. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 58(4), 481-493. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0023585>
- Baldwin, J. A. (1979). Theory and research concerning the notion of Black self-hatred: A review and reinterpretation. *The Journal of Black Psychology*, 5(2), 51-77.
- Banks, W. C. (1976). White preference in Blacks: A paradigm in search of a phenomenon. *Psychological Bulletin*, 83(6), 1179- 1186. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0033-2909.83.6.1179>
- Banks, K. H. & Stephens, J. (2018). Reframing internalized racial oppression and charting a way forward. *Social Issue and Policy Review*, 12(1), 91-111. <https://doi.org/10.1111/sipr.12041>
- Barrett, A., Kajamaa, A., & Johnston, J. (2020). How to be reflexive when conducting qualitative research. *The Clinical Teacher*, 17, 9-12. <https://doi.org/10.1111/tct.13133>
- Bartky, S. L. (1990). *Femininity and domination: Studies in the phenomenology of domination*. Routledge.
- Belgrave, F. Z., Cherry, V. R., Cunningham, D., Walwyn, S., Letlaka-Rennert, K. & Phillips, F. (1994). The influence of Africentric values, self-esteem, and Black identity on drug attitudes among African American fifth graders: A preliminary study. *Journal of Black Psychology*, 20(3), 143-156. [https://doi.org/10.1002/\(SICI\)1520-6629\(199709\)25:5<421::AID-JCOP4>3.0.CO;2-V](https://doi.org/10.1002/(SICI)1520-6629(199709)25:5<421::AID-JCOP4>3.0.CO;2-V)
- Bell, C. C. (1996). Treatment issues for African American men. *Psychiatric Annals*, 26(1), 33-36.

- Bonilla-Silva, E. (2009). *Racism without racists: Color-blind racism and the persistence of racial inequality in the United States* (2nd ed.). Rowman & Littlefield.
- Brooks, R. L. (1996). *Integration or separation?: A strategy for racial equality*. Harvard University Press.
- Brown, T. (2003). Critical race theory speaks to the sociology of mental health: Mental health problems produced by racial stratification. *Journal of Health and Social Behavior*, 44, 292-301.
- Bryant, W. W. (2011). Internalized racism's association with African American male youth's propensity for violence. *Journal of Black Studies*, 42(4), 690-707.
- Bryant-Davis, T. (2017). Healing requires recognition: The case for race-based traumatic stress. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35(1), 135-143.
- Bryant-Davis, T., & Moore-Lobban, S. J. (2020). In L. Comas-Díaz & E. Torres Rivera (Eds.). Liberation psychology: Theory, method, practice, and social justice: Black minds matter: Applying liberation psychology to Black Americans (Ed.), *Black minds matter* (pp. 189-206). American Psychological Association.
- Buhin, L., & Vera, E. M. (2009). Preventing racism and promoting social justice: Person-centered and environment-centered interventions. *The Journal of Primary Prevention*, 30, 43-59. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10935-008-0161-9>
- Burkley, M., & Blanton, H. (2008). Endorsing negative in-group stereotypes as a self-protective strategy: Sacrificing the group to save the self. *Journal of Experimental Social Liberation*. Springer. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jesp.2007.01.008>
- Burton, M. & Kagan, C. (2009). Towards a really social psychology: Liberation psychology beyond Latin America. In M. Montero & C.C. Sonn (Eds.), *Psychology of Liberation*. Springer.

- Burton, L. M., Bonilla-Silva, E., Ray, V., Buckelew, R., & Freeman, E. H. (2010). Critical race theories, colorism, and decade's research on families of color. *Journal of Marriage and Family*, 72, 440-459.
- Bynum, G. L. (2011). Kant's conception of respect and African American education rights. *Educational Theory*, 61(1), 17-40.
- Cahan, S. (2016). *Mounting frustration: The museum in the age of Black power*. Duke University Press.
- Campon, R. R., & Carter, R. T. (2015). The appropriated racial oppression scale: Development preliminary validation. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 21(4), 497-506. <https://doi.org/10.1037/cdp0000037>
- Cardwell, E. (2015). Jean-Michel Basquiat and the immortal Black life. <https://www.hyperallergic.com/205586/jean-michel-basquiat-and-the-immortal-Black-life/>
- Carlson, E. D., Engebretson, J., & Chamberlain, R. M. (2006). Photovoice as a social process of critical consciousness. *Qualitative Health Research*, 16, 836-852.
- Carter, R. T. (2007). Racism and psychological and emotional injury: Recognizing and assessing race-based traumatic stress. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35, 13-105.
- Chard, K. M., Ricksecker, E. G., Healy, E. T., Karlin, B. E., & Resick, P. A. (2012). Dissemination and experience with cognitive processing therapy. *Journal of Rehabilitation Research and Development*, 49(5), 667-678.
- Checkoway, B. (2009). Community change for diverse democracy. *Community Development Journal*, 44, 5-21.
- Clark, K. B., & Clark, M. P. (1947). Racial identification and preference among negro children.

- In E. L. Hartley (Ed.), *Readings in social psychology*. Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.
- Colescott, R. (1984). *Knowledge of the past is the key to the future: The original* [Acrylic on canvas]. <https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Robert%20Colescott>
- Colescott, R. (1990). *Grandma and the Frenchman – identity crisis* [Oil on canvas]. <https://www.artsy.net/artist/robert-colescott/works-for-sale>
- Constantine, M. G. (2007). Racial microaggressions against African American clients in cross-racial counseling relationships. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 54(1), 1-16.
- Corneau, S., & Stergiopoulos, V. (2012). More than being against it: Anti-racism and anti-oppression in mental health services. *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 49(2), 261-282. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1363461512441594>
- Crocker, J., & Major, B. (1989). Social stigma and self-esteem: The self-protective properties of stigma. *Psychological Review*, 96(4), 608-630. <https://doi.org/10.1037//0033-295X.96.4.608>
- Cross, W.E. (1971). The Negro-to black conversion experience: Towards a psychology of black liberation. *Black World*, 20, 13-27.
- Cross, W. E. (1991). *Shades of Black: Diversity in African American identity*. Temple University Press.
- Dalrymple, J., & Burke, B. (1995). *Anti-oppressive practice. Social care and the law*. Open University Press.
- David, E. J. R. (Ed.). (2013). *Internalized oppression: The psychology of marginalized groups*. Springer Publishing Company.
- Delgado, R., & Stefancic, J. (Eds.). (2000). *Critical race theory: The cutting edge* (2nd ed.).

Temple University Press.

Derman-Sparks, L., & Phillips, C. B. (1997). *Teaching/learning antiracism. A developmental approach*. Teachers College Press.

Devaney, J. (2016). *Can art heal cultural wounds?*

<https://upliftconnect.com/can-art-heal-cultural-wounds/>

Diemer, M. A. (2016). Critical consciousness: A development approach to addressing oppression. *Child Development Perspectives*, 10(4), 216-221.

<https://doi.org/10.1111/cdep.12193>

Dominelli, L. (1997). *Anti-racist social work*. MacMillan Press.

Donavan, R. A., West, L. M. (2015). Stress and mental health: Moderating role of the strong Black woman stereotype. *Journal of Black Psychology*, 41(4), 384-396.

<https://doi.org/10.1177/0095798414543014>

Du Bois Shaw, G. (2004). *Seeing the unspeakable, the art of Kara Walker*. Duke University Press.

Dyson, M. E. (2005). *Is Bill Cosby right? Or has the Black middle class lost its mind?* Basic Books.

Eliezer, D., Townsend, S. S., Sawyer, P. J., Major, B., & Mendes, W. B. (2011). System-justifying beliefs moderate the relationship between perceived discrimination and resting blood pressure. *Social Cognition*, 29, 303-321.

Ellithorpe, M. E., & Bleakley, A. (2017). Wanting to see people like me? Racial and gender diversity in popular adolescent television. *Journal of Youth and Adolescence*, 45(7),

1426-1437. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10964-016-0415-4>

Encyclopedia Britannica (2020). Art. <http://www.britannica.com/art/visual-arts>.

- Faber, D. L., & Mendelowitz, D. M. (2012). *A Guide to drawing* (8th ed.). Learning.
- Fanon, F. (1967). *Black skin White masks*. Grove Press.
- Fine Art America (2014). *Branded with the fleur-de-lis. A symbolic link to slavery – the code noir of the Black code*. <https://fineartamerica.com/featured/branded-with-fleur-de-lis-a-symbolic-link-to-slavery-the-code-noir-or-the-Black-code-nicole-jean-louis.html>
- Finlay, L. (2002). “Outgoing” the researcher: The provenance, process, and practice of reflexivity. *Qualitative Health Research*, 12(4), 531-545.
- Finley, C., Raiford, L., & Raphael-Hernandez, H. (2019). Visualizing protest: African diasporic art and contemporary Mediterranean crossings. *Journal of Transnational American Studies*, 10(1), 315-332.
- Fleurs-de-lis Designs. (2020). *The fleur-de-lis*. <https://www.fleurdelis.com/fleur.htm>
- Franklin, A. J. (1999). Invisibility syndrome and racial identity development in psychotherapy and counseling African American men. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 27(6), 761-793.
- Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. Herder and Herder.
- French, S. E., Coleman, B. R., & DiLorenzo, M. L. (2013). Linking racial identity, ethnic identity, and racial-ethnic socialization: a tale of three race-ethnicities. *An International Journal of Theory and Research*, 13, 1-45.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15283488.2012.747438>
- Frye, M. (2000). Oppression In A. Minas (Ed.), *Gender Basics: Feminist perspectives on women and men* (2nd). Wadsworth.
- Gaines, C. (2017). *Kerry James Marshall*. Phaidon Press.
- Gibson, A. E. (2005). *Cosmopolitan modernism. Norman Lewis: How to get Black*. The MIT Press.

- Goldman, R. N. (2016). *Humanistic psychotherapies: Handbook of research and practice, second edition*. American Psychological Association.
- González-Prendes, A. A., Thomas, S. A. (2009). Culturally sensitive treatment of anger in African American women: A single case study. *Clinical Case Studies*, 8(5), 383-402.
- Gould, N. (1994). Anti-racist social work: A framework for teaching and action. *Issues in social work education*, 14(1), 2-17.
- Graham, C. G. (2014). Beginner's mind. *Therapy Today*, 25(5), 22
- Graham, J. R., West, L. M., Martinez, J., & Roemer, L. (2016). The mediating role of internalized racism in the relationship between racist experiences and anxiety symptoms in a Black American sample. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 22(3), 36-376.
- Hacker, A. (1992). *Two nations: Black and White, separate, hostile, unequal*. Charles Scribner's Sons. <https://doi.org/10.5860/CHOICE.30-1237>
- Hagiwara, N., Alderson, C. J., & McCauley, J. M. (2015). "We get what we deserve": The belief in a just world and its health consequences for Blacks. *Journal of Behavioral Medicine*, 38(6), 912-921. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10865-015-9652-3>
- Hall, R. (2005). The Euro-Americanization of race: Alien perspective of African Americans vis-à-vis trivialization of skin color. *Journal of Black Studies*, 36(1), 116-128.
- Hall, G. C., Yip, T., & Zarate, M. A. (2016). On becoming multicultural in a monocultural research world: A conceptual approach to studying ethnocultural diversity. *American Psychologist*, 71(1), 40-51. <https://doi.org/10.1037/a0039734>
- Hanna, F. J., Talley, W. B., & Guindon, M. H. (2000). The power of perception: Toward a model

- of cultural oppression and liberation. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 78(4), 430-441.
- Harrell, S. P. (2000). A multidimensional conceptualization of racism-related stress: Implications for the well-being of people of color. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 70(1), 42-57.
- Harrell, S. P. (2006). Racism and Discrimination. In Y. Jackson (Ed.), *Encyclopedia of Multicultural Psychology*. Sage.
- Harrell, S. P. (2018). Soulfulness as an orientation to contemplative practice: Culture, liberation, and mindful awareness. *The Journal of Contemplative Inquiry*, 5(1), 9-39.
- Harris, H. L. (1998). Ethnic minority elders: Issues and interventions. *Educational Gerontology*, 24, 309-323.
- Hatzenbuchler, M. L. (2016). Structural stigma: Research evidence and implications for psychological science. *American Psychologist*, 71(8), 742-751.
- Hendriks, L., de, K. R. A., Heyvaert, M., Becker, E. S., Hendriks, G. J., & van, M. A. (2017). Intensive prolonged exposure treatment for adolescent complex posttraumatic stress disorder: A single-trial design. *Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry, and Allied Disciplines*, 58(11), 1229-1238. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jcpp.12756>
- Herman, J. L. (1997). *Trauma and recovery: The aftermath of violence from domestic abuse to political terror*. Basic Books. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1471-6402.1994.tb00301.x>
- Hill, C. E., Knox, S., Thompson, B. J., Hess, S. A., Knox, S. Nutt-Williams, E., & Ladany, N. (2005). Consensual qualitative research: An update. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 52(2), 196-205.
- Hopton, J. (1997). Anti-discriminatory practice and anti-oppressive practice. *Critical Social Policy*, 17, 47-61.
- Hughes, D., Rodriguez, J., Smith, E. P., Johnson, D. J., Stevenson, H. C., & Spicer, P. (2006).

- Parent's ethnic-racial socialization practices: A review of research and direction for future study. *Developmental Psychology*, 42, 747-770.
- Hurst, T. E. (2015). Internalized racism and commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC). *Race Gender and Class*, 22(1-2), 90-101.
- Hwang, W. C. (2006). The psychotherapy adaptation and modification framework. *American Psychologist*, 61(7), 702-715.
- Jacobs, C. C., & Bowles, D. D. (Eds.).(1988). *Ethnicity and race: Critical concepts in social work*. National Association of Social Workers.
- James, D. (2017). Internalized racism and past-year major depressive disorder among African Americans: The role of ethnic identity and self-esteem. *Journal of Racial and Ethnic Health Disparities*, 4(4), 659. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40615-016-0269-1>
- James, D. (2020). Health and health-related correlates of internalized racism among racial/ethnic minorities: A review of the literature. *Journal of Racial and Ethnic Health Disparities*, 7(4), 785-806. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40615-020-00726-6>
- Jones, C. P. (2000). Levels of racism: A theoretic framework and a Gardner's tale. *American Journal of Public Health*, 90, 1212-1215.
- Jones, J. M. (1997). *Prejudice and racism* (2nd ed.) McGraw-Hill Humanities, Social sciences & World Languages.
- Jones, J. M. (2006). From racial inequality to social justice: the legacy of Brown vs. Board and lessons from South Africa. *Journal of Social Issues*, 62(4), 885-909.
- Jones, J. M. (2019). Doing diversity: creating spaces, opportunities, and change. *Association for Psychological Science*, 14(1), 43-48. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1745691618803637>
- Jost, J. T. & Banaji, M. R. (1992). The role of stereotyping in system-justification and the

- production of false consciousness. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, 33, 1-17.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8309.1994.tb01008.x>
- Kandinsky, W. (1914). *Concerning the spiritual in art*. Dover.
- Kambon, K. K. (1998). *African/Black psychology in the American context: An African-centered approach*. Nubian Publications.
- Karenga, M. (2002). *Introduction to Black studies* (3rd ed.). University of Sankore Press.
- Kaw, E. (1993). Medicalization of racial features: Asian American women and cosmetic surgery. *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, 7(1), 74-89.
- Kaye, A. M. (1999). The exclusion of Black soldiers from the Medal of Honor in World War II. *Journal of American Studies*, 33(1), 187-188.
- Kesner, L., & Horáček, J. (2017). Empathy-related responses to depicted people in art works. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 8, 1-16. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.00228>
- Kim, H., Lee, K., & Hong, Y. Y. (2012). Claiming the validity of negative ingroup stereotypes when foreseeing a challenge: A self-handicapping account. *Self Identity*, 11(3), 285-303.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/15298868.2011.561560>
- King, J. M. (2000). The long and winding road: Personal reflections of an anti-racism trainer. *American Journal of Orthopsychiatry*, 70(1), 73-81.
- Kleinasser, A. M. (2000). Researchers, reflexivity, and good data: Writing to unlearn. *Theory into practice*, 39(3), 155-162.
- Kunjufu, J. (1991). *Black economics: Solutions for economic and community empowerment*. African American Images.
- Larson, G. (2008). Anti-oppressive practice in mental health. *Journal of Progressive Human Services*, 19(1), 39-54.

- Latrofa, M., Vaes, J., Cadinu, M. & Carnaghi, A. (2012). Self-stereotyping: The central role of an ingroup threatening identity. *The Journal of Social Psychology*, 15(1), 92-111.
- Linesch, D. (2004). Art therapy at the Museum of Tolerance: Responses to the life and work of Friedl Dicker-Brandeis. *The Arts in Psychotherapy*, 31, 57-66.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aip.2004.02.004>
- Lipsky, S. (1977). Internalized oppression. *Black Re-Emergence*, 2, 5-10.
- Lipsky, S. (1987). *Internalized Racism*. Rational Island Publishers.
- Manhattan Arts (2020). *Art is the key to healing and personal growth*.
<https://manhattanarts.com/art-is-the-key-to-connect-to-a-higher-purpose/>
- Marshall, K. J. (1980). *A Portrait of the artist as a shadow of his former self* [Egg tempera on paper]. <https://collections.lacma.org/search/site/Kerry%2520James%2520Marshall>
- Marshall, K. J. (2000). *Supermodel* [Woodcut in color on woven paper].
<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Kerry%20James%20Marshall>
- Marshall, K. J. (2017). *Kerry James Marshall: A Black presence in the art world is “not negotiable”*. <https://www.npr.org/2017/03/28/521683667/kerry-james-marshall-a-Black-presence-in-the-art-world-is-not-negotiable>.
- Masko, A. L. (2005). “I think about it all the time”: A 12-year-old girl’s internal crisis with racism and the effects on her mental health. *The Urban Review*, 37(4), 329-350.
- McDowell, D.E. (1991). Racism in art. *The Virginia Quaterly Review*, 67(2), 360-366.
- McNeil, C., Capage, L. & Bennett, G. (2002). Cultural issues in the treatment of young African American children diagnosed with disruptive behavior disorders. *Journal of Pediatric Psychology*, 27(4), 339-350. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jpepsy/27.4.339>
- Miller, A. K. (2019). “Should have known better than to fraternize with a Black man”: Structural

- racism intersects rape culture to intensify attributions of acquaintance rape victim culpability. *Sex Role*, 81, 428-438. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11199-019-1003-3>
- Mills, A. J., Durepos, G. & Wiebe, E. (2012). *Encyclopedia of case study research: Reflexivity*. Sage Publications.
- Moane, G. (2003). Bridging the personal and the political: Practices for liberation psychology. *American journal of Community Psychology*, 31(1-2), 91-101. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1023026704576>
- Molina, K. M., & James, D. (2016). Discrimination, internalized racism and depression: A comparative study of African American and Afro-Caribbean adults in the US. *Group Process & Intergroup Relations*, 19(4), 439-461. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1368430216641304>
- Montero, M., & Sonn, C. C., (Eds.). (2009). Methods of liberation: Critical consciousness in action. *Psychology of liberation; Theory and application*. <http://ebookcentral.proquest.com>
- Montero, M. (2011). *The encyclopedia of peace psychology*. Blackwell Publishing.
- Moraga, C. (1983). *This bridge called my back: Writings by radical women of color* (pp. 27-34). In C. Moraga & G. Anzaldúa, Eds. Kitchen Table/Women of Color Press.
- Mosaka, T. (2015). *Kehinde Wiley: A new republic*. Brooklyn Museum.
- Mosher, J. K., Goldsmith, J. Z., Stiles, W. B., & Greenberg, L. S. (2008). Assimilation of two critical voices in a person-centered therapy for depression. *Person-Centered & Experiential Psychotherapies*, 7(1), 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14779757.2008.9688449>

- Moskowitz, G. B. & Carter, D. (2018). Confirmation bias and the stereotype of the Black athlete. *Psychology of Sport & Exercise*, 36, 139-146.
<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.psychsport.2018.02.010>
- Murphy, E., Kassem, L., Chemerinski, A., Rush, J., Laje, G. & McMahon, F. (2014). Retention and attrition among African Americans in the STAR D study: What causes research volunteers to stay or stray? *National Institute of Health*, 30, 11.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/da.22134>
- Museum of Contemporary Art Chicago (2016). *MCA Talk: Kerry James Marshall*. Retrieved from: <http://www.mcachicago.org/Publications/Video/2016/MCA-Talk-Kerry-James-Marshall>
- Mutisya, P. M., & Ross, L. E. (2005). Afrocentricity and racial socialization among African-American college students. *Journal of Black Studies*, 35, 235-247.
- Nadal, K. L., Griffin, K. E., Wong, Y., Hamit, S., & Rasmus, M. (2014). The impact of racial microaggressions on mental health: Counseling implications for clients of color. *Journal of Counseling & Development*, 92(1), 57-66. <https://doi.org/10.1002/j.1556-6676.2014.00130.x>
- National League of Cities (2020). *Racial equity and embracing healing through the arts*.
<https://www.nlc.org/article/2020/06/26/racial-equity-and-embracing-healing-through-the-arts/>
- Neal, L. (1968). The Black arts movement. *The Drama Review*, 12(4), 28-39.
- Ng, S., Wright, S. R., Kuper, A. (2019). The divergence and convergence of critical reflection and critical reflexivity: Implications for health professions education. *Academic Medicine*, 94(8), 1122-1128. <https://doi.org/10.1097/ACM.0000000000002724>

- New Tactics in Human Rights (2017). *Cultural resistance: The power of music and visual art as protest*. <https://www.newtactics.org/conversation/culture-resistance-power-music-end-visual-art-protest>.
- Oliver, W. (2001). Cultural racism and structural violence: Implications for African Americans. In L. See (Ed.), *Violence as seen through a prism of color* (pp. 1-26). The Haworth Press. https://doi.org/10.1300/J137v04n02_01
- Osajima, K. (1993). The hidden injuries of race. In C. Friday & L. A. Revilla (Eds.). *Bearing dreams, shaping visions: Asian Pacific American perspectives* (pp. 81-91). Washington State University Press.
- Padilla, L. (2001). "But you're not a dirty Mexican: Internalized oppression, Latinos and the law." *Texas Hispanic Journal of Law and Policy*, 7(1), 59-113.
- Palaganas, E.C., Sanchez, M.C., Molintas, V.P., & Caricativo, R.D. (2017). Reflexivity in qualitative research: A journal of learning. *The Qualitative Report*, 22(2), 426-438.
- Palmer, C. (2000). The African diaspora. *The Black Scholar*, 30(3-4), 56-59.
- Parham, T. A., Helms, J. E. (1985). Relation to racial identity attitudes to self-actualization and affective states of black students. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 32(3), 431-440. <https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-0167.32.3.431>
- Parmer, T., Smith Arnold, M., Natt, T., Janson, C., (2004). Physical attractiveness as a process of internalized oppression and multigenerational transmission in African American families. *The Family Journal*, 12(3), 230-242.
- Patnaik, E. (2013). Reflexivity: Situating the research in qualitative research. *Humanities and Social Science Studies*, 2(2), 98-106.
- Peacock, C., & Daniels, G. (2006). Applying an antiracist framework to residential treatment

- center: Sanctuary, a model for change. *Journal of Emotional Abuse*, 6(2-3), 135-154.
- Peacock, K. (2012). Museum education and art therapy: Exploring an innovative partnership. *Art Therapy*, 29(3), 133-137.
- Perkins, K. (1996). The influence of television images on Black females' self-perceptions of physical attractiveness. *Journal of Black Psychology*, 22(4), 453-469.
- Pinel, E. C. (1999). Stigma consciousness: The psychological legacy of social stereotypes. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 76(1), 114-128.
- Plaut, V. C. (2010). Diversity science: Why and how difference makes a difference. *Psychological Inquiry*, 21, 77-99.
- Prilleltensky, I., & Gonick, L. (1996). Politics change, oppression remains: On the psychology and politics of oppression. *Political Psychology*, 17(1), 127-148.
- Prilleltensky, I. (2003). Understanding, resisting, and overcoming oppression: Toward psychopolitical validity. *American Journal of Community Psychology*, 31(1&2), 195-201.
<https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1023043108210>
- Prilleltensky, I. (2008). The role of power in wellness, oppression and liberation: The promise of psychopolitical validity. *Journal of Community Psychology*, 36(2), 116-136.
- Pyke, K. D. (2010). What is internalized racial oppression and why don't we study it? Acknowledging racism's hidden injuries. *Sociological Perspectives*, 53(4), 551-572
- Pyke K. D., & D. Johnson (2003). Asian American women and racialized femininities: Doing gender across cultural worlds. *Gender & Society*, 17(1), 33-53.
- Raiford, L., & Raphael-Hernandez, H. (Eds.). (2017). *Migrating the Black body: The African diaspora and visual culture*. University of Washington Press.
www.jstor.org/stable/j.ctvcwnj4v

- Richmond, A. H. (2001). Refugees and racism in Canada. *Refuge*, 19(6), 12-20.
- Ritchie, S. (2013). The Harlem Renaissance: A cultural, social, and political movement. *New Erands*, 1(1), 49-53.
- Rivera, L. M., & Paradez, S. M. (2014). Stereotypes can “get under the skin”: Testing a self-stereotyping and psychological resource model of overweight and obesity. *Journal of Social Issues*, 70(2), 226-240.
- Roberts, S., Camic, P. M. & Springham, N. (2011). New roles for art galleries: Art-viewing as a community intervention for family caregivers of people with mental health problems.
- Rochford, F., (2017). Designing the environment – the paradox of eco-restoration. *Griffith Law Review*, 26(2), 202-220. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10383441.2017.1366256>
- Rogers, C. R. (1957). The necessary and sufficient conditions of therapeutic personality change. *Journal of Consulting Psychology*, 21, 95-103.
- Rothbaum, B.O. Foa, E.B., Hembree, E.A., & Rauch, S.A.M. (2019). *Reclaim your life from a traumatic experience: a prolonged exposure treatment program* (2nd ed., Vol.). Oxford University Press.
- Rowley, S.J., Sellers, R. M., Chavous, T.M., & Smith, M.A. (1998). The relationship between racial identity and self-esteem in African American college and high school students. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 74, 715-724
- Saloojee, A. (2003). *Social inclusion, anti-racism and democratic society*. The Laidlaw Foundation.
- Sarra, C. (2005). *Strong and smart: Reinforcing Aboriginal perceptions at being Aboriginal at Cherbourg state school*. [Unpublished doctoral dissertation], Murdoch University.
- Schachtel, E. (1959). *Metamorphosis*. Basic Books.

- Schiele, J. H. (2000). *Human services and the Afrocentric paradigm*. The Haworth Press.
- Schwalbe, M., Godwin, S. Holden, D., Schrock, D., Thompson, S., & Wolkomir, M. (2000). Generic processes in the reproduction of inequality: An interactionist analysis. *Social Forces*, 79(2), 419-452. <https://doi.org/10.2307/1556543>
- Schwing, A. E., Wong, Y. J., & Fann, M. D. (2013). Development and validation of the African American men's gendered racism stress inventory. *Psychology of Men and Masculinity*, 14(1), 16-24.
- Silverman, L. H. (2010). *The social work of museums*. Routledge.
- Smith, J. R., Wermeling, L. (2007). Counseling preferences of African American women. *Adultspan Journal*, 6(1), 4-14.
- Smithsonian American Art Museum (2019). *Between worlds: The art of Bill Traylor*. <https://americanart.si.edu/exhibitions/traylor>
- Sonn, C. C. & Quayle, A. F. (2014). Community cultural development for social change: Developing critical praxis. *Journal of Social Change: Developing Critical Praxis*, 6(1), 16-35. <https://doi.org/10.33043/JSACP.6.1.16-35>
- Sonn, C. C. (2009). Decolonization, ethics and challenges of researching across cultural boundaries. *International Community Psychology: Shared Agendas in Diversity*. Ed. UPR
- Speight, S. L. (2007). Internalized racism: One more piece to the puzzle. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 35(1), 126-134.
- Spraggins-Rochford, J. (2017). Art therapy at the John and Mable Ringling Museum of Art: A feminist systems thinking approach to art therapy and museum collaborations. *The Journal of Art for Life*, 9, 2.

- Staton, L. J. Panda, M., Chen, I., Geneo, I., Kurz, J., Pasanen, M., Mechebar, A. J., Menon, M., O'Rorke, J., Wood, J., Rosenberg, E., Faeslis, Carey, C., Calleson, T. & Cykert, S. (2007). When race matters: Disagreement in pain perception between patients and their physicians in primary care. *Journal of the National Medical Association*, 99(5), 532-538.
- Stephenson, K., Simpson, T., Martinez, M. & Kearney, D. (2017). Changes in mindfulness and posttraumatic stress disorder symptoms among veterans enrolled in mindfulness-based stress reduction. *Journal of Clinical Psychology*, 70(3), 201-217.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/jclp.22323>
- Stevenson, H. C. (1995). Relationship to adolescent perceptions of racial socialization to racial identity. *Journal of Black Psychology*, 21, 49-70.
- Strother, D. T. (2013). *From the bush to court, alright now, ya'll niggas say cheese!* [Mixed media on board]. <https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Devin%20Troy%20Strother>
- Sue, D. W., Capodilupo, C. M., Torino, G. C., Bucceri, J.M., Holder, A.M.B., Nadal, K.L., & Esquilin, M. (2007). Racial microaggressions in everyday life: Implications for clinical practice. *American Psychologist*, 62(4), 271-286.
- Sullivan, J. M., & Cross, W. E. (Eds.). (2016). *Meaning making, internalized racism, and African American identity*. State University of New York Press
- Tappan, M. B. (2006). Reframing internalized oppression and internalized domination: From the psychological to the sociocultural. *Teachers College Record*, 108(10), 2115-2144.
- Tate Gallery. (2018). *Kerry James Marshall: In conversation/ Tate Talks*.
<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4c4Z3U8WVLQ>
- Tate, K., Torres Rivera, E., Brown, E. & Skaistis, L., (2013). Foundation of liberation: Social

- justice, liberation psychology and counseling. *Interamerican Journal of Psychology*, 47(3), 373-382.
- Tew, J. (2002). Going social: Championing a holistic model of mental health distress within professional education. *Social Work Education*, 21(2), 143-155.
- Thomas, A. J., Witherspoon, K. M., & Speight, S. L. (2008). Gendered racism, psychological distress, and coping styles of African American women. *Cultural Diversity & Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 14(4), 307-314. <https://doi.org/10.1037/1099-9809.14.4.307>
- Turner, J. H., Singleton, R., & Musick, D. (1984). *Oppression: A socio-history of Black-White relations in America*. Nelson-Hall. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2209296>
- Utsey, S. O., Payne, Y. A., Jackson, E. S., & Jones, A. M. (2002). Race-related stress, quality of life indicators, and life satisfaction among elderly African Americans. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology*, 8(3), 224-233.
- Vandiver, B. J., Cross, W. E., Jr., Worrell, F. C., & Fhagen-Smith, P. E. (2002). Validating the cross racial identity scale. *Journal of Counseling Psychology*, 49(1), 71-85.
- Velez, B., Moradi, B., & DeBlaere, C. (2015). Multiple oppressions and the mental health of sexual minority Latina/o individuals. *The Counseling Psychologist*, 43(1), 7-38. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000014542836>
- Wadeson, H. (2010). *Art Psychotherapy* (2nd ed.). Wiley & Sons.
- Walker, K. (1998). *Camptown ladies* [Cut-paper silhouettes mounted on the wall]. <https://rubellmuseum.org/115-exhibitions/past-exhibitions/30-americans/567-30a-kara-walker>
- Washington, O. G. M., & Moxley, D. P. (2003). Group Interventions with low-income African American women recovering from chemical dependency. *Health & Social Work*, 28(2), 146-156.

- Watts, R. J., Diemer, M. A., & Voight, A. M. (2011). Critical consciousness: Current status and future directions. *New Directions for Child and Adolescent Development*, 134, 43-57.
- Watts-Jones, D. (2002). Healing internalized racism: The role of a within-group sanctuary among people of African descent. *Family Process*, 41(4), 591-601.
- Wecker, M. (2019). *Fine art is good medicine: How hospitals around the world are experimenting with the healing power of art*. <https://news.artnet.com/art-world/how-hospitals-heal-with-art-1606699>
- Wedding, D., & Corsini, R. J. (2013). *Current psychotherapies* (10th ed.). Brooks/Cole.
- Weixel-Dixon (2015). *Existential therapy*. Routledge Taylor & Francis Group.
- Weseley, M. (2019). *Art and race matters: the career of Robert Colescott*. Rizzoli International Publications.
- West, L, Donovan, R., Daniel, A. (2016). The price of strength: Black college women's perspectives on the strong Black woman stereotype. *Women & Therapy*, 39(3-4), 390-412. <https://doi.org/10.1080/02703149.2016.1116871>
- Wheeler, E. (1994). Doing Black mental health research: Observations and experiences. In H. Afshar & M. Maynard (Eds.), *The dynamics of "race" and gender: Some feminist interventions* (pp. 41-62). Taylor & Francis.
- Widewalls (2016). *What is contemporary art and how can we define it* <https://www.widewalls.ch/magazine/what-is-contemporary-art>.
- Wiley, K. (2005). *Napoleon leading the army over the alps* [Oil on canvas]. <https://www.brooklynmuseum.org/opencollection/search?keyword=Napoleon+Leading+the+Army+over+the+Alps>
- Williams, D. R., & Williams-Morris, R. (2000). Racism and mental health: the African American

experience. *Journal of Ethnicity and Health*, 5(3/4), 243-268.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/713667453>

Williams, D. R., Lawrence, J. A., & Davis, B. A. (2019). *Racism and health: evidence and needed Research*, 40, 105-125. <http://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-publhealth-040218-043750>

Williams, T. O. (2016). Internalization of dominance and subordination: Barriers to creative and intellectual fullness. *New Directions for Student Leadership*, 152, 87-94.
<https://doi.org/10.1002/yd.20211>

Willett, F. (2002). *African Art*. Thames & Hudson.

Wilson, A. N. (1998). *Blueprint for Black power: A moral, political and economic imperative for the twenty-first century*. Afrikan World Infosystems.

Wright, G. C. (1990). Harlem Renaissance: Art of Black America. *The Journal of American History*, 77(1), 253-261.

Young, I. M. (1990). *Justice and the politics of difference*. Princeton University Press.

Ysseldyk, R., Matheson, K., & Anisman, H. (2010). Religiosity as identity toward an understanding of religion from a social identity perspective. *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 14(1), 60-71. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1088868309349693>

Zabunyan, E. (2005). *Black is a Color: A history of African American Art*. Dis Voir.

APPENDIX A

Tables

Table A1*Black Artists who meet Inclusion Criteria*

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
Nina Chanel Abney	<p>Born 1982 in Harvey, IL</p> <p>Lives and works in New York</p> <p>Identifies as African American</p> <p>BFA in 2004, Augustana College, Rock Island, IL</p> <p>MFA in 2007, Parsons School of Design, NY, NY</p>	<p><i>Public Collections:</i></p> <p>Bronx Museum, NY</p> <p>Brooklyn Museum, NY Burger Collection, Hong Kong</p> <p>Dallas Museum of Art, Dallas, TX</p> <p>The Dean Collection LLC, New York, NY</p> <p>Nasher Museum of Art, Durham, NC</p> <p>National Museum of Women in the Arts, Washington, DC</p> <p>Pennsylvania Academy of the Fine Arts, Philadelphia, PA</p> <p>The Rubell Family Collection, Miami, FL</p> <p>Whitney Museum of American Art, New York, NY</p> <p>Represented by Jack Shainman Gallery, NY, NY</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Nina Chanel Abney broaches subjects as race, politics, sex, religion, and art history. She is interested in the visual representation of information overload where time and space are compressed and identity is interchangeable. She features power struggles, police brutality, confusion of identity and racial inequity by depicting African Americans in a way that emphasizes</p>	<p>Figures in Abney's paintings often demonstrate a merging between Black and White facial features and her use of Black and White masks further emphasize the idea of IR in that the figure is masking their true racial identity.</p> <p>Themes related to IR include power imbalance, feeling flawed, turning against one's own racial group, idealization of the majority group, subordination, limited self-expression, intra-racial class tension, health and mental health consequences and self hate.</p>	<p>Nina Chanel Abney's paintings range in emotional evocativeness depending on how explicitly she expresses themes around race, racism and IR.</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		<p>stereotypes and institutionalized racism. Abney is interested in visualizing everyday events and at times incorporates visual language from the internet. Abney's work is figurative and representational and uses pop art influences.</p>		
Robert Colescott	<p>Born in 1925, Oakland, CA</p> <p>Died of Parkinson's Disease in 2009 in Tucson, AZ</p> <p>Was drafted into the US Army in 1942 and served in Europe during World War II</p> <p>BFA in 1949, UC Berkley, CA</p> <p>1950: year in Paris at Atelier Fernand Léger</p> <p>MFA in 1952, UC Berkley, CA</p>	<p><i>Public Collections:</i></p> <p>Akron Art Museum, Akron, OH</p> <p>American Research Center in Egypt, Alexandria, VA</p> <p>Baltimore Museum of Art, Baltimore, MD</p> <p>Brooklyn Museum of Art, Brooklyn, NY</p> <p>California African American Museum, Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>Corcoran Gallery of Art, Washington, D.C.</p> <p>Dallas Museum of Art, Dallas, TX; Denver Museum of Art, Denver, CO</p> <p>Detroit Institute of Arts, Detroit, MI</p> <p>de Young Fine Arts Museums of San Francisco, CA</p> <p>Henry Art Gallery, Seattle, WA</p> <p>High Museum of Art, Atlanta GA</p> <p>Hirshhorn Museum & Sculpture Garden, Washington, D.C.</p> <p>Los Angeles County Museum of Art, Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, NY</p>	<p>As a young man Colescott wanted to belong to the White majority group due to discrimination and feelings of shame towards his Black heritage. He grew up in a household that highly valued achievement and assimilation and light skin and Caucasian features. Since he was darker skinned than his brother, it made him keenly aware of his racial difference. He was afraid of images displaying White people in Blackface, as they are symbolic of the denial of</p>	<p>Colescott's paintings often evoke powerful emotions related to race, gender and social inequality</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>1964: 1 year faculty Artist in Residence at the American Research Center in Cairo</p> <p>Lifelong Professor of painting at academic institutions including the Portland State University OR; UC Berkley, CA; University of Arizona, Tucson</p> <p>Identifies as heterosexual; was married 5 times and divorced 4 times</p> <p>Identifies as African American and is biracial (i.e., White and Black)</p>	<p>Museum of Contemporary Art, Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, MA</p> <p>Museum of Modern Art, New York, NY</p> <p>National Gallery of Art, Washington D.C.</p> <p>New Museum, New York, NY</p> <p>Oakland Museum of California, Oakland, CA</p> <p>Pinault Collection, Paris, France</p> <p>Rubell Family Collection, Miami, FL</p> <p>San Francisco Museum of Modern Art, San Francisco, CA</p> <p>Seattle Art Museum, Seattle, WA</p> <p>Tucson Museum of Art, Tucson, AZ</p> <p>Wadsworth Atheneum Museum of Art, Hartford, CT</p> <p>Walker Art Center, Minneapolis, MN</p> <p>Whitney Museum of American Art, New York, NY; among many more.</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Colescott tackled subjects of social and racial inequality, class structure and the human condition. He was interested in representing the Black experience. He received international recognition for his satirical re-envisioning of American history in paintings like “George Washington</p>	<p>personhood to Black people. Colecott resurrected them in his paintings, which offered a visual language with which he was able to deal with his own internalized racism. As a biracial being, he visualized the conflicted sense of his own racial identity.</p> <p>Themes related to IR include shame, fear, self-hate, feeling flawed, inferiority, Colorism, Eurocentrism, idealization, negative racial identity, stereotypes, and health and mental health consequences of racism and IR</p>	

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		<p>Carver Crossing the Delaware” (1975). In later work, Colescott fused his personal issues around race and gender identification with a political life around him.</p>		
Kerry James Marshall	<p>Born 1955 in Birmingham, Alabama</p> <p>Lives and works in Chicago</p> <p>Identifies as</p>	<p><i>Public Collections:</i></p> <p>Addison Gallery of American Art, Phillips Academy, Andover, Massachusetts</p> <p>Arkansas Arts Center, Little Rock</p> <p>Art Institute of Chicago</p> <p>Arthur M. Sackler Museum,</p>	Kerry James Marshall addresses themes of IR through visualizing notions of invisibility and by bringing up the construct of	His paintings are at times highly emotionally evocative as noted by art critics who stated that they are

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>African American</p> <p>BFA in 1978, Otis Art Institute, LA</p> <p>Honorary Doctorate in 1999, Otis Art Institute, LA</p> <p>National Endowments for the Arts, 1991</p> <p>Grant from MacArthur Foundation, 1997</p> <p>One of the 7 new appointees names to President Barack Obama's Committee in the Arts of Humanities</p> <p>Wolfgang Hahn Prize in 2014, Gesellschaft für Moderne Kunst at Museum Ludwig at Cologne</p>	<p>Harvard Art Museums, Cambridge, Massachusetts</p> <p>The Baltimore Museum of Art, Maryland</p> <p>Berkeley Art Museum and Pacific Film Archive, University of California, Berkeley</p> <p>Birmingham Museum of Art, Alabama</p> <p>The Broad, Los Angeles</p> <p>Brooklyn Museum, New York</p> <p>Columbus Museum of Art, Ohio</p> <p>Corcoran Gallery of Art, Washington, DC</p> <p>Crystal Bridges Museum of American Art, Bentonville, Arkansas</p> <p>Denver Art Museum, Colorado</p> <p>Des Moines Art Center, Iowa</p> <p>25 Herbert F. Johnson Museum of Art, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York</p> <p>High Museum of Art, Atlanta, Georgia</p> <p>Honolulu Museum of Art, Hawaii</p> <p>Institute of Contemporary Art, Boston</p> <p>Laguna Art Museum, Laguna Beach, California</p> <p>List Visual Arts Center, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Cambridge, Massachusetts</p> <p>Los Angeles County Museum of Art</p>	<p>self-esteem in several of his paintings. This is achieved formally (e.g., by painting a Black figure on a Black ground) and through content (e.g., a Black female wearing a blond wig).</p> <p>Themes of IR include stereotyping, self-stereotyping, Colorism, feeling flawed, inferiority, anger, shame, self-doubt, and Eurocentrism.</p>	<p>filled with love, but also with grief, anger, death, and a sense of loss. He growing up in Watts during the LA riots has impacted his view on the world around him, which has added to his belief in a non-negotiable, undeniable presence in the narrative created in his work (NPR, 2017).</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>Rosenberg Medal in 2016, University of Chicago</p> <p>W.E.B. Du Bois medal in 2019, Harvard University (highest honor in the field of African American studies)</p>	<p>Mary & Leigh Block Museum of Art, Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois</p> <p>The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</p> <p>Milwaukee Art Museum, Wisconsin</p> <p>Mobile Museum of Art, Mobile, Alabama</p> <p>Museum of Contemporary Art Chicago</p> <p>Museum of Fine Arts, Boston</p> <p>The Museum of Modern Art, New York</p> <p>Nasher Museum of Art at Duke University, Durham, North Carolina</p> <p>National Gallery of Art, Washington, DC</p> <p>The Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Kansas City, Missouri</p> <p>Nerman Museum of Contemporary Art, Johnson County Community College, Overland Park, Kansas</p> <p>North Carolina Central University Art Museum, Durham, North Carolina</p> <p>Orlando Museum of Art, Florida</p> <p>The Progressive Art Collection, Ohio</p> <p>Rennie Collection at Wing Sang, Vancouver</p> <p>Rockford Art Museum, Illinois</p> <p>Rubell Family Collection, Miami</p> <p>Saint Louis Art Museum, Missouri</p> <p>San Francisco Museum of Modern</p>		

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		<p>Art</p> <p>Santa Monica Arts Commission Art Bank, California</p> <p>Seattle Art Museum</p> <p>Sheldon Museum of Art, University of Nebraska, Lincoln</p> <p>Smart Museum of Art, The University of Chicago</p> <p>Smithsonian American Art Museum, Washington, DC</p> <p>The Studio Museum in Harlem, New York</p> <p>The University of Arizona Museum of Art, Tucson</p> <p>Wadsworth Atheneum Museum of Art, Hartford, Connecticut</p> <p>Walker Art Center, Minneapolis, Minnesota</p> <p>Whitney Museum of American Art, New York</p> <p>William Benton Museum of Art, University of Connecticut, Storrs</p> <p>Williams College Museum of Art, Williamstown, Massachusetts</p> <p>Yale University Art Gallery, New Haven, Connecticut</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Kerry James Marshall's work reveals and questions the social constructs of beauty and power. He critically evaluates the phenomenon of invisibility ascribed to Black bodies and by placing the Black figure in the center of the painting he lends power to</p>		

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		that figure. He is also interested in investigating the implications of skin tone in his paintings.		
Devin Troy Strother	<p>Born 1986 in West Covina, CA</p> <p>Lives and works in Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>BFA in 2009, Art Center College of Design, Pasadena, CA</p> <p>Residency in 2010 at Skohegan School of Painting and Sculpture, Skowhegan, ME</p>	<p><i>Public Collections:</i></p> <p>Los Angeles County Museum of Art, Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>The Santa Barbara Museum of Art, Santa Barbara, CA</p> <p>The Studio Museum, Harlem, NY</p> <p>Torrance Art Museum, Torrance, CA</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i></p> <p>Strother's work tackles racial issues, including stereotypes and intra racial class tensions. He infuses humor into his work while simultaneously addressing highly charged topics like racism and internalized racism.</p>	<p>Themes around IR are visually expressed but are also reflected in many of his titles. For instance, one of his paintings is titled "Aye guuurl you know you got a White guuuuurl on yo back tho", said Sheriece to Lattiece."Yea guuuuurl I know I know she just chillen tho", said Lattiece to Sheriece". This artwork depicts a Black female dressed in a bikini carrying a White female also dressed in a bikini on her back, while smiling, indicating that the Black woman agrees with her subordinate position. Devin Troy Strother addresses themes of IR through emphasizing</p>	<p>Strother's paintings vacillate between humor and anger, which at times evoke a lot of emotionality in the viewer.</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
			<p>negative in-group biases, which create intra-group tension African American figures and figures that are depicted as African tribes people.</p> <p>Themes of IR include self-hate, feeling flawed, low self-esteem, Eurocentrism, envy, idealization, subordination, intra-racial class tension and anger/violence.</p>	
Kara Walker	<p>Born 1969 in Stockton, CA</p> <p>Raised in Atlanta, GA from age 13 onward</p> <p>BFA 1991, Atlanta College of Art, GA</p> <p>MFA 1994, Rhode Island School of Design, NY</p> <p>Lives and works in New York</p>	<p><i>Public Collections:</i></p> <p>Addison Gallery of American Art, MA</p> <p>Art Institute of Chicago. Chicago, Illinois. USA</p> <p>Baltimore Museum of Art, Baltimore, Maryland</p> <p>Broad Art Foundation, Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>Brooklyn Museum of Art, NYC</p> <p>Carnegie Museum of Art, Waterville, Maine</p> <p>Centro Nazionale per le arti contemporanee, Rome, Italy</p> <p>Cincinnati Museum of Art, OH</p> <p>Colby College Museum of Art,</p>	<p>Themes of IR can be found in many of Kara Walker's artworks. She frequently explores notions of power differentials and depicts the Black figure at times in dehumanizing ways, which brings up questions in the viewer as to whether those Black figures are representative of IR in that they desire to cut off</p>	<p>Walker confronts the viewer in a way that forces them to come in contact with luring effigies and ghosts from the past who are engaged in a fictitious and, unsentimental master-slave dialectic, which can be highly emotional</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>Currently teaches at Columbia University</p> <p>1997: John D. and Catharine T. MacArthur Foundation Achievement Award</p> <p>2008: United States Artists, Eileen Harris Norton Fellowship</p> <p>2012: member of the American Academy of Arts and Letters</p> <p>2015: named the Tepper Chair in Visual Arts at the Mason Gross School of the Arts at Rutgers University</p>	<p>Waterville, Maine</p> <p>Corcoran Gallery of Art, Washington, DC</p> <p>Des Moines Art Center, Des Moines, Iowa</p> <p>Deste Foundation Centre for Contemporary Art, Athens, Greece</p> <p>Deutsche Bank, Frankfurt, Germany</p> <p>Fonds Régional d'Art Contemporain des Pays de la Loire (FRAC), France</p> <p>Foundation Musée d'Art Moderne Grand-Duc Jean, Luxembourg</p> <p>Harvard Art Museum, Fogg, MA</p> <p>Indianapolis Museum of Art, Indianapolis, Indiana</p> <p>Los Angeles County Museum of Art, Los Angeles, California</p> <p>Metropolitan Museum of Art, NYC</p> <p>Middlebury Museum of Art, VT</p> <p>Milwaukee Art Museum, Milwaukee, Wisconsin</p> <p>MoMA, The Museum of Modern Art, New York, New York</p> <p>Montclair Art Museum, NJ</p> <p>Mount Holyoke College Art Museum, MA</p> <p>Musée d'Art Moderne, Luxembourg</p> <p>Museo Nazionale delle Arti del XXI Secolo (MAXXI), Rome, Italy</p> <p>Museum of Contemporary Art (Chicago), Chicago, Illinois</p> <p>Museum of Fine Arts, Houston, TX</p>	<p>their racial heritage due to extreme racism.</p> <p>Themes of IR include low self-esteem, dehumanization, subordination, limited self-expression, health and mental health consequences of racism and IR, anxiety, shame, exploitation and violence.</p>	<p>evocative. Exposure of dehumanizing aspects of oppression and the fact that the figures are often life sized confronts the viewer and asks them to identify with the oppressor or the oppressed.</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		<p>Museum of Fine Arts – Boston, Boston, Massachusetts</p> <p>Museum voor Moderne Kunst, The Netherlands</p> <p>Museum of Modern Art, NYC</p> <p>Nasher Museum of Art at Duke University, NC</p> <p>Princeton University Art Museum, NJ</p> <p>San Francisco Museum Of Modern Art, San Francisco, California</p> <p>Smith College Museum of Art, MA</p> <p>Smithsonian, Washington, DC</p> <p>Solomon R. Guggenheim Museum, NY</p> <p>St Louis Museum of Art, MO</p> <p>Studio Museum In Harlem. New York, New York</p> <p>Tate Gallery, London</p> <p>The Contemporary Museum At First Hawaiian Center, Honolulu, Hawaii</p> <p>The Judith Rothschild Foundation</p> <p>The Renaissance Society, Chicago, Illinois</p> <p>21c Museum Hotel, KY</p> <p>Walker Art Center, Minneapolis, MN</p> <p>Whitney Museum of American Art, NYC</p> <p>Williams College Museum of Art, Williamstown, Massachusetts</p> <p>Yale University Art Gallery, CT</p>		

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		<p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Walker is known for her silhouetted life sized figures. She addresses racial myths, slavery, gender politics, oppression/domination, and questions of personal versus historical autobiography. She appropriates the 18th and 19th century figural format of the cut-paper silhouette while visualizing Black racist stereotypes within Southern racial history and the history of Black representation upon contemporary America</p>		
Kehinde Wiley	<p>Born 1977 in Los Angeles, CA</p> <p>Lives and works in New York, NY</p> <p>Identifies as homosexual</p> <p>BFA, San Francisco Art Institute, CA</p> <p>MFA, Yale University, New Haven</p> <p>2002: Rema Hort Mann Foundation Grant Recipient</p>	<p><i>Public Collections:</i></p> <p>The Brooklyn Museum of Art, Brooklyn, New York</p> <p>Columbus Museum of Art, Columbus, Ohio</p> <p>Denver Art Museum, Denver, Colorado</p> <p>Detroit Institute of Arts, Detroit, Michigan</p> <p>The Flag Art Foundation, New York</p> <p>The Hammer Museum, Los Angeles, California</p> <p>Harn Museum of Art, Gainesville, Florida</p> <p>High Museum of Art, Atlanta, Georgia</p> <p>The Jewish Museum, New York</p> <p>Herbert F. Johnson Museum of Art, Ithaca, New York</p> <p>Kansas City Art Museum, Kansas</p>	<p>Kehinde Wiley injects his paintings with symbolic examples of power and privilege that is derived from a Eurocentric history of oil painting and thus emphasizes a longing to have what the majority, powerful group has.</p> <p>Themes of IR include resistance, liberation, power, Eurocentrism, idealization of the majority</p>	<p>Some paintings are highly emotional evocative as they are symbolic reminders of the ongoing racial inequality in different parts of the world. A number of paintings emphasize passivity and vulnerability by painting figures in a horizontal position, reminiscent of the figure's</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
	<p>2008: Americans for the Arts, Young Artists Awards for Artistic Excellence</p> <p>2010: USA Network, Character Approved Award</p> <p>2011: Canteen Magazine, Artist of the Year Award; New York City Art Teachers Association/ United Federation of Teachers, Artist of the year Award</p> <p>2012: Pratt Legend Award</p>	<p>City, Missouri</p> <p>Los Angeles County Museum of Art, Los Angeles, California</p> <p>Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York</p> <p>Miami Art Museum, Miami, Florida</p> <p>Milwaukee Art Museum, Milwaukee, Wisconsin</p> <p>Minneapolis Institute of Art, Minneapolis, Minnesota</p> <p>Mint Museum of Art, Charlotte, North Carolina</p> <p>Modern Art Museum of Fort Worth, Fort Worth, Texas</p> <p>Museum of Contemporary Art, Los Angeles, California</p> <p>Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, Massachusetts</p> <p>Nasher Museum of Art, Chapel Hill, North Carolina</p> <p>Nerman Museum of Contemporary Art, Overland Park, Kansas</p> <p>Oak Park Library, Chicago, Illinois</p> <p>Pennsylvania Academy of the Fine Arts, Pennsylvania</p> <p>Phoenix Art Museum, Phoenix, Arizona</p> <p>The Rubell Family Collection, Miami, Florida</p> <p>San Antonio Museum of Art, San Antonio, Texas</p> <p>Seattle Museum of Art, Seattle, Washington</p> <p>The Sender Collection, New York</p>	<p>group, and awareness of racist acts</p>	<p>mortality or woundedness, which likely evokes strong emotions in the viewer.</p>

Artist	Background	Overview of Artwork and Exhibition	IR Themes	Emotional Evocativeness
		<p>The Studio Museum of Harlem, New York</p> <p>Toledo Museum of Art, Toledo, Ohio</p> <p>21C Museum, Louisville, Kentucky</p> <p>Virginia Museum of Fine Arts, Richmond, Virginia</p> <p>Walker Art Center, Minneapolis, Minnesota</p> <p>The Zabłudowicz Collection, London, England</p> <p><i>Overview of Art:</i> Kehinde Wiley is known for his hyper realistic portraits of African American men in heroic poses. He references classical paintings as well as pop culture within his paintings. He also draws inspiration from Venetian painters, French Rococo painting, Islamic architecture, African textile design, contemporary fashion and urban hip-hop.</p>		

Table A2

Master List of identified Themes related to IR and applied to selected artworks of 6 selected

Black Artists.

1.)	Power and empowerment; Resistance, Asserting Rights, Standing up for rights/self, racial pride
2.)	Liberation, Freedom,
3.)	Invisibility, low self-worth, insignificance
4.)	Anger, Rage
5.)	Sadness / Despair / Hopelessness and Helplessness
6.)	Shame, humiliation
7.)	Anxiety/ Fear
8.)	Self-hate / Feeling flawed / Not fully human /Inferiority / Low self-esteem / Self- doubt; Self-devaluation; Self-stereotyping;
9.)	Idealization (e.g., of the majority group); colorism; Eurocentric (e.g., reflected in hair texture, skin color, body size, facial features) Envy; Negative racial identity; Turning against (e.g., “our own people)
10.	Stereotypes; Caricature; Cartoonish; Limited portrayal; Exaggeration of features;
11.)	Portrayal of racism; Observation or awareness of racist acts, stigmatization; Discrimination; Dehumanization; restrictions (e.g., to one’s humanity); Subordination; Perpetrator / Victim; Hierarchy (Inferiority-Superiority)
12.)	Limited self-expression; Emotional distancing; Numbing; Shutting off/down; Withdrawal; Isolation
13.)	Intragroup dynamics; Intra-racial class tension / Intra-racial conflict
14.)	Health and mental health consequences of racism and IR (e.g., physical illness)
15.)	Positive change, positive reconnection to racial group, racial pride (as part of healing IR)
16.)	Violence
17.)	Objectification; Exploitation
18.)	Nurturance, positive relationship, love, relational connection

Table A3*Artworks Rated but not Selected for the Study*

Artist Name	Title of the Artwork
Kehinde Wiley	Dead Christ in the Tomb
Kehinde Wiley	Judith and Holofernes
Kehinde Wiley	Mary, Comforter of the Afflicted II
Kehinde Wiley	Naomi and her Daughters
Kara Walker	The end of Uncle Tom and the Grand Allegorical Tableau of Eva in Heaven (detail of girl swinging an axe)
Kara Walker	Untitled (woman with birds exiting her chest)
Kara Walker	The end of Uncle Tom and the Grand Allegorical Tableau of Eva in Heaven (detail of 4 women engaging in mutual breast feeding)
Kara Walker	Vanishing Act
Kerry James Marshall	Portrait of Nat Turner with the Head of his Master
Kerry James Marshall	Untitled (Pin up)”
Nina Chanel Abney	Class of 2007
Nina Chanel Abney	Fast draw
Robert Colescott	Colored TV
Robert Colescott	Eat dem Taters
Devin Troy Strother	“Aye guuurl you know you got a White guuuuurl on yo back tho”, said Sheriece to Lattiece.”Yea guuuuurl I know I know she just chillen tho”, said Lattiece to Sheriece
Devin Troy Strother	That National Geographic shit: Creeping on the com up

Table A4*Overview of Selected Artworks*

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
#1 - "From the Bush to the Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!"	Devin Troy Strother	Rater 1: 5 Rater 2: 4 Mean = 4.5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 9, 10, 11 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13	<i>Congruence:</i> Themes of Eurocentric values, idealization, negative racial identity and discrimination found within the painting. Rater 1 stated that the painting emphasized how the White female figures in the painting may stand for a compromise on the Black figure's part as they are navigating a racist system and want to be accepted by White people. A discussion about IR and how it manifests differently in different people eventually led to congruence on theme 9 as it pertains to wanting to be accepted by White

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>people. Both raters agreed that negative stereotyping could be seen within the cartoonish painting style of Black figures. Both raters gave a medium level score on emotional intensity as they agreed that the artwork did not evoke high emotions in the viewer.</p> <p><i>Differences:</i> Rater 2 additionally endorsed themes 8, 12, and 13 as this rater argued that the basketball players are “not fully human” and therefore have limited self-expression. Theme 13 was endorsed based on intragroup dynamics as seen between the basketball players and the Black audience.</p>
#2 - “Supermodel”	Kerry James	Rater 1: 4	<i>Rater 1:</i>	<i>Congruence:</i> Both

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
	Marshall	Rater 2: 5 Mean = 4.5	themes 5, 6, 9 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 6, 8, 9	<p>raters agreed that the painting visually touched upon notions of shame as well as Eurocentric values. The raters also agreed on the fact that although these themes strongly overlap with IR, the overall emotional evocativeness is low as the painting is very subtle and not very expressive.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 endorsed the theme of sadness, which was later on accepted by rater one as the figure's size in relation to the frame was very small, rendering it lost on the canvas. For those reasons, rater 2 endorsed theme 8 as low self-esteem was</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				expressed through the figure being almost nude and lacking any form of expression.
#3 - "Napoleon leading the Army over the Alps"	Kehinde Wiley	Rater 1: 3 Rater 2: 7 Mean = 5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 1, 2 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 1, 2, 9, 11	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed on themes related to liberation and resistance as the main Black subject of the painting appeared heroic and ready to go to battle, and thus taking action in the face of oppression. <i>Difference:</i> Initially rater one did not endorse theme 9, but through discussions around the expression of power through a Eurocentric lens, the raters found congruence. Rater two also saw themes related to discrimination in the painting as the motive

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>of sperm in the background of the painting was interpreted as a reference to the Black man's hyper sexuality", which is a negative stereotype. There was a significant discrepancy in emotional ratings between raters. Rater one did not experience the painting as emotionally evocative, while rater two did.</p>
#4 - "Grandma and the Frenchmen – Identity Crisis"	Robert Colescott	Rater 1: 8 Rater 2: 3 Mean = 5.5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 4, 5, 9, 11, 14 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 14	<p><i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed upon themes 5, 9 and 14 as they both identified a sense of hopelessness, idealization of White people and how these constructs can impact one's health.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> rater one identified two</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>additional themes (i.e., 4 and 11) as this rater found that anger and dehumanizing aspects had been visualized. Rater two argued that themes 6, 7, and 8 were also present as shame, anxiety/fear and a sense of self-hate were depicted. No congruence was initially found on emotional evocativeness, but rater one brought forth compelling arguments as to why this painting is emotionally evocative based on the many ways in which it describes IR and racism. Rater 2 was in agreement after this discussion.</p>
#5 - "Ivy and the Janitor in January"	Nina Chanel Abney	Rater 1: 6-7 Rater 2: 5 Mean = 5.75	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 5, 6, 8, 9,	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters found that themes related to

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
			11, 13 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 6, 7, 8, 9	shame, self-doubt and negative racial identification was present in the painting. There also seems to be congruence in the way they categorized its emotional evocativeness. <i>Difference:</i> the raters had divergent opinions on themes related to sadness and anxiety as expressed in the painting, but a discussion in how this was depicted in the artwork led to an agreement that both themes were present.
#6 - "A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self"	Kerry James Marshall	Rater 1: 4 Rater 2: 10 Mean = 7	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 8, 10, 11 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters agreed that this artwork touched upon a notion of stereotyping and self-devaluation and that it showed dehumanizing aspects related to race.

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
				<p>Rater 2 additionally found that the work also spoke about Colorism as the skin-color was exaggerated, which reduced the figure to the color Black. This rater also saw themes related to shame and limited self-expression within the way the Black figure was painted.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 endorsed a low number on emotional evocativeness, while rater 2 gave it the highest score. Rater two explained that this high score was due to the way the artist showed a reductionist portrayal of Black people, devoid of identity, which was highly emotional to this rater.</p>

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
#7 - “Randaleeza”	Nina Chanel Abney	Rater 1: 9 Rater 2: 7 Mean = 8	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 4, 7, 8, 11, 13 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14	<i>Congruence:</i> Both raters indicated that figures in this painting were depicted in ways that robbed them of their humanity and that themes of fear/anxiety were visually expressed. They also agreed that dehumanization and intra racial class tensions played a role. Both raters endorsed high scores on emotional evocativeness due to these issues raised in the painting. <i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 endorsed an additional theme of anger, while rater one identified a sense of hopelessness and helplessness in the work.
#8 - “Camptown Ladies” (detail)	Kara Walker	Rater 1: 7 Rater 2: 10	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 7,	<i>Congruence:</i> both raters were in

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
		Mean = 8.5	8, 11, 17 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 7, 8, 11, 12, 17	agreement that anxiety/fear as well as being treated as “subhuman” and dehumanization played a major role in this artwork. They also found that the oppressed figure in the artwork was objectified. Both raters endorsed high scores for emotional evocativeness due to the impactful racist messages within the work. <i>Difference:</i> rater 2 also found that theme 12 applied due to the oppressed figure’s limited capacity to self-express.
#9 - “Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original”	Robert Colescott	Rater 1: 7 Rater 2: 10 Mean = 8.5	<i>Rater 1:</i> themes 5, 8, 11, 18 <i>Rater 2:</i> themes 5,	<i>Congruence:</i> both raters identified themes of hopelessness and helplessness, as well

ID# and Name of Painting/Artwork	Artist	Intensity Ratings	Identified Themes	Consensus Process Notes
			6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 17	<p>as a sense of inferiority and dehumanization. They both rated the painting high on emotional evocativeness due to the fact that the central Black figure was nursing a large and older child of a White woman, while neglecting her own infants.</p> <p><i>Difference:</i> Rater 1 additionally endorsed a theme that reflected nurturance and relational connection, while rater 2 found that the painting also depicted a sense of shame, humiliation, fear, emotional distancing, and exploitation.</p>

Table A5*4-Stage Approach to Critical Analysis of Artworks*

Stage 1: Characteristics and Description	Stage 2: Internalized Racism Themes	Stage 3: Integrative Analysis	Stage 4: Implications for Healing and Interventions
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identify primary and initial characteristics of the painting that evoke a strong impression - Identify emotional reaction - Identify racially themed content and how it affects the viewer when first confronted with the painting. 	Using the Master Theme List, identify and describe internalized racism themes in relationship to the painting	Construct an analysis of the painting informed by the painting's characteristics, what they evoke emotionally, and the associated IR themes	Describe implications for use in psychological intervention; potential healing processes that could emerge from using the painting in therapeutic or community interventions.

Table A6*Summary of Final Themes in Analysis of Artworks*

Theme	Frequency	Artworks
Anxiety/fear	6	4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9
Shame	6	2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 9
Eurocentrism	5	1, 2, 3, 4, 7
Felling flawed	5	1, 4, 5, 7, 8
Inferiority	5	1, 2, 4, 5, 9
Self-devaluation	5	1, 2, 4, 5, 9
Dehumanization	4	1, 6, 7, 9
Exploitation	4	1, 4, 8, 9
Helplessness	4	4, 5, 7, 9
Hopelessness	4	4, 5, 7, 9
Limited self-expression	4	1, 2, 7, 9
Negative racial identity	4	1, 4, 5, 7
Not fully human	4	5, 7, 8, 9
Self-hate	4	1, 4, 5, 9
Discrimination	3	4, 6, 7
Health and mental health consequences of racism and IR	3	4, 8, 9

Theme	Frequency	Artworks
Hierarchy	3	1, 4, 5
Idealization of White people	3	1, 2, 4
Low self-esteem	3	1, 2, 4
Observation of racist acts	3	1, 7, 9
Sadness/Despair	3	4, 7, 9
Stereotypes	3	1, 6, 8
Subordination	3	1, 5, 9
Colorism	2	5, 6
Intra-group dynamic	2	1, 7
Intra-racial class tension	2	1, 7
Perpetrator-victim	2	4, 7
Self-doubt	2	4, 5
Turning against own people	2	1, 7
Violence	2	4, 7
Caricature	1	1
Cartoonish	1	1
Direct racism	1	3
Exaggeration of	1	1

Theme	Frequency	Artworks
features		
Freedom/liberation	1	3
Invisibility	1	6
Isolation	1	2
Objectification	1	1
Limited portrayal	1	1
Portrayal of racism	1	1
Power and empowerment	1	3
Restrictions to one's humanity	1	9
Self-stereotyping	1	6
Withdrawal	1	2

APPENDIX B

Figures

Figure B1

From the Bush to Court, alright now, ya'll Niggas say Cheese!



Note. From “From the bush to court, alright now, ya’ll niggas say cheese!”, by D. T. Strother, 2013 (<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Devin%20Troy%20Strother>). Copyright 2013 by Devin Troy Strother. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B2*Supermodel*

Note. From “Supermodel”, by K. J. Marshall, 2000

(<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Kerry%20James%20Marshall>).

Copyright 2000 by Kerry James Marshall. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B3

Napoleon leading the Army over the Alps



Note. From “Napoleon Leading the Army over the Alps”, by K. Wiley, 2005

([https://www.brooklynmuseum.org/opencollection/search?keyword=Napoleon+Leading+the+Ar
my+over+the+Alps](https://www.brooklynmuseum.org/opencollection/search?keyword=Napoleon+Leading+the+Army+over+the+Alps)). Copyright 2005 by Kehinde Wiley. Reprinted with Permission.

Figure B4

Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis



Note. From “Grandma and the Frenchman – Identity Crisis”, by R. Colescott, 1990
(<https://www.artsy.net/artist/robert-colescott/works-for-sale>). Copyright 1990 by Robert Colescott. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B5*Ivy and the Janitor in January*

Note. From “Ivy and the Janitor in January”, by N. C. Abney, 2009

(<https://www.artsy.net/search?page=2&term=Nina%20Chanel%20Abney>). Copyright 2009 by

Nina Chanel Abney. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B6*A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self*

Note. From “A Portrait of the Artist as a Shadow of his Former Self”, by K. J. Marshall, 1980 (<https://collections.lacma.org/search/site/Kerry%2520James%2520Marshall>). Copyright 1980 by Kerry James Marshall. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B7

Randaleeza



From “Randaleeza”, by N. C. Abney, 2008

(<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Nina%20Chanel%20Abney>). Copyright 2008 by Nina Chanel Abney. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B8

Camptown Ladies (detail)



Note. From “Camptown Ladies (detail)”, by K. Walker, 1998 (<https://rubellmuseum.org/115-exhibitions/past-exhibitions/30-americans/567-30a-kara-walker>). Copyright 1998 by Kara Walker. Reprinted with permission.

Figure B9

Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original



Note. From “Knowledge of the Past is the key to the Future: The Original”, by R. Colescott, 1984 (<https://www.artsy.net/search?term=Robert%20Colescott>). Copyright 1984 by Robert Colescott. Reprinted with permission.

APPENDIX C

IRB Documentation

**PEPPERDINE IRB NON-HUMAN SUBJECTS NOTIFICATION FORM FOR
RESEARCH THAT DOES NOT INVOLVE HUMAN SUBJECTS**

Investigator Name: Mirjam Hatton

Status (Check One): ☐ Faculty ☒ Graduate Student ☐ Undergraduate Student

Faculty Chair (if applicable): Shelly P. Harrell, Ph.D.

Proposal Research Title: **An Analysis of Internalized Racism in Art created by Black Artists; Implications for Psychological Intervention**

Per Pepperdine University Institutional Review Board (IRB) guidelines all proposed research that does not involve direct contact with human subjects requires this notification form (with signatures) and an abstract or draft of the research project to be submitted for review.

Research that requires IRB review must meet the definition of human subject's research. The code of federal regulations provides the following definitions:

- **For the purposes of the IRB, research is defined as a systematic investigation designed to develop or contribute to generalizable knowledge.**
- **Human subject means a living individual about whom an investigator (whether professional or graduate student) conducting research obtains**


- (1) Data through intervention or interaction with the individual, or**
- (2) Identifiable private information.**

If your research does not involve the participation of human subjects **and** you are not using/collecting any data that has been obtained from individual participants, your research is not subject to IRB review and approval but does require the submission and filing of this non-human subjects notification form in the IRB office.

Please submit 1) this completed notification form along with 2) either a one page abstract (outlining the study's research design and methodology) or a draft of your research project (does not need to be finalized) by email to andrea.quintero@pepperdine.edu and copy gpsirb@pepperdine.edu.

We may reach out with clarification questions as needed; otherwise, the IRB office will issue a confirmation of non-human subjects verification back to your email within a few days.

I verify that this proposed research does not involve the use of human subjects, either directly or indirectly.


Principal Investigator(s)/Student Signature

06/05/2019

Date


Faculty Chairperson Signature

06/05/2019

Date